

Race Equality Advisory Forum Report

Making it Real A Race Equality Strategy for Scotland

Contents

| | | |
|----------|--|-----------|
| 1 | Foreword by Jackie Baillie | 1 |
| 2 | Foreword by the Forum | 2 |
| 3 | Introduction | 3 |
| 3.1 | Remit | 3 |
| 3.2 | Composition | 3 |
| 3.3 | How the Forum Worked | 4 |
| 3.4 | Achievements | 4 |
| 3.5 | The Language of the Report | 4 |
| 4 | The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 | 5 |
| 4.1 | New positive duty to promote race equality | 5 |
| 4.2 | Specific duties | 6 |
| 5 | Fundamentals for a Fairer Future | 7 |
| 6 | Areas for Action | 8 |
| 6.1 | Mainstreaming Race Equality into Planning, Policy Design, Service Delivery | 8 |
| 6.2 | Race Equality Training | 8 |
| 6.3 | Public Appointments | 9 |
| 6.4 | Employment in the Public sector | 9 |
| 6.5 | Improved Research, Information and Statistics | 10 |
| 6.6 | Reporting on the Promotion of Race Equality | 12 |
| 6.7 | Translation and Interpreting | 12 |
| 6.8 | Multi-agency working – Measures to Address and Prevent Racial Harassment | 12 |
| 7 | Consultation with Minority Ethnic Communities | 14 |
| 7.1 | Introduction | 14 |
| 7.2 | When? | 14 |
| 7.3 | How? | 15 |
| 7.4 | Language | 15 |
| 7.5 | Who? | 15 |
| 7.6 | After Consultation: Feedback | 16 |
| 7.7 | Recommendations for Improved Consultation | 16 |

| | | |
|------------|--|-----------|
| 8 | Next Steps | 18 |
| | Action Plans | 20 |
| 1 | Education | 21 |
| 2 | Enterprise and Lifelong Learning | 37 |
| 3 | Health and Social Care | 47 |
| 4 | Housing | 55 |
| 5 | Local Government | 59 |
| 6 | Planning | 65 |
| 7 | Social Inclusion | 67 |
| 8 | Voluntary Sector Issues | 71 |
| | Appendices | 75 |
| Appendix A | Biographical Details of Members | 76 |
| Appendix B | Lawrence Steering Group Members | 77 |
| Appendix C | Developing a Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Programme | 78 |
| Appendix D | Summary of Recommendations | 80 |
| Appendix E | Recommendations on Public Appointments | 82 |
| Appendix F | Contributions to the REAF Action Plans | 83 |
| Appendix G | Census Classification | 98 |
| Appendix H | Other Sources of Information | 99 |

Foreword by Jackie Baillie, MSP



*Jackie Baillie, MSP
Minister for Social Justice and Chair of the Forum*

I am pleased to present the report of the Race Equality Advisory Forum. The publication of this report marks a significant step forward in the development of a comprehensive race equality strategy for Scotland. The overarching report and eight action plans give the public sector in Scotland a clear insight into the key issues of concern to Scotland's minority ethnic communities. The plans will also be invaluable as the public sector begins to prepare the race equality schemes required under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000.

In 1999, I invited Forum members to bring to this work their own experiences and knowledge both of the different minority ethnic and faith communities and of different sectors. Their drive and commitment has been enhanced by their success in involving a wide range of people from different communities and from the different sectors covered by the action plans. By building on existing networks, working with relevant organisations and through the four consultative seminars held in summer and autumn 2000, the Forum was able to draw on a huge breadth of expertise and experience.

I would like to thank all those in communities and in the public and voluntary sectors who gave of their time and energy by participating in one of these seminars, or by meeting with Forum members or by providing written comments on the Forum's plans. I would also like to thank the colleagues and the families of the Forum members. Without your support, Forum members would not have been able to devote so much time and effort to this important task. Finally, I would like to thank the members of the Forum themselves. Their energy and their commitment made this report possible, while their humour and vitality made Chairing the Forum a pleasure.

The Forum and I are in no doubt of the challenges ahead. Not least there must be an ongoing push to ensure that racism of any sort, be it institutional racism, racial discrimination or racial harassment, has no place in Scotland. Politicians, institutions, organisations and individuals will have to make a sincere and sustained commitment to delivering worthwhile, lasting change. Only in this way can race equality become a reality for all of Scotland's people.

We were all saddened by the untimely death of our friend and colleague Subhash Joshi, CA, OBE. He brought to our work, especially on the Enterprise and Lifelong Learning action plan, wise counsel, as well as the professional and business insight which he had demonstrated as President of Glasgow Chamber of Commerce and as a board member of the Glasgow and Edinburgh Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centres. He dedicated considerable time and energy to many varied voluntary commitments including as Chair of both Positive Action in Housing and of the Ministerial Crimestoppers Campaign. Our thoughts remain with his family, friends and colleagues who too must miss his warm and wise support.



*Subhash Joshi CA OBE
30 June 1953 – 8 May 2001*

Foreword by the Forum

It has been a privilege to have been able to contribute to the development of a race equality strategy for Scotland, although we acknowledge at the outset that what we have done is only the beginning. This report contains our findings and our recommendations for action.

We have sought to build on and develop channels of communication with communities. In this we recognise that one of the biggest challenges has been to develop our own and others capacity to champion change. We hope that we have done this successfully. We could not have got this far without the support and input of communities, the Scottish Executive and those members of the public and voluntary sectors who contributed so positively to our consultative events and other dialogue.

Our remit offered us significant opportunities to work across different sectors and to lay the foundations for future work. It will be for others in the Scottish Executive and the public, private and voluntary sectors to take forward what is presented here and to deliver the change so desperately sought.

Members unanimously agreed on limiting the group's lifespan. By doing this we ensured that the Forum, while tackling issues of institutional racism, did not itself become institutionalised. It is now for others to take the implementation of our recommendations forward and mainstream race equality.

We believe that there is now a climate for change in race equality. Devolution has given us a context in which to pursue an agenda on race equality close to the needs of communities in Scotland. The commitment of the Scottish Parliament to equal opportunities and the new duty on the public sector in the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 offer real opportunities to promote race equality. This report contains our recommendations on how those opportunities can be taken and progress can be made.

We wish to thank Jackie Baillie and her Ministerial colleagues Louise Donnelly, Rhona Carr and Alastair Crerar for being our Secretariat and officials for their support, encouragement, vision and commitment to action. We look to the leadership and drive of Scottish Executive Ministers to establish, reinforce and sustain

partnership working with minority ethnic communities. We encourage communities to maintain their confidence in the willingness of the public, private and voluntary sectors to ask, listen and take action. Finally we hope that communities will want to be active partners, supporting others in developing programmes for change and demonstrating improved accountability.

October 2001

Introduction

On 20 July 1999 Jackie Baillie, MSP, then Deputy Minister for Communities in the Scottish Executive, announced the establishment of a Race Equality Advisory Forum. A list of Members of the Forum is in Appendix A.

3.1 Remit

The Forum's remit was to:

- ▶▶ advise the Scottish Executive on the preparation of a race equality strategy;
- ▶▶ develop detailed action plans to tackle institutional racism and promote race equality; and
- ▶▶ advise the Scottish Executive on consultation with, and for, minority ethnic communities.

The Forum was established to work in parallel with the Steering Group set up to oversee implementation of the Scottish Executive's Action Plan in response to the Inquiry chaired by Sir William Macpherson into the murder of Stephen Lawrence. The Steering Group, Chaired by Jim Wallace, QC, MSP, Deputy First Minister and Minister for Justice, included a number of members of the Forum (see Appendix B).

This cross membership was designed to support collaborative working and promote the more effective sharing of learning and actions to tackle **institutional racism**. It also reflected the Scottish Executive's view that the potential for institutional racism was not restricted to the Justice system and its agencies.

Institutional racism is "the collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping which disadvantage minority ethnic people".

Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report, 1999, paragraph 6.34, p.28

The Forum is concerned that public sector organisations have at times seemed to react very defensively to any discussion of institutional racism. As the above definition makes clear, institutional racism can by its very nature be unintentional and unconscious. It is also a characteristic of organisations rather than individuals. Accusations and admissions of institutional racism do not reflect badly on the individuals within an organisation, but suggest that the organisation as a whole needs to review its processes, attitudes and behaviour. As such, both accusations and admissions should be seen as a challenge rather than a threat.

*"No room for complacency or denial"
Minister for Social Justice, a Commission for Racial Equality Beyond Rhetoric conference, Edinburgh, November 2000.*

The way in which the Forum was to operate also reflected the four key principles upon which the Scottish Parliament was founded: openness, accountability, the sharing of power and equal opportunities.

Finally, the Forum was created at a time when the Scottish Executive was developing its own Equality Strategy for Scotland. By providing the Executive with independent advice on the promotion of race equality and on consultation with minority ethnic communities, the Forum has worked to make a contribution to progress in these specific areas but also across the whole range of equality issues and interests which the Equality Strategy has sought to address.

3.2 Composition

Individuals from a range of communities, backgrounds and areas of interest were invited by Jackie Baillie to join the Forum which she was to Chair. These individuals were chosen following consultation with relevant statutory and voluntary organisations, including organisations representing the interests of minority ethnic communities in a number of different spheres such as housing and health.

From the outset Jackie Baillie emphasised that the Forum was to be a means of drawing on the experience and interests of Forum members as individuals and as members of diverse communities rather than as representatives of particular committees or organisations. It was to ensure a free flow of information about the work and experiences, concerns and suggestions of minority ethnic communities on tackling racism and promoting race equality.

Members saw one of their key roles as identifying the concerns of **communities**. They also entered into dialogue with different sectors about those concerns and how they might best be addressed. The action plans are the Forum's recommendations on how communities'

concerns can best be addressed within those different sectors.

Communities is used throughout this report to mean minority ethnic communities, and also communities of interest and geographical communities.

3.3 How the Forum Worked

The first plenary meeting of the Forum was held on 23 November 1999 and members were asked to commit to working for “about one year”. This time limit was seen as an essential safeguard against the Forum itself becoming institutionalised. The Forum’s life was extended to allow it to reflect on the changes to the law introduced by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. The Forum decided to conduct its work through the establishment of four working groups. These would look in detail at what was required across the range of devolved responsibilities and prepare action plans accordingly. The four working groups were:

- ▶▶ Education;
- ▶▶ Enterprise and Lifelong Learning;
- ▶▶ Health and Social Care;
- ▶▶ Local Government, Social Inclusion, Housing and the Voluntary Sector.

The Commission for Racial Equality proposed cross-cutting strands which could usefully frame discussion within the working groups: accountability, engaging communities, planning tools, planning cycle, and training.

The four working groups made every effort to ensure that consultation was a central feature of the way the Forum worked. They did this by consulting with many different interests in several different ways.

In summer and autumn 2000, each of the Forum’s four working groups held consultative events to discuss the Forum’s emerging ideas for the strategy and action plans (see Appendix F for participants and other contributors). At these events, the Forum was able to hear from both practitioners and communities about the main perceived problems and barriers to race equality in Scotland. Community members were also able to suggest

solutions. Through these events, the working groups hoped to create action plans which reflected minority ethnic communities’ real needs and concerns.

At these events and subsequently, the Forum also consulted with public, voluntary and other sectoral interests. This process of dialogue was valuable in two different ways:

First it meant that the public sector was informed at a very early stage of communities’ concerns and perceptions of key areas for change.

Secondly, it gave the Forum the opportunity to test its ideas and recommendations on the public sector. Public sector feedback, generally on draft action plans, was very important in helping the Forum to target its recommendations effectively.

While the action plans were being developed by the working groups through this process of consultation with communities and sectoral interests, the Forum continued to meet as a whole in a series of plenary sessions chaired by the Minister for Social Justice. These sessions gave Forum members the opportunity to look at issues which did not fit neatly into the different working group remits. It was at these plenary sessions that the cross-cutting issues covered here in the overarching report were discussed, as well as Forum members’ concerns around the 2001 Census and suggestions on how to improve consultation with minority ethnic communities. Notes of the Forum’s discussion were published on the Scottish Executive website as an additional way of improving the flow of information on its work.

3.4 Achievements

In the time allotted to it the Forum aimed to lay foundations and start a process of change. The Forum has made an important start to this process by:

- ▶▶ identifying the experiences and concerns of communities;
- ▶▶ providing a structure for considering race equality issues;
- ▶▶ developing new ways of building and improving dialogue with minority ethnic communities; and

- ▶▶ developing action plans building on consultation with and advice from sectoral stakeholders and minority ethnic communities.

3.5 The Language of the Report

Unless the context otherwise requires, the term “minority ethnic” is used here and throughout the Forum’s Action Plans. The Forum opted for this overarching terminology to capture the diversity of minority ethnic communities in Scotland. It is used in its broadest sense to include all minority ethnic communities and particular groups such as asylum seekers, refugees, Gypsies/Travellers, as well as religious and faith communities. The Forum acknowledges however, that the debate on language and identity is fluid and must be ongoing.

For the purposes of this report and in the interests of clarity and consistency the Forum has avoided terms such as “black” or “white”, which are explicit or implied in both the 1991 and the 2001 censuses. Similarly, the Forum has avoided the use of terms such as “black and/or ethnic minorities”. Our African colleagues in the Forum, other Forum members and others were particularly concerned and objected as a matter of principle to the way in which the census treated people of African ethnic origin differently from other minorities. Issues about the use of terms such as “black and/or ethnic minority” were also raised and debated within the Forum.

There was an emerging view that whatever the past or present relevance and significance of these terms there was a need for a wider debate on their continuing relevance and acceptability to the diversity of all within minority ethnic communities. The Forum recognises and understands that this is going to be the start of a process of addressing many issues including the language individuals and communities use to define themselves as well as relate to one another. To support that debate the papers discussed in the Forum are being placed on the Scottish Executive’s web site alongside the notes of the Forum’s discussions.

The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000

The Forum welcomes the significant strengthening and extension of the scope of the Race Relations Act 1976.

The Race Relations Act 1976 outlaws discrimination on racial grounds defined as: "colour, race, nationality or ethnic or national origins."

In particular the Forum considers that the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 (the RRAA) gives a legal framework for the mainstreaming of race equality and greater clarity for the public sector as to the essential components of such a mainstreaming approach in their own work.

The Forum endorses the 2001 consultation paper's¹ statement on the key features of an organisation promoting race equality as it:

- ▶▶ monitors its workforce, taking steps to ensure that ethnic minorities are treated fairly;
- ▶▶ assesses how its policies and programmes could effect ethnic minorities, identifies any potential for adverse differential impact, and takes remedial action if necessary;
- ▶▶ monitors the implementation of its policies and programmes to ensure that they meet the needs of ethnic minorities; and
- ▶▶ has a publicly-stated policy on race equality.

These features are essential to a mainstreaming approach to building in concern for equality and race equality from the start. The new general duty is reinforced by the power for Scottish Ministers to impose specific duties on all or some public authorities bound by the general duty.

The Forum recommends that all organisations adopt a mainstreaming approach to tackling racism and promoting race equality.

The Forum recommends that Scottish Ministers adopt the framework on specific duties set out in the 2001 consultation paper and that the Executive supports and encourages the development of good practice across the public sector in Scotland to ensure that compliance with the new specific duties delivers on the Executive's commitment to promote race equality.

"Mainstreaming" can be defined as:

Making sure an equality perspective is part of the everyday work of government, involving policy makers across all government departments, as well as equality specialists and external partners.

4.1 New positive duty to promote race equality

The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 received Royal Assent on 30 November 2000 and its main provisions came into force on 2 April 2001. The main provisions:

- ▶▶ outlaw race discrimination in all public authority functions, with certain, very limited exceptions, not just those previously covered by the Race Relations Act 1976; this includes private sector bodies to the extent that they are discharging public functions;
- ▶▶ place a general duty on specified authorities to promote race equality; and
- ▶▶ give powers to Government to impose specific duties on public bodies to promote race equality and to the Commission for Racial Equality to enforce those specific duties.

¹ New Laws for a successful multi-racial Britain. Proposals for implementation. Home Office, February 2001.

Schedule 1A of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 lists those public authorities subject to the new duty. There is power to add to, or remove from, that list by secondary legislation made by the Home Secretary. The schedule lists a number of key Scottish public authorities including the Scottish Administration itself, local authorities, health services, police and education. Proposals for additions to the list of public bodies subject to the general duty and for the key central public bodies for which specific duties are proposed are contained in the consultation paper published by the Home Office on a GB-wide basis in February this year. Responses to the consultation paper have been received from a wide range of consultees including Scottish-based consultees. Scottish Executive Ministers are considering the application of the new legislative framework, including the powers to impose specific duties, for devolved matters.

The general duty came into force on 2 April 2001 and the Commission for Racial Equality has issued non-statutory guidance to public bodies to help them meet their obligations under the general duty.

4.2 Specific duties

Scottish Ministers have power to impose specific duties on bodies with devolved functions. As explained in the February 2001 consultation paper it is currently envisaged that specific duties will be imposed on a number of Scottish public bodies. These include the Scottish Administration, Audit Scotland, the police, local authorities, Health Boards and Trusts, Scottish Enterprise and Highlands and Islands Enterprise, Scottish Higher Education Funding Council and Scottish Further Education Funding Council. The list of those bodies subject to specific duties can be added to, or deleted from, by orders made by the Scottish Ministers. Decisions on the list of bodies and the specific duties to be imposed will be made by Ministers later this year in the light of responses to the consultation and other considerations.

The Home Secretary has powers to impose specific duties in respect of reserved bodies consistent with the reservation of equal opportunities subject to the exception in the devolution settlement.

Current thinking on the nature of specific duties to be imposed is set out in the February 2001 consultation paper. The specific duties are likely to require bodies to:

- ▶▶ prepare and publish a **Race Equality Scheme** setting out how it intends to meet its obligations under the general duty and any other proposed specific duties to promote race equality which are relevant to it;
- ▶▶ assess which of its functions and policies are relevant to the general duty, with regular subsequent reviews, e.g. three yearly;
- ▶▶ set out its arrangements for **assessing and consulting on the impact** on the promotion of race equality of policies it has adopted or is proposing for adoption;
- ▶▶ set out its arrangements for **monitoring for any adverse impact** on the promotion of race equality of policies it has adopted or is proposing for adoption;
- ▶▶ set out its arrangements for **publishing the results of**:
 - assessments;
 - consultations; and
 - monitoring for any adverse impact on the promotion of race equality of policies;
- ▶▶ set out its arrangements for ensuring **ethnic minorities have access to information and to services** it provides; and
- ▶▶ set out its arrangements for **training staff** on issues relevant to the duty to promote race equality.

These are complemented by proposals for specific duties in relation to the public sector as an employer discussed in this report in section 6.4.

These include duties to monitor the ethnic composition of the workforce.

Fundamentals for a Fairer Future

The Forum believes there are several reasons for the lack of progress in the promotion of race equality and anti-racism in Scotland. Of these, two seem particularly important to any understanding of past public and other sector approaches.

First, the small size and scattered geographical distribution of Scotland's minority ethnic communities has been used by some to deny that racism and racial discrimination are a problem or even an issue in Scotland. It is the Forum's view that this is not an acceptable or justifiable basis for policy development, service design and service delivery.

Secondly, specific cultural, linguistic and religious needs of minority ethnic communities are not met by purely "neutral" approaches. Such approaches have also hindered the development of an understanding of the effects of racism and inequality.

Such attitudes and approaches, combined with other institutional and structural barriers, have prevented Scotland's minority ethnic communities from enjoying equitable access to public services. They have also prevented communities from being provided with services which genuinely meet their needs. The Forum's work has led it to conclude that there are a number of fundamentals which must now be put in place or strengthened if Scotland's minority ethnic communities are to enjoy a fairer future. These are:

- ▶▶ an **acknowledgement** by all in Scottish society that institutional racism and racial harassment are issues which need to be addressed;
- ▶▶ a **commitment** from political and organisational leaders to tackle the root causes of racial discrimination and remove the conditions that allow racial harassment and racist behaviour to flourish;
- ▶▶ the **development** of structures, policies and practices to act positively against racism and overcome institutional barriers; and
- ▶▶ **action** to promote race equality, anti-racism and equality of opportunity for all communities.

Areas for Action

This report is primarily about the actions needed to generate these improvements. Sector-specific actions are contained in the action plans which accompany this report. However, the Forum has also identified the following cross-cutting areas where progress is essential. These are:

- ▶▶ Mainstreaming of race equality into planning, policy design and service delivery;
- ▶▶ Race equality training;
- ▶▶ Public Appointments;
- ▶▶ Employment in the public sector;
- ▶▶ Improved research, information and statistics;
- ▶▶ Reporting on the promotion of race equality;
- ▶▶ Translation, interpreting and access to information and services;
- ▶▶ Multi-agency working and measures to address and prevent racial harassment.

6.1 Mainstreaming of Race Equality into Planning, Policy Design and Service Delivery

The Forum supports the process of mainstreaming equality into all aspects and processes of policy-making, service design, service delivery, evaluation and reporting. The Forum also recognises that mainstreaming is a longer-term strategy. Until there is clear evidence of delivery by the public sector against the mainstreaming challenge it is essential for there to be a supporting programme of positive action.

6.2 Race Equality Training

The implementation of the general duty on the public sector to promote race equality in the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, along with the power for Scottish Ministers to impose specific duties on Scottish public bodies, will require a step change in the provision of race equality training.

In the view of the Forum, such a change is long overdue. The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report noted with concern the lack of effective training on race equality issues at every level of the police service. The Forum's own work has identified a pressing need for an early start to be made on developing race equality training to support the Scottish Executive's commitment to mainstreaming equality across all of its work and more generally across the public sector.

The Forum believes that to be effective race equality training must be:

- ▶▶ an integral part of the training programme of every part of the public sector;
- ▶▶ compulsory as opposed to voluntary or optional;
- ▶▶ authoritative, constructive, informative and relevant;
- ▶▶ based upon clear standards for content and delivery; and
- ▶▶ anti-racist.

The Forum asserts strongly that race equality training needs to include, but also go beyond, a multicultural approach. Familiarising participants with cultural differences is an aspect of race equality training, but participants must also be made aware of the real and multiple effects of racial discrimination and of the part which existing institutional practices can play in causing or exacerbating discrimination and exclusion.

An anti-racist approach would include an exploration of "personal, cultural and institutional racism" and would assist participants in identifying strategies to overcome various forms of racism and racial discrimination. Such training would also address baseline knowledge in areas of terminology and legislation without avoiding an examination of how personal values and attitudes contribute to institutional racism. An effective anti-racism approach would also be sensitive to the need for a multi-cultural approach.

A multi-cultural approach would sensitise participants to cultural, religious and linguistic issues and equip them to carry out their duties with confidence in a multi-faith, multi-lingual and multi-ethnic society.

The Forum also believes that race equality training can be delivered in various ways:

- ▶▶ as a discrete race equality course or component;
- ▶▶ within other types of course where issues of race equality permeate generic course content; and
- ▶▶ as part of broader equality training, recognising that people often face multiple discriminations and that it is helpful to embed race within a generic equalities approach.

In all cases independent evaluation of the effectiveness of training is necessary. This evaluation may, in certain circumstances, identify the need for refresher or further specialist training to support anti-racist approaches and the mainstreaming of race equality into policy-making, service design and service delivery.

To facilitate the delivery of race equality training in Scotland which meets the objectives and standards set out above, the Forum recommends that the Scottish Executive, in partnership with communities and others, develop:

- ▶▶ a database of race equality trainers and advisers;
- ▶▶ a national framework of core standards for race equality training; and
- ▶▶ in the longer term, an accreditation scheme for race equality trainers and advisers.

6.3 Public Appointments

In March 2000 the Forum received a presentation on the Scottish Executive's plans to modernise the public appointments system. The members registered concerns about the lack of participation of members of Scotland's minority ethnic communities in public bodies.

The Scottish Executive has inherited from the pre-devolution Scottish Office a target of 1.3% of all public appointments being held by members of minority ethnic communities by 2002. On present performance the Scottish Executive will struggle to achieve that target. The Forum considers it essential that a tailored positive action programme is developed and implemented to address the serious and unacceptable under-representation of people from minority ethnic groups in public positions.

For detailed recommendations on how this might be achieved, see **Appendix E**.

6.4 Employment in the Public Sector

The Forum received reports that across the public sector there is under-representation of, and under-utilisation of, the skills, energies and expertise of Scotland's minority ethnic communities. In September 2000 the Commission for Racial Equality published the findings of its research into equal opportunities and employment. While this research focused particularly on the private sector, it is likely that parallels can be drawn with the public sector. Two of the key findings of that research, which was based on a survey of 500 employers and 500 individuals, were that:

- ▶▶ two-thirds of the employers were unable to demonstrate that practical steps had been taken to put equal opportunities policies into practice; and
- ▶▶ minority ethnic employees, particularly minority ethnic women, were more likely than their majority ethnic colleagues to consider that discrimination had affected their working lives.

The Commission for Racial Equality's research and work by the Scottish Trades Union Congress and its affiliates has also identified serious issues in relation to direct and indirect discrimination in employment. These included harassment of minority ethnic employees by other employees and service users, as well as general feelings of frustration at the failure of organisations to value equality and diversity. There were also strong feelings that there was little support for minority ethnic employees in achieving their full potential and making progress throughout their working lives on an equal basis with majority ethnic employees.

As with other areas of the Forum's work hard data are difficult to come by without robust ethnic monitoring frameworks and effective reporting arrangements for cases of discrimination and racist behaviours and harassment. However, the Forum considers that there is sufficient anecdotal evidence upon which to base its recommendations on priority actions for Scotland.

The Forum noted the Home Secretary's publication of specific targets for recruitment of members of minority ethnic communities into the police, fire and prison services in England. The Forum acknowledges that in the Scottish context, where minority ethnic populations are concentrated in the cities of Edinburgh and Glasgow, centrally-set recruitment targets may not necessarily be appropriate. However, it does believe that the public sector should set and publish organisational targets. In doing so organisations may wish to reflect local circumstances. The Forum also noted the work of the Scottish Executive in developing a diversity strategy for its own employees.

In relation to the public sector as an employer, the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 proposals require all public sector employers, subject to the general duty, to have a specific duty to ethnically monitor staff in post and applicants for jobs, promotion and training. Public sector employers with more than 150 full-time employees should be subject to a specific duty to ethnically monitor and analyse grievances, disciplinary action, performance appraisal, training and dismissals and other reasons for leaving. There would also be a requirement to publish annually the results of that ethnic monitoring (using existing annual reporting systems wherever possible).

The Forum recommends that Scottish Ministers adopt the framework on specific duties on ethnic monitoring set out in the 2001 Race Relations (Amendment) Act consultation paper.

The Forum recommends that all public sector organisations:

- ▶▶ establish what barriers exist to equality of access to information about and participation in employment opportunities in their organisation;
- ▶▶ seek to identify what if any direct and/or institutional discrimination exist against applicants from minority ethnic backgrounds;
- ▶▶ equality-proof their practices and policies relating to recruitment, retention and progression of staff; such equality-proofing to include a race equality impact assessment;

- ▶▶ consider the relevance and contribution of positive action programmes, including the use of outreach work in minority ethnic communities and schools, colleges and universities. Specific programmes could also be considered for groups currently excluded from full participation in the labour market, for example through lack of English language skills or access to culturally-sensitive child-care or adult-carer facilities; and
- ▶▶ set organisational targets for recruitment, retention and progression of minority ethnic employees and report on those targets on an annual basis as part of established public reporting frameworks.

6.5 Improved Research, Information and Statistics

Improved disaggregated statistics, research and information on Scotland's minority ethnic communities are fundamental if a mainstreaming approach is to be successful. Scotland's minority ethnic communities are concerned, however, that the difficulties in obtaining such evidence has frequently appeared to get in the way of essential action to meet the needs and rights of the different communities. It is important that the public sector in Scotland collects data more effectively about minority ethnic communities and that these data then become the bases for prompt and efficient action.

6.5.1 Research

The Scottish Executive's Equality Strategy recognises that improved research is essential to delivering on the commitment to equality of opportunity for all. The Forum's own work has confirmed that this is equally vital if the interests of Scotland's minority ethnic communities are to be met. There are, however, significant difficulties in making progress in this area. These include:

- ▶▶ unstructured approaches to research: many of those attending the Scottish Executive's ethnic minorities research workshop on 2 March 2000 and those participating in the Forum's wider dialogue sessions in the summer and autumn of 2000 reported considerable dissatisfaction that some areas and issues were the subject of repeated research while others were neglected;
- ▶▶ difficulties in translating the results of the research into action on the ground. There is considerable evidence of frustration and dissatisfaction with the slow progress in implementing the findings of research and with inaction following publication; and
- ▶▶ a failure to involve minority ethnic communities in the design, implementation and evaluation of research.

The Scottish Executive's proposals announced in February 2000 of major new research into the experiences and circumstances of Scotland's minority ethnic communities was welcomed. The Forum considers it essential that the Executive continues to adopt an inclusive approach as it takes forward this programme. More information on the Scottish Executive's ongoing ethnic minorities research programme is contained in Appendix C.

In taking forward the development of a Scottish ethnic minorities research programme the Forum therefore recommends that the Scottish Executive take the lead in the development of a capacity-building programme involving researchers and advisors from minority ethnic communities and community-led organisations.

6.5.2 Disaggregated statistics

The Scottish Executive's Equality Strategy acknowledged the importance of improved information and statistics on different communities of interest in Scotland.

The Forum believes that progress in the gathering of information and statistics is vital if race equality is to be effectively promoted in Scotland.

The consistent use of improved ethnic monitoring frameworks is also fundamental to the effective implementation of the new general duty to promote race equality and the proposed race equality schemes to be prepared by specified public bodies under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000.

This will require the collection of disaggregated statistics on a more structured and comprehensive basis than has so far been the case. It is also likely to require the development and promotion of classification frameworks. It is essential for those developing revised classification frameworks to involve both the users and the providers of information.

Policing is an example of where classification categories affect both the providers and users of information and in reporting incidents the Forum consider that the categories used should:

- ▶▶ identify individuals in terms of who they are, i.e. their primary identities, e.g. Asian/Indian, European/English, African/Nigerian, etc.;
- ▶▶ distinguish between the nature of a "racist" crime, including the inherent racist attitude, and the identity of the victim;
- ▶▶ be consistent with the Macpherson Report.

6.5.3 Ethnic classification frameworks

Ethnic classification frameworks underpin effective monitoring and evaluation of action to eliminate racial discrimination and promote race equality. They are an essential part of the new positive duty on the public sector to promote race equality. Within the Forum there has been considerable debate about the language used in such frameworks. For the Forum this debate crystallised around the ethnicity framework for the 2001 Census. Concerns around the framework used were initially raised as a matter of principle by the Africans in the Forum.

The ethnicity framework used in the Census can be seen in Appendix H where the relevant Census question (15) has been reprinted.

There was a recognition within the Forum that the categories used to define ethnicity in the question were inconsistent and problematic. An African ethnic identity within the Census framework was positioned under a "black" colour code rather than simply standing as "African". On the other hand, Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Chinese ethnic identities were placed under the ethno-geographic category "Asian". The Forum recognised a need to identify an approach to classifying ethnicity which reflects modern circumstances and the specific context in Scotland and which enjoys support from communities.

A number of actions have been taken and agreements reached to secure the spirit and intent of the Forum's discussions. This includes work with the Scottish Executive and its Central Research Unit, Statisticians Group and engagement with the Registrar General for Scotland (responsible for the Census) around data output from the 2001 Census, planning for the next Census and future data collection.

6.5.4 Principles for terminology and frameworks

Members of the Forum wish to continue to work with the Scottish Executive and the Registrar General for Scotland along with members of different communities to develop a phased work programme to explore issues of ethnicity, identity and culture in the Scottish context. This will also offer scope for considering issues of multiple identities to take account of the new question on religion in the 2001 Census, as well as other dimensions such as gender and disability. The aim should be to develop a more inclusive, non-discriminatory framework on ethnicity for use in all data collection and underpin mainstreaming race equality into better policy-making and service-planning.

As a starting point the Forum suggest that terminology and classification frameworks should aim to:

- ▶▶ be clear, coherent and consistent;
- ▶▶ recognise and reflect so far as practicable diversity within categories;
- ▶▶ allow individuals to identify with their own [ethnic] descriptors;
- ▶▶ not be hierarchical (i.e. avoid references to racialised categories);
- ▶▶ not be seen, or perceived to, favour any group over any other;
- ▶▶ not be divisive;
- ▶▶ focus on ethnicity rather than "race";
- ▶▶ be open to redefinition and change;
- ▶▶ not have direct resources implications; and
- ▶▶ contribute to opposing racism and eliminating racial discrimination.

It will be important that any necessary developmental work for a future Census, the reporting frameworks for the output from the 2001 Census and all public sector data collections disaggregated by ethnicity comply with these principles and reflect members of communities' own views on identity. This will also enable policy-makers and service-providers to meet needs in a non-discriminatory and culturally sensitive way using inclusive language.

6.6 Reporting on the Promotion of Race Equality

The Forum considers openness, transparency and accountability to be fundamental to the effective mainstreaming of race equality. These are central to the Consultative Steering Group's recommendations and are key components of the new positive duty legal framework. The Forum welcomes the Scottish Executive's commitment to report annually to the Scottish Parliament on its Equality Strategy.

The Forum recommends that the Scottish Executive take the lead on the development of race equality specific performance indicators and evaluation frameworks to inform the public sector's reporting of progress and implementation of race equality work as recommended in the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report and elsewhere in this report.

The Forum also recommends that Scottish Ministers adopt the February 2001 consultation paper proposals on the specific duty to report the results of race equality impact assessment of policies and services and consultations and monitoring of the impacts in policies, services and employment.

6.7 Translation and Interpreting

Translation and interpreting were repeatedly raised by members of communities as being key elements in the equitable provision, accessing and use of public services. The Forum therefore welcomes the Scottish Executive's establishment of a multi-agency group to work towards improved provision of these services.

The Forum also encourages the public sector to develop and build on existing good practice, such as the good practice guidelines of the Scottish Forum for Public Service Interpreting and Translating.

The Forum recommends that the Scottish Executive and all public sector bodies, in preparing their race equality schemes to meet the requirements of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act, set out their arrangements for provision of, and access to, translation and interpreting services.

6.8 Multi-Agency Working and Measures to Address and Prevent Racial Harassment

In the home, in the work place and in the street, members of Scotland's minority ethnic communities can experience racial harassment and racist attacks. Effective responses to such unacceptable behaviour require multi-agency working. The Forum noted the parallels with the Scottish partnership on domestic violence and the development of the strategy to tackle domestic abuse. Considerable advances in an effective, immediate response to the needs of victims of domestic abuse have flowed from the setting up by the Scottish Executive of a multi-agency telephone hotline.

The Forum welcomes the undertakings in the progress report on implementation of the Lawrence Action Plan, to report further on the establishment of a 24-hour telephone hotline, to give support for remote reporting of racist incidents and to produce draft guidance to support multi-agency working in Scotland. Such a co-ordinated approach to the reporting and recording of racist incidents will contribute to greater confidence amongst communities of an effective and speedy response. The Forum looks to the Executive to take its commitment to supporting the victims of racist incidents and turn it into worthwhile practical responses across all key service areas including the police, housing, health and community care services and victim support schemes.

The Macpherson Report into the murder of Stephen Lawrence highlighted the importance of racism awareness and valuing cultural diversity in the Scottish context. Responsibility for raising awareness of the impact of racism and challenging it rests with a number of agencies. The Public Awareness Campaign “Domestic abuse – there is no excuse” demonstrates the value of nationally-organised and Scottish Executive-resourced campaigns.

The Forum welcomes Jackie Baillie’s announcement of development work on a national anti-racism and race equality campaign in her evidence on 5 June 2001 to the Scottish Parliament’s Equal Opportunities Committee’s Inquiry into Gypsy Travellers and Public Sector Policies. The Forum particularly welcomes the Scottish Executive’s commitment to bringing forward the development work in dialogue with communities. The Forum recognises that such awareness raising will require a variety of approaches and a number of distinct strands. It considers that education of both young people and the whole community will be central to success. It also considers that media campaigns need to be part of a broader strategic programme including prevention, protection of victims and the provision of effective responses and services by all key agencies.

The Forum also noted the beneficial impact of more local campaigns specifically on anti-racism run by different local partnerships, such as the “See it. Believe it. Report it.” campaign in Fife.

Another example of effective partnership working on anti-racism is the anti-racism training package “Racism: raising the profile”, produced by the Central Scotland Racial Attacks and Harassment Steering/Monitoring Group (RAHMAS).

Attacking the cancer of racist behaviours, attitudes and processes must start early. The Forum therefore welcomed and endorsed the recommendations of the Macpherson Inquiry on prevention and the role of education.

The Forum therefore recommends that the Scottish Executive take action to:

- ▶▶ support and develop multi-agency working to ensure an effective, timely and co-ordinated response to racist incidents and racial harassment;
- ▶▶ develop a strategic programme of work on the prevention of racist crime and racial harassment; protection and support for victims; and the provision of effective service responses by all key agencies; and
- ▶▶ develop and support a partnership with minority ethnic communities and public and voluntary sectors at a national and local level to encourage and support ongoing dialogue in all its work in this area.

Consultation with Minority Ethnic Communities

7.1 Introduction

The promotion of more effective consultation with minority ethnic groups is part of developing a more comprehensive understanding of the needs of all communities. It is necessary not only for effective policy-making but also to fulfil the legislative requirements of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. The Act's general duty to promote race equality requires public bodies to seek to avoid unlawful discrimination before it occurs by assessing how their policies and programmes could affect the promotion of race equality. Further to this, key central bodies will also soon be subject to a specific duty to develop means of consulting on proposed policies.

The Forum also sees consultation as being central to effective partnership working with communities. Its own approach of involving members of minority ethnic communities and organisations in wider dialogue on the development of the race equality strategy and action plans at the same time as public, private and mainstream voluntary sector interests demonstrates the value of such direct exchanges.

Mainstreaming race equality issues into consultation mechanisms and processes is one way of ensuring the diversity of minority ethnic needs are always considered in policy development and that consultation with communities is not just limited to those issues which are considered to be directly relevant to minority ethnic communities.

In particular, the Forum considers that there are real opportunities for significant progress through mainstreaming race equality into:

- ▶▶ the development of community planning;
- ▶▶ local economic forums as part of the wider strategy on enterprise;
- ▶▶ best value with its emphasis on user involvement;
- ▶▶ the Civic Forum and the potential for the Forum to mainstream consideration of the experiences and circumstances of minority ethnic communities into all its work; and
- ▶▶ the development in the Scottish Executive and the wider public sector of new approaches to civic participation.

7.2 When?

It became apparent during the Forum's dialogue with communities that their experiences of participating in consultation processes have often been very negative. In particular, some individuals and communities complained of consultation fatigue.

It was also suggested that some consultation was tokenistic, taking place after decisions had already been made and that public consultation was sometimes used as a means of delaying action and avoiding responsibility. Impressions that minority ethnic consultation is tokenistic have the potential to reduce participation. Efforts should be made to ensure that consultation is, and is seen to be, meaningful.

- ▶▶ Consultation should be built into the process from the beginning so that the purpose of the consultation exercise is clear from the outset.
- ▶▶ Consultation with minority ethnic communities and their representatives should not just take place at one point in the development of policy but throughout the whole process.
- ▶▶ In order to involve and inform minority ethnic community members enough time should be allowed for the consultation process. Extra time might also be needed should translation or interpreting services be utilised.
- ▶▶ The planning of consultation exercises needs to take into account religious festivals or other events that different minority ethnic communities might be involved in so that as many members of minority ethnic communities as possible are able to take part.

7.3 How?

The methods applied to different consultations may have a significant effect on both the outcome of the consultation and the level of participation. Choosing the appropriate method of consultation should involve an examination of both the needs and circumstances of those being consulted and the type of information required. Also some minority ethnic individuals and communities may have specific requirements. Issues of confidentiality, a fear that detailed personal information could be misused and language barriers can be of particular concern for minority ethnic community members who take part in consultations and must be taken into consideration.

Traditional paper-based approaches to consultation can cause difficulties for some members of some minority ethnic communities but at the same time it should not be assumed that this is always the case. A number of factors can contribute to an experience which fails to maximise partnership with communities and enable effective timely input from communities. These include language issues (see below) and lack of the necessary resources within communities to consider the impact of proposed changes.

Focus groups, in-depth interviews or targeted paper-based questionnaires (so long as they take into account language barriers) can all provide a means to involve groups normally excluded from other consultation approaches. Targeted, or structured, consultation methods also allow for consultation with under-represented groups within minority ethnic communities, for example young people or disabled people.

- ▶▶ In-depth interviews and focus groups offer the opportunity to examine and explore sensitive subjects in some detail as reassurance can be provided as to the confidentiality of the exercise.
- ▶▶ When face-to-face consultations are used it is usually advantageous to conduct consultative events in known community locations where possible so that consultees are placed at ease.

7.4 Language

Language can pose a real barrier to participation for some minority ethnic community members. For this reason the Forum suggests that:

- ▶▶ when clarifying the purpose of the consultation exercise it may be appropriate to provide briefing material or seminars in other languages;
- ▶▶ the use of complex, specialist language or jargon in consultation documents should be avoided;
- ▶▶ alternatives to written translations such as tapes of spoken translations into minority languages should be considered;
- ▶▶ where possible, translated material should be provided and disseminated rather than simply being made available on request;
- ▶▶ even non-written forms of consultation, such as informal brainstorming sessions can be excluding because unless everyone involved speaks the same language to the same level some people may find it difficult to follow the conversation or may feel too intimidated to participate fully; and
- ▶▶ for all forms of consultation appropriate steps should be taken for example through the use of interpreters and translators to avoid language barriers.

7.5 Who?

Central to effective consultation is an appropriately structured sample of people, groups or organisations on both sides of the consultation process, those being consulted, but also those involved with designing and carrying out the consultation. This is essential to reflect the diversity of minority ethnic communities and the full range of experiences and circumstances. Although this is an issue which can affect consultation with all groups, some specific concerns exist around consultation with minority ethnic communities.

7.5.1 Those conducting the consultation

The choice of those conducting the consultation, especially if it involves the use of interviewers or facilitators, should also be made carefully as they can have a significant impact on the outcome of the consultation. This could be due to lack of training or because of pre-conceived judgements made by consultees or those conducting the consultation.

- ▶▶ The composition of interviewers or facilitators should be monitored and where appropriate, have some links to the consultees to help encourage full and confident responses.
- ▶▶ Consideration should be given to commissioning or funding specific work in communities by members of the communities themselves. Such work might also identify unexpressed or unmet needs or issues specific to particular communities.
- ▶▶ Consideration should be given to the need for gender matching with the groups being consulted as a female facilitator for a female only focus group to encourage participation.

7.5.2 Those being consulted

In deciding who to consult, the following points should be taken into account:

- ▶▶ consultation needs to recognise diversity both across, and within, minority ethnic communities;
- ▶▶ there is no one-unified minority ethnic voice therefore, it is not possible to gain a representative and comprehensive picture of minority ethnic experiences simply through the use of large or established organisations and known contacts. Some degree of grassroots or local level consultation is required to identify minority ethnic concerns;
- ▶▶ consultation with large organisations and/or known contacts can be valuable as long as the limitations of such consultation are recognised and the purpose of consultation is clear;
- ▶▶ the experiences of minority ethnic people arise from a combination of factors including their age, gender, health, financial circumstances and sexual orientation as well as their ethnicity. In order to reflect the range of minority ethnic experiences and needs a balance must be struck between the interaction of these other dimensions with ethnicity for both the collectors and the users of the information gathered; and
- ▶▶ making assumptions about the ethnicity of consultees on the basis of their physical characteristics can lead to inaccurate findings. Wherever possible, participants should be invited to indicate their own ethnic identity.

Much use has been made by the Forum of existing databases of minority ethnic communities and organisations.

In particular, it has relied on Positive Action in Housing's directory containing over 400 contacts, the Black and Ethnic Minorities Infrastructure in Scotland (BEMIS's) database on voluntary sector organisations and Forum members' own contacts with grassroots interests in communities themselves.

7.6 After Consultation: Feedback

In taking the view that consultation is continuous, feedback should occur throughout the process and responses should be regularly reviewed. In line with the proposed specific duties of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, under which information should not only be available but be easily accessible and widely disseminated:

- ▶▶ Statutory organisations should be able to demonstrate through annual reports and other reporting processes the ways in which they have undertaken consultation and to what extent the outcome influenced policy or practice; and
- ▶▶ Feedback should be provided to those consulted and the consultation results should be published.

7.7 Recommendations for Improved Consultation

The Forum welcomes the Scottish Executive Central Research Unit's commissioning of a study to develop good practice guidelines in relation to consultation with equalities groups and more specific work to explore issues of engagement with ethnic minorities.

In order to embed improved consultation processes and mechanisms, the Forum recommends that the Scottish Executive:

- ▶▶ take the lead in continuing to support the development of a Scotland-wide database. This database would include minority ethnic community organisations, researchers with relevant experience and interest and race equality contacts within the public, private and voluntary sector organisations. This is a commitment in the Scottish Executive's Equality Strategy and will make a crucial contribution to the successful implementation of this race equality strategy; and
- ▶▶ encourage public sector interests including Scottish Executive departments, local authorities, health and community care and housing providers to develop sectoral specific better practice on inclusive events and consultation. This to be achieved in part through the issuing of guidance on the purpose and timing of consultation and on ways of identifying the needs and interests of minority ethnic communities.

As part of these efforts to develop better practice, the Forum encourages all Departments of the Scottish Executive and organisations to:

- ▶▶ develop awareness of different approaches which might enhance consultation and dialogue; and
- ▶▶ involve members of minority ethnic communities in trying out different approaches and evaluating their suitability for different types of policy-making, service design and evaluation of implementation.

The Forum also recommends that as a minimum those responsible for consultation with civic society in whatever sphere need to ensure that:

- ▶▶ the Commission for Racial Equality, Racial Equality Councils, BEMIS, the Scottish Interfaith Council and the Scottish Trades Union Congress Black Workers' Committee are included in all consultations along with relevant minority ethnic community organisations with a specific interest in the particular policy or service under consideration such as health, education or enterprise;
- ▶▶ responses are regularly reviewed throughout the consultation period to identify gaps in coverage of respondents and action is taken quickly to make direct approaches to communities to identify any difficulties in responding and to identify what support/assistance is required;

- ▶▶ consideration is given to commissioning and/or funding specific work in communities led by members of the communities themselves. Such work might identify unexpressed or unmet needs or issues specific to particular communities such as Gypsies/Travellers, asylum seekers, faith groups, other groups within minority ethnic communities such as women, older or younger people or those living in cities or more rural areas; and
- ▶▶ for all consultation and civic participation initiatives, consideration is given to the provision of relevant, accessible information in community languages (possibly in summary form) with a statement on decisions on the communication strategy adopted included in all consultation documents and reports. Part of this communication strategy should include consideration of the most effective places, media and ways to raise awareness in communities.

The Forum therefore encourages the Scottish Executive Media and Communications Group to initiate a specific study, with input from communities, on accessible and relevant means of communicating with minority ethnic communities.

Next Steps

The Forum has been working in a climate of change. Devolution, legislative change, not least the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, increased political concern and increased visibility of racism on the streets have all contributed to a new environment. The Forum has sought to identify what needs to be done now and in the longer term to embed an anti-racism culture and to promote race equality in a systematic way.

This report now passes to the Scottish Executive and in particular to Departmental Ministers, their officials and leaders of those bodies responsible for meeting the needs and interests of all of Scotland's people including those from minority ethnic communities.

It is essential for policy-makers and service providers to recognise and support the diversity of our society. They need to understand that minority ethnic communities are an integral part of that society. They also need to recognise the diversity that exists both across minority ethnic communities and also within those communities.

The challenge to all sectors and service providers is to ensure that the particular characteristics, experiences and choices of Scotland's minority ethnic people are identified and built-in from the start to all policy-making and service design and delivery.

For the future the Forum considers that it is essential for the public, private and voluntary sectors to accept that:

Scotland's minority ethnic communities have the right to equal consideration when policies and services are being developed and delivered.

The Forum, on behalf of minority ethnic communities, firmly believes that a race equality strategy needs to be action-based to be meaningful for communities, policy-makers and service providers. The Forum therefore looks to Scottish Executive Ministers to establish quickly:

- ▶▶ arrangements for the publication by the Scottish Executive of an initial report on work to take forward the commitment to promoting race equality covering the period from publication to autumn 2002 and annually thereafter. Such reporting to be mainstreamed into existing reporting mechanisms and supported by specific reporting to minority ethnic community organisations and service users as part of ongoing dialogue and capacity building;
 - ▶▶ convene in the winter of 2002/3 a broad ranging conference of minority ethnic communities, statutory agencies, public, private and voluntary sectors to review progress, reaffirm direction and renew the commitment to action; and
 - ▶▶ in preparation for the conference, to commission work within minority ethnic communities and mainstream service providers and voluntary sector interests across Scotland in order to assess progress on the strategy and action plans against the experiences of communities and individuals within minority ethnic communities themselves.
- ▶▶ arrangements for publication by Departmental Ministers of their initial response to the Forum's report including details of the timetable for the preparation of departmental implementation plans responding to the Forum's recommendations and proposals for action;

| Action | Completion Date | Outcomes |
|---|--------------------|--|
| Scottish Executive publishes its initial response to the REAF final report. | January 2002 | Establish timetable for the preparation of departmental implementation plans responding to the Forum's recommendations and proposals for action. |
| Scottish Executive publishes an initial report on work to take forward the commitment to promoting race equality. | Autumn 2002 | Establish annual reporting, mainstreamed into existing reporting mechanisms. |
| Work commissioned within minority ethnic communities, mainstream service providers and voluntary sector interests. | Summer/Autumn 2002 | Assessment of progress on the strategy and action plans against the experiences of communities and individuals, to take to the conference. |
| Scottish Executive convenes a broad ranging conference of minority ethnic communities, statutory agencies, public, private and voluntary sectors. | Winter 2002/3 | A review of progress made. Reaffirmation of direction. Renewal of the commitment to action. |

The Forum recognises that it has only been able to begin the process of change. In the course of its work it has not been possible to address all issues or to incorporate full consideration of the needs of some particular groups such as Gypsies/ Travellers, asylum seekers and refugees or those with disabilities. The Forum therefore asks the public, private and voluntary

sector in taking forward this report, recommendations and proposals for priority actions to have regard to the particular experiences, circumstances and needs of all minority ethnic communities including particular groups such as Gypsies/Travellers, asylum seekers and the religious and faith communities.

The Forum encourages all sectors to develop their own dialogue with, and within, communities as well as with other relevant organisations.

Action Plans

| | | |
|---|----------------------------------|----|
| 1 | Education | 21 |
| 2 | Enterprise and Lifelong Learning | 37 |
| 3 | Health and Social Care | 47 |
| 4 | Housing | 55 |
| 5 | Local Government | 59 |
| 6 | Planning | 65 |
| 7 | Social Inclusion | 67 |
| 8 | Voluntary Sector Issues | 71 |

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Education Action Plan

Introduction

Education and lifelong learning policies and services for Scotland which embrace commitment to social justice and social inclusion need to recognise and include issues of race equality, ethnicity, cultural, linguistic and faith diversity and the elimination of institutional racism. Most importantly, everyone involved in Scottish education needs to understand the relevance and importance of these issues, regardless of geographical location or the ethnic make-up of the local population.

Key Issues

Those working with minority ethnic parents, pupils, learners and communities have identified the following key concerns:

- ▶▶ lack of action to address racial harassment within educational premises;
- ▶▶ lack of acknowledgement by the education sector of cultural, religious and linguistic diversity, particularly within the curriculum;
- ▶▶ absence of data on minority ethnic learners, for example in relation to numbers, progress and attainment levels, exclusion rates, entry into further and higher education and staffing profiles at all levels of education;
- ▶▶ lack of effective communication and inclusion of minority ethnic views and perspectives;
- ▶▶ shortage of minority ethnic professionals employed across all levels of education;
- ▶▶ failure of the education system to provide adequate and fair support to bilingual learners;
- ▶▶ ad hoc and inconsistent support for English as an Additional Language across education authorities, particularly within schools and community and adult education.

Scottish education has tended to favour a multiculturalist approach which concentrates on the celebration of difference avoiding the harsh realities of racism, racial discrimination and xenophobia. Although this approach may lead to increased understanding, it does not allow for institutional racism to be challenged effectively.

The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report makes specific recommendations about the critical role of education in preventing racism. The REAF Education Working Group concludes that Scottish education needs to embed race equality in two ways:

- ▶▶ By institutionalising race equality within education
- ▶▶ By promoting education for race equality

Institutionalising race equality within education

This would necessitate a critical examination of the ethos, structures and practices of all stages of educational management and delivery to ensure that these do not reinforce institutional racism or discriminatory outcomes. This would include redressing any imbalances that might currently exist and setting in place mechanisms which would seek to ensure the mainstreaming of race equality into all functions of Scottish education. It might also include ensuring that ethnic monitoring is put in place for all levels of education and that strategies are developed and implemented to improve minority ethnic participation on school boards, parent teacher associations, senates of universities and boards of management of colleges. Finally, policies need to be developed to address the under-representation of minority ethnic people within all levels of the education workforce from pre-school to further and higher education.

Promoting education for race equality

This is about preparing all learners for their various roles and responsibilities in an increasingly diverse society. Learners need to be presented with the opportunities to learn about different cultures, to understand the changing and dynamic nature of 'cultures', to engage with activities which encourage empathy with the experiences and points of view of others, to recognise and challenge prejudice and discrimination in its various forms. In addition, the curriculum, as well as the teaching and learning environment, needs to acknowledge the diversity of learners and incorporate this diversity into its delivery.

Multicultural and anti-racist education (MCARE) has been on the Scottish education agenda for nearly twenty years. However, its implementation and inclusion at all stages of the education sector has remained largely ad hoc. Recognition of the need to include MCARE appears to be related to the numbers of minority ethnic people present. Consequently, implementation has been more widespread within the Central Belt of Scotland. The application of MCARE in areas which are perceived to be less ethnically diverse has largely been dependent on the commitment and efforts of individual educationalists or due to pressure from individual minority ethnic families and groups. Where authorities in these areas have attempted to embed MCARE through policy, the responses from all levels of the educational sector has been generally supportive in concept but the transference to practice has been less systematic. The extent of MCARE implementation and the quality of such implementation in Scotland has never been studied.

Vision

The Working Group's vision of education and race equality is firmly rooted in the following guiding principles:

Education should maximise opportunity for all. For this to happen a system is required which:

- ▶▶ values diversity – including recognition of ethnic, cultural, faith and linguistic diversity;
- ▶▶ is prepared to acknowledge the existence of institutional racism and discrimination and to take necessary steps to eliminate such discrimination;
- ▶▶ is able to adopt a participatory and inclusive approach;
- ▶▶ is open, transparent and accountable to all learners;
- ▶▶ is encouraging of equal partnerships between policy makers, providers, parents, young people, all learners and communities;
- ▶▶ is committed to collating and disseminating good practice in race equality matters in education;
- ▶▶ is committed to improving its service by establishing effective data collection systems, monitoring, evaluation and the publishing of progress reports;
- ▶▶ is committed to evaluation by outcome;
- ▶▶ is committed to mainstreaming race equality and anti-racism into all aspects of Scottish education from policy formulation, design and delivery, through the shaping of education spending plans, inspection and assessment frameworks and the recruitment and selection of staff, to teaching and learning, curriculum development and research.

Maintaining the focus

The Working Group fully supports the current efforts of the Scottish Executive to mainstream equality into all areas of its work. The Group also supports any initiative that aims for social inclusion and cohesion. However, it is important that race equality issues are not absorbed to the point of invisibility within the generic equality framework or within concepts like mainstreaming or social inclusion.

Consultation process

The Education Working Group drew up its draft recommendations after a series of discussions with key stakeholders within education. On June 6th 2000 a consultation day was held where educationalists and community groups had an opportunity to comment on the draft recommendations. All education authorities and over 100 community groups working with minority ethnic communities were also invited to comment by post or electronically. The recommendations listed in this section draw on the views of those who took time to respond to our consultation.

Recommendations

The following recommendations are in three sections.

Section One: Recommendations for the Scottish Executive and its relevant departments/sections

Section Two: Recommendations for other organisations related to Scottish education

Section Three: Recommendations concerning specific communities whose general issues will be covered in the recommendations in the overarching report and in Sections One and Two below, but who also face issues which are sufficiently distinct for inclusion in this third section.

It is the intention of the Working Group that these recommendations help Scottish Executive departments and other organisations to meet their obligations under the general duty and specific duties to promote race equality as specified under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000.

Section One: Recommendations for the Scottish Executive

a) Ministerial priority action areas for education and lifelong learning

- 1 The Minister for Education and Minister for Enterprise and Lifelong Learning to demonstrate strong leadership in race equality matters across the education and lifelong learning sectors in the same way they have given a clear commitment to social inclusion. This can be done by issuing a statement immediately affirming their commitment to promoting equality of opportunity for all. Such a statement to include a clear acknowledgement of the need to identify and address institutional racism and discrimination;
- 2 Ministers to ensure that annual reporting procedures for education explicitly include race equality issues;
- 3 Ministers to:
 - ▶▶ mainstream race equality by ensuring education authorities and educational establishments comply with the general and specific duties of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000;
 - ▶▶ require that all bodies funded by their departments produce an annual statement on how those bodies are promoting equality of opportunity including race equality;
 - ▶▶ have regard to ethnic diversity as well as expertise in educational matters when considering appointments to all educational bodies;
 - ▶▶ continue to support the development of good practice guidance for all educational establishments (from nursery to higher education) on racial harassment policies and reporting mechanisms;
 - ▶▶ allocate dedicated development and sustainable funding to ensure the overall package of recommendations from REAF can be achieved.

b) Her Majesty's Inspectorate (Schools, Further Education and Community Education)

Her Majesty's Inspectorate (HMI):

- 1 To continue to ensure that there be a named inspector to take specific responsibility for equality issues, including race equality. The role and remit of this appointment to be published as soon as possible;
- 2 This lead inspector to provide biannual progress reports on the development of equality work, including race equality, within the workings of the Inspectorate and when appropriate to comment on the monitoring and promotion of race equality in the wider system;
- 3 Publish a programme of training and staff development for HMI on race equality arising from the external needs analysis already undertaken;
- 4 Identify ways in which race equality can be mainstreamed into current inspection frameworks;
- 5 Develop strategies to improve the representation of minority ethnic people on inspection teams;
- 6 Identify ways to encourage schools to actively utilise the guidance document "A Route to Equality and Fairness" as part of a school's self-evaluation framework;
- 7 Conduct a thematic inspection of education authorities, schools, colleges and community education services on the subject of equality, which would include explicit reference to race equality, by 2004. Such inspection teams to include people with expertise in equality education, as well as multicultural and anti-racist education and bilingual education;
- 8 From the wide consultation which the REAF Education Working Group has carried out, we recommend the inspection should take account of:
 - ▶▶ ways in which education authorities, schools, colleges and community education services have taken forward the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000;
 - ▶▶ adequacy and quality of policy and action plans addressing racial harassment in schools (pre nursery, primary, secondary, special schools), colleges and community education centres;
 - ▶▶ practice in relation to recording, monitoring and addressing issues of racial harassment and racist incidents;
 - ▶▶ methods by which educational establishments seek to mainstream race equality matters within institutional forward planning, particularly in the areas of curriculum development, teaching and learning, support for students and recruitment and selection of staff; for colleges and community education centres these areas to include widening of access and financing of courses and programmes;
 - ▶▶ initiatives developing effective home-school partnerships and community-college partnerships involving minority ethnic families;
 - ▶▶ initiatives that seek to improve the achievement and progression of minority ethnic learners;
 - ▶▶ adequacy and quality of provision of English as an Additional Language;
 - ▶▶ best practice in the support of bilingual learners, particularly learners speaking Scotland's community languages.

c) Scottish Executive Education Department (SEED)

The Scottish Executive Education Department to;

- 1 Appoint a lead officer within their senior management with specific responsibility for equality and inclusion issues, including race equality, and publish the aim, role, remit and wider purpose of this post. Requirements of the duties as imposed by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 to be taken into consideration in the remit of this post;
- 2 Require the lead officer to provide annual progress reports on the development of equality work, including race equality, as part of the annual departmental report for the Scottish Executive;

National priorities and annual reports

- 3 Publish an action plan on how it intends to meet the obligations (both general and specific) imposed by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 in respect of education;
- 4 Ensure national educational priority initiatives explicitly mainstream race equality issues; these initiatives to be analysed and monitored to make sure that they are improving the quality of education and the whole educational experience for all ethnic, linguistic and faith groups in the pupil population;
- 5 Ensure local authorities mainstream race equality issues into their 'Annual Statement of Improvement Objectives' when reporting on equality of opportunity.

Research

- 6 Introduce a presumption that all data collection and reporting should be done on an ethnically disaggregated basis and where appropriate by religious affiliation or belief and languages used;
- 7 Require that educational research, both qualitative and quantitative, should include an analysis of the impact of ethnicity, language and religion. It is further recommended that the Equal Opportunities Commission's guidance on mainstreaming gender equality into research be used as a model for mainstreaming race equality into research;
- 8 In conjunction with the Central Research Unit, prepare a research programme on race equality in education ensuring that such a programme is developed with advice from those with experience and expertise in race equality and education; such a programme to include minority ethnic researchers and organisations as potential contractors; all proposals to include consideration of participative research techniques as one aspect of the methodology;
- 9 It is recommended the following research areas be prioritised for early action:
 - ▶▶ models of good practice in schools, colleges and higher education institutions in addressing racial harassment and racist incidents;
 - ▶▶ the link between deprivation, racism and minority ethnic pupil/learner attainment and progression;
 - ▶▶ the performance experience of minority ethnic pupils within schools and learners within community, further and higher education. This should include an analysis of post education destinations of minority ethnic pupils and learners;
 - ▶▶ a survey of young minority ethnic people's attitudes to educational and employment opportunities;
 - ▶▶ models of enabling parental participation within institutional and community environments, with particular reference to minority ethnic parents;
 - ▶▶ bilingualism and its impact on learning and achievement; this to include specific issues such as bilingual pupils who also have special needs;
 - ▶▶ the experience of different minority groups within the education sector including Gypsies/Travellers and asylum seekers;

(Some of the research listed above may need to be taken forward in dialogue with Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department to ensure coherence, cf. Recommendation d 8 below.)

Training, staff development and good practice

- 10 Conduct an audit of available multicultural, multi-faith and anti-racist teaching materials for 5-14, Standard Grade and Higher Still and disseminate widely the availability of suitable materials. Where gaps exist, to commission new materials for use in educational establishments; such an audit to be planned with Learning and Teaching Scotland and related agencies with expertise in multicultural and anti-racist education;
- 11 In conjunction with HMI, evaluate the effectiveness of existing equality performance indicators in education in respect of race and develop improved indicators, if required, which will be relevant to Scottish circumstances;

Multi-faith Scotland

- 12 Set up a short life Faith and Beliefs Working Group to recommend action within the education sector that is required to ensure equality of opportunity for all faiths and beliefs. Membership of this group should reflect the diversity of faiths and beliefs and span all levels of education, including education unions. The work of the group should include the following areas for consideration:
 - ▶▶ needs of pupils, parents, learners and education employees;
 - ▶▶ assessments (e.g. timings of examinations);
 - ▶▶ organisational ethos (e.g. leave of absence for various religions and belief observances);

The group's focus to be on a flexible and inclusive approach within a multi-faith setting rather than on educating for observance of particular faiths or beliefs.

Multilingual Scotland

- 13 Publish a response and action plan to "Bilingualism, Community Languages and Scottish Education" (1999); such a response to indicate ways in which equal recognition of community languages with other modern European languages can be achieved;
- 14 Develop and publish a strategy in which English as an Additional Language (EAL) and bilingual provision can be maintained, developed and resourced in all schools with bilingual pupils and pupils who are refugees and/or asylum seekers. Such a review might consider whether there should be set ratios of EAL and bilingual support staff to numbers of bilingual pupils;
- 15 Review current Scottish Qualifications Authority (SQA) arrangements for pupils for whom English is not their first language to ensure they meet the requirements of those sitting examinations. Such a review should be done in conjunction with bilingual support services in education authorities across Scotland;
- 16 Review the appropriateness of communication units in Higher National programmes for learners whose first language is not English;
- 17 Undertake a review of interpreting and translation services and needs across Scotland which includes a specific emphasis on educational needs;

Ethnic monitoring

- 18 Provide guidance to institute new practice within schools to ensure completion of data returns on ethnicity and publish an accessible explanatory leaflet to schools and parents on the role and use made of ethnic monitoring information in education;
- 19 Publish results of annual statistical returns. Poor return rates should not deter publication. If return rates are poor, SEED in conjunction with the Scottish Executive's Central Statistics Unit should publish how they intend to improve future returns;
- 20 In conjunction with the Scottish Executive's Central Statistics Unit, collect statistical data on the composition of the Scottish teaching force on the basis of ethnicity, whilst respecting the individual's right to anonymity;

Improving minority ethnic parental representation and communication

- 21 Issue guidance that training for school boards should include enabling members to recognise and challenge institutional discrimination including institutional racism. Additionally provide guidance to school boards encouraging them to take up these training opportunities;
- 22 Develop positive strategies to address the under-representation of minority ethnic parents on school boards;
- 23 In conjunction with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA) and the Association of Directors of Education (ADES), develop a strategy to improve the supply of information to parents and learners and communication with them. This strategy should have an explicit section on minority ethnic parents and learners. As part of this, consideration should be given to better mechanisms for sharing information and the use of interpreting and translation;

Achievement and attainment of minority ethnic pupils

- 24 Collate data from local authorities to provide a national picture on minority ethnic pupil achievement, progress and behaviour, such as attendance, exclusion and early leaver rates by ethnic group (to include Gypsy/Traveller pupils). Where possible, monitoring should be done on a school by school basis to identify trends and patterns and care should be taken to ensure that individual pupils cannot be identified;
- 25 In conjunction with COSLA, identify how monies allocated to individual education authorities for supporting English as an Additional Language provision are currently being used to support the attainment and progress of minority ethnic pupils whose first language is not English;

Mainstreaming race equality into the assessment framework

- 26 In conjunction with the SQA and other relevant agencies, provide a report on how race equality will be taken into account in the development of content of examination papers and training for setters;
- 27 In conjunction with the SQA and other relevant agencies, examine how race equality matters should be taken into account as part of the assessment framework and training for markers. The assessment framework to cover internal and external assessments across all sectors, including further education, community education and training centres as well as schools;

Continuing Professional Development (CPD)

- 28 As part of the current development of a national framework for CPD, all providers to be required to show the highest regard for race equality issues. Furthermore, the new framework should ensure all teachers receive training on developing and implementing multicultural and anti-racist education and that they develop proficiency in working with and supporting minority ethnic pupils, particularly bilingual pupils;

Review of Initial Teacher Education

- 29 To ensure that the two-stage review of Initial Teacher Education currently underway seeks to incorporate an analysis of equality issues. Race equality should be an explicit component of this review and, where possible, those with expertise in race equality and education should be incorporated as active reviewers in the second stage of the review;

Community Education

- 30 SEED, in conjunction with Community Learning Scotland, to undertake a Scotland-wide review of the current curriculum of community education courses and key courses associated with the promotion and training of community educators approved by Community Learning Scotland's professional training endorsement committee (CeVe). This to be done so that the practical application of multicultural, anti-racist education and the valuing of diversity at all levels of courses can be clearly demonstrated. The review team to include those with experience of multicultural and anti-racist education and to be taken forward by SEED in the most effective way;

d) The Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department (SEELLD)

The Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department (SEELLD) to:

- 1 Appoint a lead officer within senior management with specific responsibility for equality and inclusion issues, including race equality, and publish the aim, role, remit and wider purpose of this post. Requirements of the duties as imposed by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 to be taken into consideration in the remit of this post;
- 2 Require the lead officer to provide annual progress reports on the development of equality work, including race equality, as part of the annual departmental report for the Scottish Executive;
- 3 In discussion with the Quality Assurance Agency (QAA), identify mechanisms for mainstreaming race equality into the existing quality assurance frameworks;

National priorities

- 4 Publish an action plan on how it intends to meet the duties (both general and specific) imposed by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 in respect of lifelong learning and further and higher education;
- 5 Analyse and monitor these initiatives to ensure that they are improving the quality of education and the whole educational experience for all ethnic, linguistic and faith groups in the learner population.

Research

- 6 Introduce a presumption that all data collection and reporting should be done on an ethnically disaggregated basis and where appropriate by religious affiliation or belief and languages used; SEELLD to initiate discussions with the Scottish Further Education Funding Council and the Scottish Higher Education Funding Council;
- 7 SEELLD to initiate discussions as to how methodologies used within educational research, both qualitative and quantitative, should include an analysis of the impact of ethnicity, language and religion. It is further recommended that the Equal Opportunities Commission's guidance on mainstreaming gender equality into research be used as a model for mainstreaming race equality into research;
- 8 It is recommended the following research areas be prioritised for early action. These recommendations should be read in conjunction with Recommendation c 9 above to ensure coherence between SEELLD and SEED:
 - ▶▶ a survey of young minority ethnic people's attitudes to educational and employment opportunities;
 - ▶▶ the performance experience of minority ethnic learners within community, further and higher education;
 - ▶▶ ethnicity, participation and employment patterns in Scottish further and higher education;
 - ▶▶ the impact of widening access and lifelong learning initiatives on minority ethnic learners;

Training, staff development and good practice

- 9 Commission an audit of race equality training materials suitable for staff development (to include teaching and non-teaching staff) for use across the further, higher and community education sector. This should be done in dialogue with SEED to avoid duplication.

Multi-Faith Scotland

- 10 SEELLD to seek membership of the short life Faith and Beliefs Working Group referred to in Recommendation c 12 above;

Multilingual Scotland

- 11 SEELLD to investigate the feasibility of developing and delivering a programme for provision of English as an Additional Language for adults with a priority action plan for asylum seekers and refugees; this discussion to take place in conjunction with Community Learning Scotland, the Scottish Refugee Council, the Further Education Colleges and the Scottish Further Education Funding Council;

Ethnic monitoring

- 12 In conjunction with the relevant bodies, publish annual statistics of the numbers of minority ethnic learners within further, higher and community education within Scotland. Targets should then be identified and strategies developed to improve on these statistics and to encourage wider access and participation of minority ethnic learners within all levels and range of courses offered;

Improving minority ethnic representation and communication

- 13 Issue guidance for improving minority ethnic representation at all levels of further, higher and community education, in particular representation at board and senior management level;
- 14 Develop positive action strategies to address the under-representation of minority ethnic learners in some subject areas;

Achievement and attainment of minority ethnic learners;

- 15 Encourage colleges and higher education institutions to monitor the recruitment, retention, progress and destination of students from under-represented groups, to include minority ethnic learners.

Section Two: Recommendations For Education Related Bodies

a) Scottish Further and Higher Education Funding Councils

1 The Scottish Funding Councils to:

- ▶▶ issue a statement of their commitment to race equality and their strategy for meeting the duties as laid down by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. As a result of this, to develop a strategy to tackle institutional racism and monitor progress in taking forward these commitments within their own areas of operation and practices. Thereafter they should publish progress reports on race equality within their annual reports;
- ▶▶ advise further and higher education institutions of their obligations to promote race equality and address racial discrimination;
- ▶▶ integrate race equality into the corporate planning process and report on progress within their annual report by including a brief review of the extent to which the previous year's aims, objectives and targets in race equality have been achieved; as well as the reasons for any non achievement of these and further action to address the shortfall;
- ▶▶ develop guidance for the sector on the monitoring, evaluating and reporting of race equality issues within the emerging framework of positive duties under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000;
- ▶▶ mainstream race equality, where appropriate, into the terms of reference of all Funding Council committees;
- ▶▶ encourage and support all further and higher education institutions in incorporating race equality into all their strategic and operational plans;
- ▶▶ consider how most effectively to link funding methods to the achieving of institutional equality, including race equality;
- ▶▶ set up a joint strategic change fund to take forward race equality in the further and higher education sectors, similar to initiatives around disability equality;
- ▶▶ continue to ensure that all those employed within their establishments have race equality training appropriate to their duties;
- ▶▶ in conjunction with the Quality Assurance Agency, develop mechanisms to include race equality within the Quality Assurance Framework (cf. Recommendation I 1).

b) Scottish Higher Education Funding Council

1 When taking forward the Equality Challenge to Scotland, to ensure that race equality is not neglected and to report on progress through their annual report.

c) University Scotland and the Association of Scottish Colleges

1 University Scotland and the Association of Scottish Colleges to immediately issue a statement of their commitment to promoting race equality, tackling institutional racism and monitoring progress on race equality issues within their own areas of operation and practices. Thereafter they should encourage the sector to provide progress reports.

d) Individual Further and Higher Education Institutions

Further and higher education institutions to:

- 1 Issue a statement to all staff of their commitment to race equality and their strategy for meeting the duties as laid down by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. As a result of this to develop a strategy to tackle institutional racism and monitor progress in taking forward these commitments within their own areas of operation and practices. Thereafter they should publish progress reports;
- 2 Establish areas for priority considerations such as;
 - ▶▶ the establishment of monitoring which would allow home and overseas student figures to be disaggregated;
 - ▶▶ the monitoring of access, retention, attainment and progression rates for minority ethnic learners;
 - ▶▶ the mainstreaming of race equality into the curriculum;
 - ▶▶ the mainstreaming of race equality into all staff development initiatives;
- 3 Ensure that all those employed within their establishments have race equality training appropriate to their duties;
- 4 Review current access-widening and lifelong-learning initiatives to ensure the inclusion of race equality and that future initiatives include race equality from the outset;
- 5 Set up mechanisms to explore equivalencies in overseas qualifications through liaison with agencies like the National Academic Registration Information Centre for the United Kingdom (NARIC);
- 6 Adopt national standards as laid down by UKCOSA, The Council for International Education, on student recruitment, student support and language support for international students;
- 7 Consider using mentoring as a way of encouraging learners from minority ethnic backgrounds to maximise their potential and select career pathways which have traditionally not attracted participants from minority ethnic communities.

e) Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA) and the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland (ADES)

COSLA and ADES to:

- 1 Issue an immediate statement of their commitment to promoting race equality, tackling institutional racism and monitoring progress in taking forward these commitments within their own services. That such a statement remind education authorities of their duties under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 and Section 5:2 (b) of the Standards in Scotland's Schools etc Act 2000;
- 2 Set up and maintain networks for the dissemination of good practice on race equality and wider social inclusion issues. Such networks would encourage the sharing of policies and initiatives on developing 'The Inclusive School' for a multiethnic, multicultural, multi-faith and multilingual Scotland;
- 3 That education authorities jointly develop a strategy for informing and communicating with parents and learners; this strategy to have an explicit section on minority ethnic parents and learners. As part of that development, consideration to be given to better mechanisms for sharing information and the use of interpreting and translation.

f) Education Authorities

- 1 All Directors of Education and Heads of Education Services within authorities to issue a statement immediately to schools and employees within their own department on the importance of promoting race equality and addressing racial discrimination. Such a statement should also remind educational establishments within an authority of their obligations under the Race Relations Act 1976, the Race Relations (Amended) Act 2000 and Section 5:2 (b) of the Standards in Scotland's Schools etc Act 2000;
- 2 Each authority to review and develop a strategy on how race equality is mainstreamed into the various areas of their work e.g. within specific services such as the educational psychology services or within specific issues such as addressing the under representation of minority ethnic people within each education authority's workforce;
- 3 Each authority to provide information as part of their 'Annual Statement of Improvement Objectives' of performance, management, monitoring and evaluation in the area of race equality.

g) Initial Teacher Education (ITE)

All providers of initial teacher education to:

- 1 Through the review of initial teacher education proposed in the McCrone Report, ensure that the practical application of multicultural and anti-racist education and valuing diversity at all levels of courses is clearly evidenced. The review to ensure that multicultural and anti-racist education is not an optional or elective topic within ITE courses. It is essential that the review team includes those with experience of delivering multicultural and anti-racist education. The review's findings to be made publicly available;
- 2 Ensure that they work together with SEED to address the clear under-representation of minority ethnic people at all levels of education.

h) Community Education

- 1 COSLA, in conjunction with local authority community education services and Community Learning Scotland, to identify, monitor and evaluate expenditure for capacity building programmes with minority ethnic communities as part of the authority wide Community Learning Strategy. Regular progress reports to be published;
- 2 Community Learning Scotland, in consultation with local authority community education services, voluntary sector organisations, youth groups and agencies working with young people and minority ethnic communities, to develop and implement strategies for involving minority ethnic young people in initiatives such as Young Scot and the Scottish Youth Parliament.
- 3 Community Learning Scotland, in conjunction with COSLA and local authority community education services, to develop strategies to ensure that equality issues, including race equality issues, are strategically embedded into community learning plans. These strategies to include measures to:
 - ▶▶ ensure provision exists for adult learners of English including asylum seekers and refugees;
 - ▶▶ include the adult educational needs of Gypsies/Travellers;
 - ▶▶ develop a race equality component within community-based adult education and youth and community work provision. This component should enable provision to be sensitive to the different cultural, linguistic and faith needs of learners, to improve take up of services by minority ethnic communities and to include the promotion of anti-racist approaches.

i) The General Teaching Council

The General Teaching Council to:

- 1 Re-examine their qualifying standards and competencies to ensure they are sufficiently robust for achieving a workforce equipped to serve a multiracial, multicultural, multi-faith and multilingual society. This review should also analyse how these are being met within initial teacher education courses. This review to **complement Recommendation g 1** above.

j) Learning and Teaching Scotland

Learning and Teaching Scotland to:

- 1 Set up a working group to review the 5-14 programme documents to ensure explicit, specific and directed inclusion of multicultural and anti-racist education and to report thereon with recommendations for improvement;
- 2 In light of the above report and other developments such as the thematic equality review by the HMI, prepare up-to-date curriculum guidance within eighteen months of the review report;
- 3 Give specific consideration as to how race equality issues will be explicitly included within the Education for Citizenship initiative, demonstrating a clear anti-racist approach.

k) Careers Services

Careers Scotland, on its establishment in April 2002, to:

- 1 Commission a review of good practice by careers services in Scotland in the area of race equality and then disseminate this information to all careers services, education authorities and community education services in Scotland in order to promote improved service delivery.

l) Quality Assurance Agency (QAA)

The QAA to:

- 1 In conjunction with SHEFC and other agencies with expertise in race equality in education, develop mechanisms to include race equality in:
 - ▶▶ the promotion and maintenance of quality and standards in higher education;
 - ▶▶ the enhancement of teaching and learning;
 - ▶▶ good practice in teaching and learning in relation to equality, including race equality, issues;
 - ▶▶ the publication of any QAA reports on quality and standards in higher education;
 - ▶▶ any advice provided to the Scottish Executive on areas like access and course recognition.

Section Three: Recommendations Relating To Specific Communities

While the above recommendations would benefit all minority ethnic groups overall, the following communities have specific requirements. The intention in this section is to ensure that specific issues are not lost within the overall framework. This section identifies three such communities:

- a) Minority ethnic people in rural communities
- b) Gypsy/Traveller communities
- c) Asylum seekers and refugees

a) Rural communities

- 1 Agencies operating at a Scottish level (SEED, HMI, SEELLD, Community Learning Scotland, COSLA, Further and Higher Education Funding Councils, University Scotland, the Scottish University for Industry and the Association of Scottish Colleges) should ensure that all educational establishments and institutions operating under their remit in rural areas are mainstreaming race equality in education as identified in the relevant sections of this document. An advisory group drawn from rural areas should be established to monitor progress;
- 2 All agencies with a remit for education, training and lifelong learning in rural areas (e.g. education authorities, schools, further and higher education establishments, Community Learning Scotland, Highland and Islands Enterprise, Scottish Enterprise and the Local Enterprise Community networks) should demonstrate their commitment to promoting race equality by:
 - ▶▶ issuing a statement of their commitment to address institutional racism and to the monitoring of progress in taking forward these commitments within their own areas of operation and practices;
 - ▶▶ developing systems for gathering information on the needs of a scattered and dispersed minority ethnic population and producing a plan on how these needs will be met.

b) Gypsy/Traveller communities

- 1 SEED, in conjunction with COSLA and individual education authorities, to provide information, guidance and support to Gypsy/Traveller communities on key areas such as access, uptake and retention of school places. The mechanism by which this information is disseminated should be addressed;
- 2 SEED in conjunction with other relevant agencies, to develop national guidance on developing effective home school partnerships with Gypsy/Traveller parents; this review to develop the idea of Family Liaison Officers specifically for Gypsy/Traveller communities;
- 3 SEED to examine how schools serving an area with an official Gypsy/Traveller site can be funded to allow for fluctuating numbers, to purchase resources for loans to families while travelling and the development of distance learning packs and hand-held records;
- 4 SEED, Learning & Teaching Scotland and individual authorities to provide exemplars to schools on how to develop individualised approaches to curriculum delivery for mobile Gypsies/Travellers e.g. part-time timetables in schools. This should include using the special examination arrangements available e.g. encouraging Gypsies/Travellers to book in at an alternative examination centre for Standard Grade and Higher Still;
- 5 SEED to enable education authorities to provide a place in an educational establishment or alternative access to education (from pre-school to lifelong learning provision) no matter the form, place or length of residence in the locale.

c) Asylum-Seekers and refugees

- 1** SEELLD, in conjunction with the UK government, to investigate the provision of contingency funding to enable access to education and, in particular, English language courses;
- 2** SEED and SEELLD, in conjunction with the Scottish Refugee Council, COSLA, the Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations and Community Learning Scotland, to investigate the development of access programmes for assisting refugees to engage with lifelong learning opportunities; such an investigation should also reflect on how the educational needs of asylum seekers granted leave to remain in the UK can be met within Scotland, in so far as this is possible within devolved responsibilities.

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Action Plan

Although it was felt that these topics would best be considered within a single action plan, the differences between them have resulted in the division of the plan into two separate parts: 1 Enterprise and 2 Lifelong Learning.

1 Enterprise

Introduction

Available relevant data on minority ethnic business activity is extremely limited. There is, for example, little information at a Scottish or regional level about the nature of minority ethnic businesses, the markets in which they operate, nor about the contribution which they make to the economy. Similarly, there is only a limited amount of both labour market and education information available relating to minority ethnic communities. It was necessary, therefore, to rely on oral interviews, anecdotal evidence, and on the limited Scottish-based written sources and research data available to us within the limited time which we were able to devote to the task. The REAF Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Working Group is grateful to all those REAF members who supplied them with relevant data.

The contribution of minority ethnic businesses to the Scottish economy

An assessment of the scale and nature of minority ethnic business activity in three areas of Scotland was made by the Working Group (and is described in the Appendix). It is clear from this assessment that minority ethnic businesses are significant employers and generators of wealth in many areas. In addition, it is worth noting that according to research quoted in the Bank of England report on the financing of minority ethnic firms (1999), small businesses run by Asian entrepreneurs are more likely to grow than small businesses in general.

At a time when the Executive and the enterprise network is seeking to promote an enterprise culture and generate more growth-orientated small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs), this suggests that minority ethnic businesses as a group may have a significant role to play. There are, however, a range of constraining factors which will need to be addressed before the contribution of minority ethnic businesses can be maximised.

Access to support networks and participation in mainstream business organisations

For a mixture of cultural and institutional reasons, minority ethnic businesses may be less likely to access external forms of support which may help them tackle these challenges. When setting up in business, many minority ethnic businesses do not know about the advice which is available to them free of charge, or cannot use this because of language barriers and often, as a consequence, have to pay for advice. There is also a great deal of good practice available through specialist support agencies such as the Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centres. However, mainstream forms of support, advice and assistance are in general not specifically targeted at minority ethnic businesses and, as a result, there is often a very low take up of provision. This can have a range of consequences, among which may be limiting the growth of the business, or not being kept up to date with changes in legislation.

In common with SMEs in general, the vast majority of minority ethnic businesses have little or no contact or involvement with Local Enterprise Companies (LECs), Chambers of Commerce or other business organisations. There is some anecdotal evidence that minority ethnic businesses are even less likely than SMEs in general to join such organisations, although in some cases organisations such as the Aberdeen and Glasgow Chambers of Commerce are working on initiatives to encourage mutual understanding and, hopefully, future participation.

Scottish Executive policy on minority ethnic businesses

The Scottish Executive's policy on SMEs – under which minority ethnic businesses would tend to fall – can be seen to be 'inclusive' in the sense that it does not differentiate minority ethnic businesses from other SMEs. The logic of this is an understandable one: minority ethnic businesses are exposed to the same competitive pressures and market forces within their sectors as any other businesses.

Nevertheless, the working group sees no obvious conflict between continuing the Executive's broad strategy for promoting small business activity while combining this with the kind of sensitivity to minority ethnic businessmen and women which influenced the CRE's response to the Enterprise Network Review Issues Paper published in February 2000. In their response, the CRE argued that minority ethnic-owned businesses had a key role to play in Scotland's economic future, and that it was necessary that an appropriate strategy was developed which would incorporate the needs and contributions of minority ethnic businesses.

Key Issues

Challenges for Minority Ethnic Businesses

It has already been observed that minority ethnic businesses make a significant contribution to the Scottish economy, and that they may be less likely to access external forms of support. There are other factors which are in danger of limiting this contribution. It is also important to note that, as shown in the Appendix, many minority ethnic businesses are small or medium-sized firms in sectors such as retail and catering subject to intense competition, shifting consumer habits, and relatively heavy regulation (e.g. licensing, health and safety, planning permission). We would therefore add our voice to that of the business organisations lobbying the Scottish Executive and the UK Government to reduce regulatory burdens for SMEs wherever possible.

There are also a range of issues which can affect minority ethnic businesses more than other firms:

- ▶▶ Minority ethnic businesses tend not to be engaged to the same extent by the enterprise networks and other informal sources of support, such as local Chambers of Commerce and national business organisations. They therefore run the risk of missing out on some training and management support opportunities, and not addressing the language and cultural barriers which some minority ethnic businesses face;
- ▶▶ There are some areas of skill shortage for minority ethnic businesses (for example, specialist chefs) which are not always readily addressed, in part due to problems with labour supply and in part due to the lack of engagement between minority ethnic businesses generally and support agencies such as LECs or the Employment Service;
- ▶▶ Some minority ethnic businesses may not have access to emerging technologies (even at a most basic level in terms of, for example, office tools or stock control) due to two main factors; firstly that the software and systems tend only to be written (and any training delivered) in English, and secondly, as with other forms of support, these businesses may not be kept up to date with such developments in either a timely or accessible way (or targeted by suppliers of both software and training);
- ▶▶ The issues of diversification and succession-planning are often difficult, compounded by the lack of access to appropriate support from specialist agencies;
- ▶▶ At a more general level, there is insufficient recognition and promotion of minority ethnic businesses as a resource and thus as potential key wealth-creators and contributors to the Scottish economy;
- ▶▶ Minority ethnic businesses are often the targets of racist crimes.

Actions

There are a number of actions which the Working Group consider can be taken in a range of areas. These actions are targeted primarily at the Scottish Executive, but also at the enterprise network (encompassing Scottish Enterprise and Highlands and Islands Enterprise as well as relevant local authority and Scottish Executive departments), representative business organisations and service providers (such as LECs and further and higher education providers).

a) Leadership and clear direction is needed from the Scottish Executive and national organisations

- 1 This plan to be adopted by the Scottish Executive with specific responsibility for its delivery to be given to a designated Departmental Minister and a named senior official with a specific remit for race equality;
- 2 Minority ethnic people in business must be seen as a resource for the new economy. Therefore, the development of strategies for the new economy must both involve, and tap into minority ethnic communities and minority ethnic businesses;
- 3 In moulding its Enterprise and Lifelong Learning strategies, the Scottish Executive must take account of the needs of minority ethnic businesses:
 - ▶▶ encouraging them to be innovative and far-sighted organisations;
 - ▶▶ encouraging them to have a positive attitude to learning and enterprise;
 - ▶▶ ensuring that any strategy for an "inclusive economy" reflects the needs of both indigenous and minority ethnic businesses;

b) Improved research and monitoring of minority ethnic business activity is a priority

- 1 The Scottish Executive to develop a framework to improve the provision of information to minority ethnic businesses; this to be done in consultation with minority ethnic businesses, advisers and business organisations;
- 2 The Scottish Executive to institute a programme of research to gather baseline data on the extent and nature of minority ethnic businesses in Scotland, and their contribution to the Scottish economy. The Executive should also ensure that this data is updated on a regular basis;
- 3 Measures to be put in place to monitor levels of entrepreneurship within minority ethnic communities, including start-up rates, levels of business ownership and of self-employment;
- 4 The Scottish Executive to continue to support the Future Skills Scotland Unit to ensure that the need for improved labour market information and intelligence relating to race is addressed; this information to be made available in appropriate ways to support the needs of both businesses and individuals in minority ethnic communities;

c) The creation of new networks and structures to help national policy makers and local agencies engage with minority ethnic businesses and communities

- 1 Business organisations to consider and implement good practice in attracting minority ethnic businesses into membership;
- 2 The Scottish Executive to support the establishment of a Minority Ethnic Business Advisory Group, consisting of sources of expertise on minority ethnic businesses, encompassing relevant trade associations and Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centres, the academic community and other relevant individuals. This Advisory Group would be a resource which policy makers and agencies would be expected to consult when developing new programmes or assessing the suitability of existing ones. In addition, to ensure that minority ethnic business issues are 'mainstreamed' as far as possible, a minority ethnic business representative should be added to the Minister for Enterprise and Lifelong Learning's Small Business Consultative Group;
- 3 Continued funding to be made available to support the Ethnic Minority Business Centres, provided that the Centres can demonstrate their impact through appropriate performance indicators;
- 4 The enterprise network to set up a mechanism to ensure the spread of good practice in initiatives that have been successful with minority ethnic businesses, individuals and communities;

d) Improving accessibility and quality of services available to minority ethnic businesses

- 1 The Scottish Executive to make an initial investment in the development of tools and a set of common standards (perhaps in the form of a workbook or guide) to facilitate race equality auditing by all providers of services to SMEs;
- 2 A greater emphasis to be placed on external auditing of the race equality practices of both enterprise agencies and training providers (as well as the Scottish Executive itself);
- 3 The enterprise network to make its small business services more accessible by minority ethnic businesses through consultation with minority ethnic business organisations and advisers, and through auditing the suitability and effectiveness of existing services;
- 4 The enterprise network to ensure that new services are equality-proofed at the planning stage;
- 5 At the earliest practicable date, the enterprise network to audit its communications strategy to ensure that it is effective in ensuring that minority ethnic businesses are aware of the services which may be available to them, and how to access them;
- 6 At the earliest practicable date, Scottish Executive departments similarly to audit their communications strategy to ensure that essential business information and intelligence (for example in relation to labour market issues, legislation, emerging technologies and access to funding streams) reaches minority ethnic businesses;

e) Other specific programmes for consideration

- 1 In the light of the Bank of England's 1999 report on financing minority ethnic businesses, the Scottish Executive to look carefully at any findings that emerge from the current research project on this subject supported by the Bank of England and the CRE and which is being co-ordinated in Scotland by Professor David Deakins;
- 2 If the monitoring of business start-ups among minority ethnic communities recommended above suggests low levels of entrepreneurship, Ministers to issue strategic guidance to the enterprise network on developing a programme of action to support minority ethnic businesses. Such schemes might be modelled on existing programmes for Women into Business;
- 3 The Scottish Executive to initiate a dialogue with business organisations such as the Institute of Directors, the Confederation of British Industry Scotland, the Scottish Council (Development and Industry), the Chambers of Commerce and the Federation of Small Businesses about how to promote the contribution which minority ethnic business people can make to the boards of Scottish companies, and to ensure that minority ethnic directors of businesses have access to appropriate training regarding their directorial roles and responsibilities;
- 4 The Scottish Executive to review the provision and accessibility of English language training for minority ethnic business people;
- 5 The enterprise network to develop the Business Mentoring Scotland scheme as a way of involving minority ethnic businesses in mainstream programmes, through improved marketing and the creation of specialist mentors and support;
- 6 In addition, the enterprise network to develop support to assist with diversification and succession planning;
- 7 The enterprise network, in conjunction with both representative organisations and the Employment Service in Scotland, to identify and address the issues of skill shortage faced by minority ethnic businesses in Scotland;
- 8 In conjunction with community safety and law enforcement organisations, the Scottish Executive to ensure that minority ethnic businesses can operate without being subject to racially motivated crimes, including damage to property and harassment of staff.

Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Action Plan

2 Lifelong Learning

Introduction

In 1999, as the Scottish Parliament was established, the late Donald Dewar set out the vision of his government for an inclusive and fair Scotland, with social justice (which includes a clear commitment to race equality) as the cornerstone. Lifelong learning was one of the four key action areas to arise out of the vision. The Scottish Executive views both formal and informal lifelong learning very positively, and is clear in linking them to issues of wider economic prosperity, and also to the social justice agenda. It is clear that both of these strands are relevant to Scotland's minority ethnic communities.

Specific work in the area of lifelong learning is guided by the Opportunity Scotland strategy dating from 1998, but carried through into the policy of the Scottish Executive. This established a 10 point plan relating to a range of issues, including opening up access to further education, and making colleges more effective and efficient, as well as a number of specific projects such as the National Grid for Learning, Individual Learning Accounts, the Scottish University for Industry (SUfi) and its learndirect scotland-branded services (including a freephone helpline and web site to provide information and advice on courses and learning centres).

Implementation of much of this work is currently underway. However, most of these initiatives have little in terms of a specific race equality dimension. Where race equality is mentioned at all, it tends to be only in terms of the need to provide assistance to those whose first language is not English, and does not generally address the wider structural and economic barriers which those from minority ethnic communities face in accessing learning. As with much work in this area, there is a generalised commitment to equality of opportunity, but without specific details of how this is to be delivered.

At an individual provider level (for example, schools and colleges, as well as those providing support services such as careers or adult guidance), there are many good examples of ways in which access to learning has been opened up, and one of the key tasks in the short term is to identify, digest and promote these examples widely to other providers. What appears to be lacking, however, is an overall strategic context for this work as it relates to the specific needs of minority ethnic communities and minority ethnic businesses. There is, as yet, little specific focus on the lifelong learning needs of minority ethnic communities in terms of the work of both Scottish Enterprise and Highlands and Islands Enterprise. It is to be hoped that Scottish Enterprise's current efforts to mainstream equalities issues across its activities will see some of these concerns addressed.

Key Issues

Barriers to participation in learning and employment

As with barriers facing businesses, all groups, regardless of race, experience some barriers to learning. However, there is anecdotal evidence to suggest the presence, and in some cases, prevalence of a range of additional problems facing people from minority ethnic communities within the labour market in terms of accessing and benefiting from lifelong learning.

Among the additional barriers facing individuals from minority ethnic communities in relation to lifelong learning:

- ▶▶ There are still examples of inappropriate provision by service providers which do not meet the needs of minority ethnic service users;
- ▶▶ There is anecdotal evidence that careers guidance information may not be reaching people from minority ethnic communities, who need, therefore, to rely on informal sources;
- ▶▶ Language is a crucial barrier to participation in lifelong learning, and budgets are not always made available for this;
- ▶▶ Lifelong learning is often geared to mainstream employment (for example in terms of times and modes of study, fees and supporting costs and the need for work-based placements) and this may not always be an appropriate model for individuals working in minority ethnic businesses, given the small size and the patterns of working hours and practices of many of these businesses;
- ▶▶ There is anecdotal evidence that people from minority ethnic communities in employment do not always find it easy to secure training opportunities appropriate to their skills and aspirations;
- ▶▶ There is a low level of participation by people from minority ethnic communities in state-funded vocational programmes (for both young people and adults) and anecdotal evidence suggests lower levels of take up of programmes generally. In many cases, lifelong learning opportunities are linked to participation in, for example, Skillseekers or Training for Work (although it is acknowledged that the Employment Service has developed a specific strand of the New Deal for minority ethnic communities).

There are also a range of issues which arise in relation to the needs of specific groups within minority ethnic communities:

- ▶▶ There are specific groups within the broader minority ethnic population who face additional problems, for example in terms of a long history of unemployment, or only casual employment, alongside a lack of formal qualifications and language issues. That said, there are many individuals within minority ethnic communities in areas of deprivation who, with appropriate support, would progress very rapidly through the labour market;
- ▶▶ For people living in areas experiencing deprivation, although many of the same factors apply to minority ethnic communities as with the majority population, some issues may again be magnified by cultural and language issues, for example, in terms of the difficulties in accessing appropriate services or transportation issues;
- ▶▶ For those seeking skills within, or prior to entering the labour market, providers (and businesses) are not always aware of specific cultural and language issues which arise, for example, for Muslim women;
- ▶▶ Some groups of women need additional encouragement and an appropriate setting to gain access to skills training and so enter the labour market. The employment rate among some groups of women from minority ethnic communities is very low, and many will not, therefore, have a work history, skills or experience relevant to the current labour market;
- ▶▶ Many younger women from minority ethnic communities are well qualified, but face double discrimination in the labour market, preventing them from achieving employment at a level appropriate to their qualifications;
- ▶▶ The situation facing spouses of minority ethnic students seeking to gain employment is often very difficult.

There are also wider structural issues in relation to macro economic policy which impact on the effectiveness of lifelong learning. Among these issues are:

- ▶▶ Anecdotal evidence suggests that there are still many cases of illegal discrimination in the Scottish labour market which affect the opportunities available to virtually all people from minority ethnic communities;
- ▶▶ The changing nature of skills needs of the labour market in the face of both global competition and technological development poses a threat to many people from minority ethnic communities who are not currently participating in the labour market, or undertaking any learning, as, in effect, the gap between their existing skills and those required by businesses may widen further, placing them at even greater disadvantage in securing employment;
- ▶▶ The current drive by the government to “import” skilled workers poses some issues if not addressed in a comprehensive manner. Minority ethnic workers coming to Scotland may have considerable skills in, for example, IT, but may not have similar levels of the specific language skills needed in this sector. The consequence of this could be that these in-coming workers may ultimately fail to progress in the labour market and themselves become excluded through time, despite the technical skills which they have.

Actions

As in the case of enterprise, there are a number of actions which the Working Group consider can be taken in a range of areas. These actions are targeted primarily at the Scottish Executive, but also at the enterprise network (encompassing Scottish Enterprise and Highlands and Islands Enterprise as well as relevant local authority and Scottish Executive departments), and service providers (such as LECs and further and higher education providers). These include:

a) Leadership and clear direction from the Executive and national organisations

- 1 The Scottish Executive to ensure that its Enterprise and Lifelong Learning strategies are sensitive to the needs of diverse entrepreneurs and enterprises in Scotland, and robust and inclusive in their implementation, and that they effectively address the challenges facing minority ethnic communities in the labour market;
- 2 The Scottish Executive to target and eradicate illegal racism in selection and recruitment practices in businesses of all kinds, with a considerable increase in the resources applied to ensuring compliance with existing and forthcoming legislation in this area;
- 3 The Scottish Executive to assess the need for, and, if necessary, develop further national campaigns targeted at both businesses and individuals to promote the positive benefits of diversity within work;

b) Improved research and monitoring of minority ethnic learning and employment

- 1 Support to be given to the emerging framework for labour market intelligence at a national level through the Future Skills Scotland Unit to ensure that the need for improved labour market information and intelligence relating to race is addressed; this information to be made available in appropriate ways to support the needs of both businesses and individuals in ethnic minority communities (cf. Enterprise Recommendation b 4 above);
- 2 This improved intelligence to underpin the delivery of a careers and guidance system which is responsive to the needs of minority ethnic communities, in part by considering more closely role model portrayal, cultural sensitivities and accessibility;
- 3 A system of monitoring to be introduced which allows for the disaggregation of data of minority ethnic students leaving college and university in Scotland;

c) Other specific programmes for consideration

- 1 The Executive to encourage providers and businesses to undertake more innovative work to promote lifelong learning to groups among whom take up is currently very low;
- 2 The Executive to develop and implement, as a matter of urgency, specific strategies for engaging and involving in the labour market minority ethnic people and communities in poorer areas, and women who are presently outside the labour market or in jobs below their abilities;
- 3 Providers of advice and guidance on employment and learning issues, including the Scottish University for Industry (SUfi) and leardirect scotland, to ensure that this advice and guidance is available in languages other than English;
- 4 In addition, SUfi to be directed by Ministers to pay particular attention to the need to reach minority ethnic communities and to include in its annual report an assessment of its success in this regard;
- 5 The Scottish Executive to examine the real and perceived barriers to the take up of national programmes (for example in Skillseekers and Training for Work) and to address them, learning from the experience of the New Deal.

Appendix: Summary Results of Assessment

An assessment of the scale and nature of minority ethnic business activity was undertaken by the working group to inform the development of this action plan. Though bearing a Scotland-wide focus, the scope of the survey was primarily minority ethnic businesses in Glasgow, Edinburgh and Aberdeen. The reason for this was simply that these are the areas with which the working group members were familiar. As regards minority ethnic representation, the focus of the assessment was primarily on businesses which are predominantly owned and operated by people of South Asian and South-East Asian backgrounds.

South Asian Business Sectors

The South Asian minority ethnic businesses surveyed can be divided into five main sectors. These comprise hotel and leisure, wholesale/cash and carry, convenience stores and corner-shops, nursing homes and property investment. Most of the businesses referred to in these sectors are primarily, though not exclusively, based in Glasgow and Edinburgh and to a lesser extent, Aberdeen.

Hotel and Leisure

Minority ethnic communities have diversified over the last ten years into the hotel and leisure industry. The working group's investigation revealed that there are now some key players who own between 4 and 5 hotels each. However, there is no established research to identify the actual size of this industry or the number of people involved in terms of ownership or employees.

The Asian food industry has blossomed in the UK over the last five years or so, resulting in almost 450 outlets of Asian restaurants and takeaways across Scotland, employing ten people each on average. Among these are some larger outlets which employ more than 100 people.

Cash and Carry

This is a well-established industry, especially in Glasgow. The service it provides is wide-ranging and comprises the rag trade, household goods etc. Again, there is no established research to establish exact figures, but the working group estimates that there are probably 300 businesses involved, employing between 30 and 50 people each.

Convenience Stores and Corner Shops

This is one of the few Asian industries on which various research projects have been carried out. However, much of this research is primarily related to Glasgow and Edinburgh. There appears not to be any Scotland-wide study of the industry.

Minority ethnic community involvement in this sector is quite considerable. For example in Edinburgh alone there are 340 independent grocery stores largely owned and operated by people of South Asian origin.

Nursing Homes

Asian people have diversified into this industry but there are no established figures as to their strength in this sector. However, there are at least four key players who own about 20 nursing homes between them. Again, data on the number of employees is unavailable, but it is estimated that each nursing home employs about 40 staff, mostly on a part-time basis.

Property

Again, there is no proper data available to establish the extent of minority ethnic involvement in this sector. However, there is reliable anecdotal evidence to suggest an increase in minority ethnic investment in this industry.

South-East Asian Businesses

The South-East Asian businesses surveyed were primarily Chinese-owned and based in the Aberdeen and Aberdeenshire/Grampian area. In Aberdeen and the surrounding area, the survey showed that there were at least 30 restaurants, 75 takeaways, and one cash and carry operating.

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Health and Social Care Action Plan

Introduction

From existing information and the experience of Scotland's minority ethnic people it is clear that there are a number of barriers which users face in accessing health and social care services. These barriers have been very simply summarised as issues of:

- ▶ communication and accessibility (including timing and location)
- ▶ insensitivity to the cultural and faith needs of service users
- ▶ inadequate information about services and accountability in relation to the provision of services

Taken together the REAF Health and Social Care Working Group consider those experiences would fit the definition of institutional racism in the Macpherson report on the inquiry into the death of Stephen Lawrence:

"The collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping which disadvantage minority ethnic people."

Vision

The Working Group has therefore developed a vision in which:

Health and Social Care services demonstrate and deliver a service which is accessible and accountable to all sections of the community. In order to do so, they need to uphold and demonstrate fundamental principles that operate from the basis of human rights and promote social justice.

The Minister for Health's Challenge to the Health Service in Scotland

The Scottish Executive has inherited a challenge from the then Minister for Health in the Scottish Office, Sam Galbraith. This challenge set in April 1998 to Health Boards and Trusts was to:

- ▶▶ address the health care needs of their minority ethnic population
- ▶▶ ensure that their cultural and spiritual needs are met.

Since this challenge was made several relevant pieces of work have been undertaken, led by the Scottish Executive's Health Department. This work has included the Ethnic Minority Health Stocktake, *Clearing The Decks*, the convening of a group to consider issues around spiritual care in the National Health Service in Scotland (NHSScotland), and the NHSScotland document *Our National Health: A Plan for Action, A Plan for Change*. The REAF Health and Social Care Working Group welcomes these developments and intends that the proposals contained in this action plan will complement and build on that work.

It is also the hope of this group that this action plan and its recommendations can help the Scottish Executive to deliver its own "vision of modern social care centred around the needs of individuals... that delivers quality care when and where families really need it"¹ and Sam Galbraith's desire for "every looked-after child to have the best possible start in life."²

Operating principles

The Working Group believe that the development and implementation of an effective race equality strategy and action plan needs to be based upon certain key operating principles:

- ▶▶ equality of access and of service provision for all service users irrespective of geographical location
- ▶▶ respect for diversity within communities as well as across communities
- ▶▶ accountability and transparency
- ▶▶ partnership with users and communities
- ▶▶ evidence-based approaches to service provision
- ▶▶ integral monitoring and evaluation
- ▶▶ the need for comprehensive training, development and awareness-raising.

In drawing up the action plan and priority action areas framework the REAF Health and Social Care Working Group have based their thinking on the following views of what these operating principles might mean in practice:

Equality of access and of service provision for all user groups, communities and individuals with no direct or indirect discrimination on the grounds of disability, age, gender, sexual orientation, race, colour, language, religion or national or ethnic or social origin, irrespective of geographical location.

¹ The then Deputy Minister for Community Care Iain Gray speaking in Perth, 23 July 1999.

² The then Minister for Children and Education Sam Galbraith speaking during a Parliamentary debate, 12 January 2000.

Respect for diversity: service users should be provided with services which respect their individual qualities, abilities and diverse backgrounds and properly take into account their age, gender, sexual orientation and social, cultural and religious background.

Accountability and transparency: consisting of public reporting through annual reports and statements, the use of internal and external performance indicators and staff appraisals and the development of national race equality standards.

Partnership with users and communities: to support the commitment to health and social care services which are user-led there should be measures taken in support of consultation mechanisms and the use of lay involvement and advisory forums in the planning and reviewing of local race equality plans; also sustainable local race equality work through a funding and capacity building programme and development of an appropriate information strategy.

Evidence based services require planning tools, research and information strategies such as comprehensive ethnic monitoring systems to identify needs and assist planning decisions covering all aspects of employment practice and service provision across the sector. This should include admitted patient care, health priority areas and the Community Health Index.

Integral monitoring and evaluation as part of the planning cycle should involve an initial audit of services, policies and practice followed by the mainstreaming of race equality into all planning and the production of central guidance on mainstreaming and planning for race equality. Local NHS planning processes should include the development of programmes of action with resources identified and implementation reported on centrally and publicly.

Training, development and awareness-raising should be based on a service-wide review to establish core standards for the design and delivery of a training strategy with a focus on knowledge and skills, evaluation and impact assessment. The strategy should be designed to ensure consistency and effectiveness, and be developed in the context of continuous development and consideration of lay involvement with associated national guidelines.

Actions

To ensure that health and social care services in Scotland meet the needs of minority ethnic communities, address institutional racism and promote race equality, it is proposed that actions should be taken across a range of areas:

a) Leadership and Strategic Direction

- 1 The Minister for Health to affirm Ministerial commitment to race equality;
- 2 The Scottish Executive Health Department (SEHD) to appoint a named individual within the Department's senior management team to take lead responsibility for race equality in the health and social care services;

b) Planning and Commissioning of Services

SEHD, the Scottish Executive Education Department, NHSScotland, and all those responsible for commissioning and providing health and social care services:

- 1 to incorporate consideration of equality issues, including race equality, into all planning procedures and documents and the commissioning of all services;
- 2 to ensure that the specific needs of minority ethnic communities are being met through both research and consultation; where unmet needs are identified, services to be commissioned to meet those needs;
- 3 to ensure that all services provided are culture and faith sensitive and meet service users' cultural, dietary and spiritual requirements;
- 4 to make race equality a condition of funding for all new services;

c) Communication and Access

SEHD, the Scottish Executive Education Department, NHSScotland, and all those responsible for providing health and social care services:

- 1 to develop and implement strategies for increasing awareness amongst minority ethnic communities about the availability of different health and care services and their rights in accessing those services;
- 2 to develop and implement strategies around health promotion campaigns to ensure that such campaigns reach minority ethnic communities;
- 3 to ensure that interpreting services can be easily accessed by all staff and patients;
- 4 to ensure that all staff signpost interpreting services to service users and are trained in the use of interpreters;
- 5 in consultation with minority ethnic communities, to develop and implement a clear policy on the provision of appropriate information in community languages;
- 6 to develop a programme to promote the uptake of direct payments amongst minority ethnic service users;

d) Advocacy

- 1 Local authorities and Health Boards to fund the provision of independent advocacy services³ for minority ethnic communities including for disabled people within communities; those authorities and Health Boards with small minority ethnic populations to look to purchase advocacy expertise from areas of more dense population, possibly using the Internet and video and telephone conferencing;

e) Research, Information and Data Gathering

- 1 SEHD, liaising with the Central Statistics Unit, the Common Services Agency Information and Statistics Division, the General Register Office for Scotland and local health and social care providers, to design and implement a strategy to gather all data around service provision and use on an ethnically disaggregated basis; the provision of data in this way to become a requirement on all service providers, except in those instances where it can be demonstrated that there are sound reasons for not doing so;
- 2 Ethnic group data to replace or, if practicable, supplement country of birth data on death certificates and anywhere else it is routinely used;
- 3 SEHD to develop further the commitment to information systems to gather data such as health service use, health relevant behaviours, morbidity and mortality rates; this data to be disaggregated for urban and rural areas;
- 4 Where appropriate, SEHD to require that service providers also collect data on the linguistic, dietary and spiritual needs of service users; such data to contribute to the provision of more culturally and linguistically sensitive services;
- 5 SEHD to study the findings of the Scottish Executive Audit on Ethnic Minority Research and commission research to fill significant gaps in health and social care research identified in the Audit;
- 6 The Scottish Commission for Regulation of Care to ensure that data gathering as part of inspection incorporates monitoring of ethnicity of users and how linguistic, dietary and spiritual needs of service users are addressed;

³ Advocacy is designed to support people who have trouble accessing services or are not aware of their rights. Health or social care workers will often act as advocates for their clients or patients within the system, and family members will often act as advocates for those they care for. However, sometimes support is needed from somebody who does not have to worry about other interests such as their own, their employer's or their colleagues – someone who can be on one side only. People who rely on care services often have no such support and no knowledge of how to find it.

f) Training and Education

- 1 All providers of training leading to careers in the health and social care professions and designers of curricula, including the General Medical Council, the General Dental Council, the General Chiropractic Council and the United Kingdom Central Council for Nursing, Midwifery and Health Visiting and the Council for Professions Supplementary to Medicine, to ensure that their curricula incorporate issues of diversity, discrimination and promoting equality of opportunity as well as race equality;
- 2 The Scottish Social Services Council, the Central Council for Training and Education of Social Workers, the Training Organisation for Personal Social Services and the Scottish Qualifications Authority to ensure that their curricula incorporate issues of diversity, discrimination and promoting equality of opportunity as well as race equality;
- 3 All providers of training leading to careers in the medical and care professions, including medicine, nursing, dentistry and social work, to ethnically monitor both applications and selection onto these courses and develop positive strategies to address any under-representation of students from minority ethnic backgrounds;
- 4 All providers of health and social care services to ensure that all employees at all levels receive equality, including race equality, training, appropriate to their duties; such training to ensure that staff can provide a culturally-sensitive person-centred service;
- 5 SEHD to ensure that all NHSScotland public appointees receive equality, including race equality, training;

g) Employment and Representation

- 1 All providers of health and social care services to draw up, where one does not already exist, or review and if necessary revise, where one already exists, an equal opportunities policy and implementation plan that includes specific references to race equality;
- 2 All providers of health and social care services to undertake ethnic monitoring of their workforce, and of their recruitment and selection processes; where inequalities and/or under-representation are apparent, positive strategies to be developed to address them;
- 3 All training and development programmes to be ethnically monitored to ensure that all staff benefit from equal access to training and development opportunities; where inequalities and/or under-representation are apparent, positive strategies to be developed to address them;
- 4 SEHD to continue to work closely with colleagues in the Scottish Executive Public Appointments and Equality Units to ensure awareness of equality and diversity issues when making NHSScotland public appointments and to develop and implement positive strategies to address continuing under-representation. As part of this, the Health Department to ensure that:
 - ▶▶ this is reflected in the material prepared for applicants and in the design and placement of advertisements;
 - ▶▶ a wide range of minority ethnic and other relevant organisations are advised when appointments are being advertised;
 - ▶▶ it provides opportunities for “work shadowing” existing public appointees;

h) Racial Harassment

- 1 SEHD to require that all providers of health and social care services ensure that policies and procedures are in place for dealing effectively with any instances or allegations of racial harassment; these policies and procedures to cover harassment of staff by other staff, staff by patients and patients by staff;
- 2 SEHD to require that all providers of health and social care services publish statistics on racial harassment as part of their annual reporting process;

i) Consultation

- 1 SEHD to require and support the development of consultation frameworks by unified Health Boards to support the implementation of the new duty on the public sector to promote race equality in the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000;
- 2 SEHD to require and support the convening by unified Health Boards of consultation exercises around users’ and voluntary organisations’ experience of the health and social care services and their views on needs in relation to service provision, design and delivery. These exercises should bring together the service providers, professional and trade union organisations, user groups and interests as well as academic and other external specialists;

- 3 SEHD to require and support the convening by unified Health Boards of consultation exercises around children and young people's experience of social care services and their views on needs in relation to service provision, design and delivery. This should bring together the service providers, professional and trade union organisations, user groups and interests as well as academic and other external specialists;
- 4 SEHD to ensure that Health Improvement Plans contain specific measures for engaging minority ethnic communities;
- 5 All providers of health and social care services to consult with minority ethnic service users, including children and young people, around the planning, commissioning and delivery of services; such consultation to be used in identifying the extent to which current provision of services is meeting the needs of minority ethnic communities and in identifying unmet needs;

To be effective such consultation must:

- ▶ recognise the diversity of minority ethnic service users, both across communities and within communities; as well as consulting with all relevant communities, service providers also to ensure that they consult with the young, the old and women within communities, as well as those like disabled people who suffer from multiple discrimination;
- ▶ use a variety of meaningful approaches which reflect the diversity of those being consulted; such approaches could include public meetings, focus groups, roadshows, interviews, user surveys and electronic consultation;
- ▶ consider the use of initiatives which help user groups to contribute confidently and effectively to consultation processes; such initiatives could include shadowing and mentoring.

j) Monitoring, Evaluation and Reporting

- 1 All providers of health and social care services to mainstream equality, including race equality, into their annual reporting processes;
- 2 All inspection units to adopt inspection mechanisms around the promotion of race equality; such mechanisms to be based on the Commission for Racial Equality's equality standards and guidance developed in support of the implementation of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000;
- 3 SEHD, liaising with the Central Statistics Unit, the Common Services Agency Information and Statistics Division and the General Register Office for Scotland, to develop disaggregated frameworks for the monitoring of service users and staff by ethnicity;

k) Actions Specific to Rural Areas

Minority ethnic households and groups in rural areas face specific challenges based on their small size, diversity and dispersion. Furthermore, rural health and social care service providers have often ignored the specific needs of minority ethnic households in their service provision and delivery, sometimes arguing that race equality issues are not relevant to their circumstances or service users. Accordingly, the REAF Health and Social Care Working Group proposes the following actions.

Providers of health and social care services in rural areas, in conjunction with SEHD and other relevant organisations:

- 1 to ensure that race equality issues are mainstreamed into the development and implementation of all rural health and social care initiatives and projects;
- 2 in partnership with other agencies and minority ethnic groups, to develop innovative and practical strategies to provide interpreting and translation services in rural areas in ways that overcome the disadvantages arising from the small size and the diverse and dispersed nature of minority ethnic households;
- 3 to develop consultation strategies which overcome the disadvantages listed above and allow minority ethnic communities to participate fully; such consultation strategies to take into account the time and costs spent on travel which can limit the involvement of all rural service users in consultation exercises;

Actions Relating To Specific User Groups:

l) Gypsies/Travellers

- 1 SEHD to give early consideration to the feasibility of developing patient-held health records throughout Scotland;
- 2 Primary health and social care service providers to develop and implement strategies to improve their liaison with Gypsies/Travellers as part of wider communication and access strategies; as one aspect of these strategies, to consider providing a named contact, possibly a Health Visitor, to liaise with Gypsies/Travellers and with local Gypsy/Traveller sites;
- 3 Providers of health and social care services to ensure that all consultation strategies build in concern for the particular circumstances and needs of Gypsies/Travellers, both through direct engagement with Gypsies/Travellers and through the involvement of relevant organisations such as the Scottish Gypsy Traveller Association, the Scottish Traveller Consortium and the Save The Children Fund; care to be taken to ensure that the voices of young, elderly and disabled Gypsies/Travellers are heard;
- 4 In addition to the recommendations on training above, providers of primary care and social care services to ensure that relevant staff receive training in Gypsy/Traveller cultural values;

m) Asylum Seekers and Refugees

- 1 Health and social care providers to provide specific culturally-sensitive services which recognise gender, religious and cultural needs, over and above a need to appreciate the specific needs of this very vulnerable group who have been displaced and traumatised and who may require specialist mental health and primary care services. This service provision to recognise that many asylum-seekers have not accessed any health care over a period of time and that they may have health conditions which are specific to their home country;
- 2 Health and social care providers to recognise that current barriers to the use of health and social care services facing asylum-seekers mean that those who have recently received refugee status may have pressing health and social care needs which need to be met quickly, effectively and with services which are culturally and linguistically sensitive;
- 3 Health and social care providers to ensure that vulnerable refugees are identified at an early stage and that appropriate partnerships are developed to meet their needs;
- 4 SEHD to ensure that resources are available to support the development and provision of services by Health Boards and voluntary sector organisations which meet the mental health needs of refugees who may suffer from depression and/or mental illness as a result of the experiences which led them to leave their countries of birth;

n) Carers

- 1 The REAF Health and Social Care Working Group welcomes the publication of the *Strategy for Carers in Scotland* in November 1999 with its aim of improving service provision for all carers in Scotland. As this work is being carried forward, the Working Group would like to draw attention to the particular barriers facing some minority ethnic carers, including linguistic and cultural barriers, and to make the following recommendations:
- 2 SEHD, in conjunction with local authorities and Health Boards, to develop and implement positive strategies to facilitate the involvement of minority ethnic carers and those they care for in community care planning, provision and evaluation and in all consultation exercises around the provision of services for carers; these positive strategies to include capacity building and the development of improved consultation frameworks;
- 3 Local authorities and Health Boards to ensure that the services they provide for carers and those who are cared for, as well as information about those services and the distribution of that information, are culturally sensitive and accessible to service users for whom English is not their first language;

Actions Relating to Specific Parts of the Health and Social Care Sectors

o) Mental Health

- 1 SEHD to implement those recommendations within Chapter 18 of the Report on the Review of the Mental Health (Scotland) Act 1984, also referred to as the Millan Report, relating specifically to service users from minority ethnic communities.

p) Primary Care Organisations and Independent Contractors (including General Practitioners, Dentists and Pharmacists)

- 1 Primary Care Trusts, in conjunction with the Clinical Standards Board and the Royal College of General Practitioners, to ensure that the promotion of race equality and the effective accessing of interpreting services become important parts of the practice accreditation scheme currently under development;
- 2 Primary Care Trusts to ensure that independent contractors comply with the general duty to promote race equality under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, both as employers and as service providers; Primary Care Trusts to monitor and report on progress in the promotion of race equality in this area;
- 3 The General Medical Council, the General Dental Council and the Royal Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain to ensure that their members do not discriminate on the grounds of race, ethnicity, culture or language, and actively promote race equality by providing services which are person-centred, culturally sensitive and supported by the use of interpreting and/or translation services where appropriate;

q) Establishment of a Centre of Excellence

- 1 SEHD to establish a centre of excellence to provide expert advice to health and social care professionals on the promotion of race equality and eradication of institutional racism; its duties to include the collating and disseminating of examples of good practice around consultation, interpreting, provision of information and of culture and faith-sensitive services.

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Housing Action Plan

Introduction

The provision of safe, high quality and affordable housing free from discrimination and the fear of racial harassment is central to the creation of a sustainable national housing strategy. It is vital, therefore, that Scottish housing promotes race equality and eliminates institutional racism across all its activities.

The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 extends the scope of the 1976 Act to cover areas previously excluded and makes it unlawful for public authorities to discriminate on racial grounds in carrying out any of their functions. It places a duty on a wide range of public authorities to promote race equality and prevent racial discrimination. It gives Scottish Ministers the power to make Orders imposing specific duties on specified Scottish public authorities bound by the general duty; these duties will be enforceable by the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE) serving compliance notices backed up by court orders where necessary. It also gives the CRE powers to issue statutory codes of practice providing practical guidance to public authorities on how to fulfil both their general duty and specific duties to promote race equality.

It is anticipated that the New Executive Agency which replaces Scottish Homes, the Scottish Executive generally and local authorities will be covered by these duties. In turn, these public bodies will be expected to ensure that those they contract with, i.e. Registered Social Landlords, also comply with the legislation.

The Housing Act (Scotland) 2001 places an overarching duty on Scottish Ministers and local authorities to carry out their functions in a manner that encourages equal opportunities. In the light of these developments, it will be important to reinforce authorities' responsibilities for equality issues when guidance is published on expectations and implementation. The Act also provides a significant opportunity to adopt a co-ordinated and consistent approach to the alleviation and prevention of harassment and anti-social behaviour through joint working. Again, consultation with key organisations to develop specific guidance will be crucial to the process of implementation. All the planning tools at the disposal of housing providers should be made available in this context.

Key Issues For the Scottish Housing Sector

- ▶▶ The need to provide housing which meets the specific housing needs and aspirations of minority ethnic and refugee communities. This includes issues around area preference, unit sizes, racial harassment and the specific needs of minority ethnic older people;
- ▶▶ The impact of the dispersal of asylum seekers on local housing providers and the need to identify actions to improve access for refugee communities, including a package of measures to prepare local communities and protect asylum seekers from racist abuse;
- ▶▶ The need for an agreed national strategy and code of practice for joint working for the prevention of racial harassment and effective measures for dealing with its perpetration and effects;
- ▶▶ The need for transparent and anti-discriminatory allocation of housing;
- ▶▶ The under-representation of people from minority ethnic communities at all levels in housing, including as staff, shareholders, members of management committees and tenants;
- ▶▶ The lack of research and information gathering around race equality and housing, including links between housing and social exclusion and the experience of homelessness amongst minority ethnic communities;
- ▶▶ The lack of consistent race equality training across the sector for staff and management committee members;
- ▶▶ Ineffective consultation with minority ethnic communities and organisations on the development, implementation and review of services and practices;
- ▶▶ Insufficient implementation of existing best practice across all public and voluntary sector housing providers;
- ▶▶ The lack of a specific and costed strategy for the development of community-led housing associations.

Actions

a) Leadership and strategic direction

- 1 This plan to be adopted and championed by the Scottish Executive and the New Executive Agency with specific responsibility for its delivery to be given to a designated Departmental Minister and a named senior official with a specific remit for race equality;
- 2 An advisory group to be brought together by the New Executive Agency to include race equality organisations with a Scotland-wide remit on housing; this group to advise the Scottish Executive and the New Executive Agency on the implementation of the plan and on race equality issues in general;
- 3 The Scottish Executive, the New Executive Agency, COSLA, the Scottish Federation of Housing Associations (SFHA), the Chartered Institute of Housing Scotland (CIH) and all Registered Social Landlords to mainstream race equality issues within their planning and review processes;

b) Research and information gathering

- 1 The New Executive Agency to develop a national policy of ethnic monitoring across all public sector housing provision which would establish a national baseline of data and provide an essential means of identifying progress; this to include collection of data relating to specific groups such as asylum seekers, refugees and Gypsies/Travellers;
- 2 The New Executive Agency to commission a review of all race and housing research to establish gaps in information and to identify a programme of research development. In addition, this review to collate race and housing work carried out over the last 5 to 10 years by minority ethnic voluntary sector organisations through short-life projects;
- 3 The Scottish Executive's Homelessness Task Force, as part of their review of the causes and nature of homelessness in Scotland, to make specific investigation into the experience of homelessness amongst Scotland's minority ethnic communities and to identify proposals for action; to facilitate this work, data on homelessness to be ethnically disaggregated where possible;

c) Meeting the specific needs of minority ethnic communities

- 1 The New Executive Agency to review current policies around development funding and unit size with a view to encouraging the provision of larger units where appropriate to housing needs;
- 2 The New Executive Agency to require all Registered Social Landlords to demonstrate that they have considered minority ethnic needs in their strategic development and funding plans;
- 3 The New Executive Agency to prepare a specific and costed strategy to support the setting up and development of community-led housing associations and specific service providers to meet specific needs;
- 4 The New Executive Agency and COSLA to review the provision of housing for minority ethnic women suffering domestic abuse and older minority ethnic people requiring sheltered housing and to develop strategies to rectify any gaps in provision which are identified;

d) Anti-discriminatory and anti-racist measures

- 1 Local authorities and Registered Social Landlords to review their allocations policies and procedures to assess the potential for direct and indirect racial discrimination and to revise them where necessary;
- 2 All local authorities and Registered Social Landlords to publicise and explain the policies and rules governing their allocation of housing stock;
- 3 All Registered Social Landlords to provide information and advice to enable applicants and tenants to be aware of their rights;
- 4 All Registered Social Landlords to ensure that front-line staff and service users have access to interpreters;
- 5 All Registered Social Landlords to ensure that appropriate complaints procedures are in place and that they explicitly include procedures for complaints of racial discrimination and harassment;

- 6 The New Executive Agency and COSLA to draw up a national strategy and code of practice for joint working for the prevention of racial harassment and effective measures for dealing with its perpetration and effects; this strategy to incorporate the use of anti-social behaviour orders in tackling racist attacks and harassment and be drawn up in consultation with minority ethnic groups;
- 7 Community Safety Strategies to include explicit reference to racial harassment and measures taken to prevent and respond to incidents;
- 8 One of the roles of the Sociable Neighbourhood Co-ordinator to be the promotion and dissemination of good practice in dealing with anti-social behaviour and more specifically racial harassment;

e) Training and employment

- 1 The New Executive Agency to initiate a sector-wide review of training to establish core standards for the design and delivery of training with a focus on knowledge and skills;
- 2 The New Executive Agency to prepare guidelines on race equality training; these guidelines to form the basis of a centrally co-ordinated national training strategy set in the context of continuous improvement to ensure that all staff and committee members receive race equality training appropriate to their duties;
- 3 The New Executive Agency, COSLA and Registered Social Landlords to address the under-representation of minority ethnic workers at all levels within the housing sector through the development of positive strategies to recruit and retain minority ethnic staff; consideration to be given to the potential use of national targets as a way of measuring progress;

f) Consultation, engagement and partnership

- 1 The New Executive Agency to require all Registered Social Landlords and local authorities to consult and involve minority ethnic communities and organisations in the development, implementation and review of their services and practices;
- 2 All public sector and voluntary organisations involved in the provision of housing services to improve their arrangements and capacity for joint working, particularly on race-related development issues; such joint working to include local strategies for dealing with racial harassment, new build appropriate to need, sharing of development staff and training placements, development and delivery of common training packages and the sharing of expertise;
- 3 The New Executive Agency and local authorities to provide capacity-building support to minority ethnic organisations to enable them to participate fully and effectively in consultation exercises around housing issues;
- 4 The Scottish Executive and the New Executive Agency to develop measures to tackle under-representation at all levels within the housing sector and to meet the relevant targets relating to public appointments;
- 5 The New Executive Agency to develop sustainable local race equality work in partnership with minority ethnic organisations. This should include funding a capacity building programme and information strategy for the housing sector;

g) Monitoring, auditing and reporting

- 1 The New Executive Agency, as part of its inspection role, to carry out an initial audit of housing provision by local authorities and Registered Social Landlords in order to better inform policy development. This audit to cover the following areas: access to and quality of housing; recruitment and selection of staff; racial harassment and service delivery; local authority planning procedures and interpreting and translation facilities;
- 2 The Scottish Executive and the New Executive Agency to review current proposals for performance standards and mainstreaming of equality issues as set out in the Single Regulatory Framework with minority ethnic and equalities organisations;
- 3 The New Executive Agency, local authorities and all Registered Social Landlords to ensure that race equality issues are clearly addressed within their annual auditing and reporting processes.

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Local Government Action Plan

Introduction

As the REAF working groups develop race equality action plans which aim to eradicate institutional racism and promote race equality, local authorities have a vital contribution to make. They are central to local democracy and have a direct or indirect impact on minority ethnic communities in many different ways, including:

- ▶▶ as a provider of a wide range of public services to the community;
- ▶▶ as an organisation with a range of statutory, voluntary and private sector partners making decisions on strategic developments in local areas;
- ▶▶ as a major employer of staff;
- ▶▶ as an organisation providing funding to community organisations;
- ▶▶ as an organisation involved in commissioning services;
- ▶▶ as the focus of local decision-making and democratic representation;
- ▶▶ as the initiators and supporters of local partnership and multi-agency working.

In all of these aspects of the local authority role, there is the opportunity to identify, address and eradicate institutional racism and promote race equality. The REAF Local Government Working Group recognises that many individuals and organisations are already taking this opportunity and that there are many examples of good practice across Scotland. However, much more needs to be done.

Current issues in local government

The group welcomes the coming into force of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 with its duty on the public sector to promote race equality. The new legislation builds on the Race Relations Act 1976 and creates a legal framework for the more effective and consistent embedding of race equality into all local authority activities.

At the same time, local authorities continue to work within other existing equality legislation, including the Sex and Disability Discrimination Acts which make it unlawful to discriminate directly or indirectly on the grounds of sex or disability.

Local authorities also work in the context of European legislation, and the incorporation into domestic law of the Human Rights Act 1998 provides the right to enjoy any other convention rights and freedoms without discrimination.

The Scotland Act allows the Scottish Parliament to impose specific duties on Scottish public bodies. The Scottish Executive has expressed a commitment to promoting mainstreaming of equality across the public sector. There is also an overall focus currently on themes such as modernising local government and social inclusion, all of which are consistent with the promotion of equality.

Other legislation is also relevant to specific services, such as, for example, the NHS and Community Care Act 1990, recognising the need to take account of the requirements of people from minority ethnic communities, and the Children (Scotland) Act 1995, with an obligation to take account of the diversity of children's needs.

Under the Local Government Act 1988 contractors commissioned by local authorities must take reasonable steps to comply with the Race Relations Act 1976.

The last few years have also seen the development of the Best Value agenda, with a joint Task Force on Best Value in Scotland set up after the 1997 UK general election and an emphasis on the provision of high quality services which meet the needs of service users. This has included the development of public performance reporting, for which local authorities are required to develop appropriate frameworks. The promotion of equality has been identified as an aspect of Best Value and COSLA has produced guidance on the mainstreaming of race equality into Best Value.

A recent report (2000) presenting the findings of the Renewing Local Democracy Working Group, chaired by Richard Kerley, focused on the issue of "democratic renewal" and stressed, among a range of recommendations, the need to increase participation in local democracy by groups which are currently under-represented, including minority ethnic communities.

There has been an increasing focus in local government on community planning, through which councils, statutory partners and voluntary and private sector organisations agree a vision for the local area and the actions required by local partners to deliver this. There are opportunities here for the promotion of race equality.

Finite resources are always an issue in addressing all of the above. However, the working group believe that if race equality is built into policy development and service delivery from the outset, there will be greater efficiency and effectiveness alongside greater responsiveness to the needs of communities.

Key Issues

In addition to the cross-cutting barriers identified elsewhere in this report, there are a number of specific barriers for minority ethnic communities in relation to local authorities, both in participation in and engagement with local authorities and in the use of services. At the same time local authorities in general do not yet fully identify and address the specific requirements of minority ethnic communities and cannot at present be considered to be fully inclusive.

In terms of the overall planning of provision to the community, local authorities often do not take sufficient account of the issues affecting minority ethnic groups. There is a lack of integration of race equality into the planning process and a lack of consideration of these issues at the stage of policy formulation. This may be due, in part, to a lack of awareness and understanding of these issues and inappropriate attitudes amongst some staff, but is also often due to a lack of overall expressed commitment to race equality, the low priority given to these issues and inadequate consultation and engagement with minority ethnic people (both in specific consultation and as part of the mainstream consultative process). A failure to initiate or support effective partnership and multi-agency working can also play a part. All of this can lead to the development of inappropriate planning with serious consequences for the quality, suitability and accessibility of the services provided.

There is also a lack of research and monitoring, with little current data available in relation to actual service use by people from minority ethnic communities and little monitoring undertaken. This reduces the accountability of local authorities and reduces the opportunity for the evaluation of initiatives.

Local authorities also have a significant role to play as employers and should be looking to address race equality issues in their recruitment, selection, retention and progression of staff. These issues should also be taken into account in the provision of training and opportunities to staff once in post and the support which is available to minority ethnic employees to raise grievances.

In terms of the commissioning of services by local authorities, there are two key issues. First, those organisations which are contracted to provide services on behalf of a local authority do not always have mechanisms in place to ensure that they promote race equality, and in the past local authorities have had only limited powers to insist on such mechanisms. However, the new general duty under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 should ensure that race equality issues are taken into account in the commissioning of services. Secondly, minority ethnic businesses often experience constraints when it comes to competing for local authority contracts.

Finally, in relation to the representative role of local authorities, people from minority ethnic communities are under-represented at a political level. This is a matter for political parties to consider addressing, for example through positive action approaches to the recruitment and selection of candidates for local elections.

All of these issues constrain the opportunities for minority ethnic communities to have access to services which meet their needs, while also preventing the same communities from participating fully in local democracy.

Actions

Within this overall context, there are a range of areas in which particular action may be required to address and eradicate institutional racism and to promote race equality. There is clearly a need for the Scottish Executive and local authorities to acknowledge that institutional racism is an issue, and for the Scottish Executive in partnership with COSLA to take a lead in the promotion of race equality. Individual authorities must also take action.

a) The Scottish Executive to:

- 1 adopt this plan with specific responsibility for its implementation given to a designated Departmental Minister and a named senior official with a specific remit for race equality, thereby demonstrating the Executive's determination to fulfil its commitment to promote race equality;
- 2 embed equality, including race equality, into the Best Value Framework;
- 3 require local authorities in developing and carrying out their community planning functions to build equality (including race equality) into their policies, programmes and processes, including specifically into their community consultation and participation strategies;
- 4 in partnership with COSLA, local authorities and communities, develop a database of good practice and guidance on the promotion of race equality by local authorities; topics covered to include consultation, partnership working, employment and training, planning, policy development and delivery and commissioning of services.

It is suggested that:

b) In policy/planning/review each local authority should:

- 1 identify race equality as a core value of the council, include this in their strategic objectives and report annually on their success in meeting this objective;
- 2 secure a commitment from elected members and staff to this core value of race equality;
- 3 give responsibility for mainstreaming and resource assessment of equality issues to a senior official and ensure that this official has the opportunity to network with representatives of other authorities;
- 4 make race proofing of policies and services a requirement, to be carried out in part through the use of equality indicators;
- 5 take account of race equality in policy and planning, budget allocations, decision making, implementation and evaluation;
- 6 ensure that race equality is part of the Best Value process;
- 7 develop equality policies and ensure that these are "live" documents;
- 8 develop race equality strategies/timetabled action plans, with an expectation that all parts of the authority will address the issues and report back;
- 9 build in issues affecting minority ethnic communities to all cross-sectoral developments (such as community planning and social inclusion work) and, as part of this, engage with the minority ethnic voluntary sector as a key strategic partner;
- 10 develop means of enabling minority ethnic organisations to work in partnership with the authority;
- 11 take a leadership role in the establishment and development of multi-agency partnerships to develop and implement anti-racist strategies and promote race equality;
- 12 develop appropriate mechanisms for communication and consultation with minority ethnic communities using a range of methods;
- 13 include relevant minority ethnic organisations in policy formulation;
- 14 where appropriate ensure that general monitoring data is disaggregated by ethnicity and use the data to guide new policy developments;
- 15 monitor the impact and outcomes of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, for example by measuring client satisfaction;
- 16 report on the above actions as part of the Public Performance Reporting Framework.

c) As an employer each local authority should:

- 1 carry out an employee audit;
- 2 adopt and publicise an up-to-date equal opportunities policy;
- 3 adopt and publicise a harassment policy for employees and ensure that there is a visible, transparent and accessible grievance procedure;
- 4 take action in response to complaints;
- 5 develop good race equality practice as a major employer, in relation to recruitment, selection, training and promotion;
- 6 develop policies, procedures and conditions of employment for a fair working environment;
- 7 provide opportunities for minority ethnic staff using, for example, mentoring, shadowing, networking and other means, as required;
- 8 monitor and review employment practices in relation to race equality;
- 9 provide race equality training and awareness raising for staff at all levels, using appropriate experts to deliver the training.

d) In service provision each local authority should:

- 1 provide barrier-free services which are racially and culturally appropriate, taking account of language, location, means of provision and information;
- 2 make available interpreting services and ensure that staff are aware of and signpost interpreting services to service users;
- 3 in consultation with minority ethnic communities, develop a communication strategy to include the provision of appropriate information in a range of languages;
- 4 adopt and publicise an equal opportunities policy with a focus on race equality and ensure that there is a visible and accessible complaints procedure;
- 5 adopt and publicise a harassment policy for service users;
- 6 involve minority ethnic groups in local service advisory groups and increase consultation and responsiveness to needs;
- 7 examine the performance and responses of individual services in relation to race equality, carry out external monitoring and provide data and progress reports;
- 8 use the data collected for future service planning.

e) In commissioning services each local authority should:

- 1 develop positive action approaches to enable greater participation by minority ethnic-owned businesses in the tendering process, including through capacity-building work;
- 2 as part of such positive action approaches, carry out an analysis of tender lists and identify under-represented groups, before developing positive strategies to address any such under-representation.

It is to be hoped that the general and specific duties to promote race equality under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, together with future legislation including the proposed Local Government Bill, will mean that local authorities can, should and will:

- 3 include race equality within procurement strategies;
- 4 develop clear race equality standards for contractors and contracted services;
- 5 ensure that organisations from which services are commissioned have an equal opportunities policy and that their practices accord with the delivery of race equality.

f) As a funding organisation each local authority should:

- 1 take account of the requirements of minority ethnic groups in the provision of funding support and the consideration of voluntary sector issues;
- 2 provide ring-fenced funding to ensure that the needs of minority ethnic communities are met;
- 3 support the provision of translation and interpreting services;
- 4 support local capacity building work with minority ethnic organisations;
- 5 audit and publicise the achievements of funding which has been provided.

g) In the democratic process each local authority should:

- 1 develop race equality training for elected members;
- 2 remove barriers in the voting process;
- 3 engage and empower people from minority ethnic communities to participate in local democracy.

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Planning Action Plan

Introduction

Given the significant contribution of land use planning to the growth and development of contemporary Britain, it is evident that its potential impact on the life of Scotland's minority ethnic communities is important. The formal processes of planning can either promote or hinder the achievement of equality of opportunity for all. Similarly the informal processes of identifying priorities, consulting the broader community, networking with stakeholders and recognising minority needs and aspirations are of critical concern.

Planning will have to address and readdress how it approaches such issues as a service provider. It must also seek to reflect the whole community in its workforce and its processes of evaluation and assessment. In doing so, it is vital to recognise that a colour-blind approach based on an assumption that the process is neutral in its impact on different communities is no longer sustainable. Instead, if a truly equitable service is to be provided, then race equality has to be actively promoted and institutional racism eliminated.

Issues

Research around planning and race equality, including several reports published by the Royal Town Planning Institute (RTPI), has highlighted the need for the following issues to be addressed if race equality is to be promoted and institutional racism eliminated in the provision of planning services:

- ▶▶ under-representation in employment
- ▶▶ insufficient or inadequate consultation with minority ethnic communities
- ▶▶ failure to race-equality-proof policies and procedures
- ▶▶ inadequate data collection, analysis and monitoring
- ▶▶ failure to implement guidance on good practice.

Actions

a) Leadership and strategic direction

- 1 This plan to be adopted by the Scottish Executive with specific responsibility for its delivery to be given to a designated Departmental Minister and a named senior official with a specific remit for race equality;
- 2 The Scottish Executive Development Department (SEDD) to provide guidance for Planning Authorities, planning professionals and others with an interest, by way of a circular on the implications of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, National Planning Policy Guidance or a Planning Advice Note on Equal Opportunities, on how best to promote race equality, eradicate institutional racism and consult with minority ethnic communities; such guidance should also remind authorities of their legal obligations, including those under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 and the Human Rights Act 1998;
- 3 Planning Authorities to draw up departmental race equality action plans identifying objectives, responsibilities, resources and performance indicators;
- 4 Planning Authorities to develop and implement systems for ethnic monitoring as a priority, especially in development control;

b) Consultation, involvement and identification of needs

- 1 SEDD to ensure that relevant minority ethnic community interests are consulted and involved in policy development and review;
- 2 Planning Authorities to consult and communicate effectively with relevant communities; such consultation to make use of methods which are both imaginative and systematic and which operate at all levels;
- 3 SEDD and Planning Authorities to systematically assess the needs of minority ethnic communities. As part of such assessment, particular needs, urban and rural, should be identified. These may include issues relating to design, safety, sustainability, housing location and size, recreational and religious provision and transport;

c) Mainstreaming of race equality into planning and processes

- 1 SEDD to equality proof National Planning Policy Guidelines (NPPGs) and Planning Advice Notes (PANs) when they are next amended; such proofing to ensure that equality issues, including race equality, are mainstreamed into all NPPGs and PANs, as well as planning circulars;
- 2 Planning Authorities to equality proof all statutory land use plans and development briefs to ensure that the needs of all sections of the community are appropriately addressed;
- 3 SEDD and Planning Authorities to analyse the impact of all policy development and significant decisions on minority ethnic communities;
- 4 SEDD to introduce guidance on ethnically disaggregated monitoring of Development Control including enforcement;

d) Employment and training

- 1 Planning Authorities to develop good race equality practice in relation to recruitment, selection, training and promotion of staff;
- 2 SEDD, in partnership with Planning Authorities and the planning profession, to develop positive action strategies to attract minority ethnic staff into the profession;
- 3 SEDD, COSLA and Planning Authorities to ensure that all staff in the planning system receive equality, including race equality, training commensurate with their duties;

e) Research

- 1 SEDD to commission research to identify shortfall in existing provision and good practice in promoting equality of opportunity in the land use planning system; the good practice identified to be subsequently disseminated to planning interests with guidance on implementation.

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Social Inclusion Action Plan

What is social exclusion?

The UK Government has defined social exclusion as “a short-hand label for what can happen when individuals or areas suffer from a combination of linked problems such as unemployment, poor skills, low incomes, poor housing, high crime environments, bad health and family breakdown.” In effect, this definition could be described as a “poverty” model of exclusion, and is, in the context of race equality, too limited, as it takes no account of the range of barriers which can lead specifically to members of minority ethnic communities becoming isolated and socially excluded, even when none of these problems apply. Certainly, people within minority ethnic communities can be identified who face each and often all of these problems, but, among these communities, many people experience additional problems, some of which are the result of institutional racism.

The consequences of social exclusion

Few issues are as poorly served by official statistics as the barriers experienced by Britain's minority ethnic communities. It is only in the last 3 – 5 years that anything more than a small core of official statistics have been available disaggregated by ethnicity. There is, however, drawing on information from both Scotland and the UK as a whole, an emerging consensus on the following :

- ▶▶ People from minority ethnic communities are more likely to be unemployed, with wide variations even among ethnic groups, with, for example, Bangladeshis suffering a rate of unemployment more than 4 times that of white people;
- ▶▶ Similarly, the rate of employment among people from minority ethnic communities generally is much lower than among white people. This is particularly an issue among Asian women, among whom, in some cases, only around one third are in employment, compared to nearly 80% in the case of white women;
- ▶▶ Although data is not particularly reliable, it is now recognised that people from minority ethnic communities have generally lower incomes than white people, and are more likely to suffer income-related deprivation. Allied to this is the view now accepted by the UK Government and others that people from minority ethnic communities are much more likely to live in poor quality housing, in disadvantaged neighbourhoods, and particularly in areas with high rates of crime;
- ▶▶ Again, although data is incomplete, people from minority ethnic communities face a range of additional health issues, both in terms of the likelihood of becoming ill, but also in terms of this being exacerbated by differential access to health services.

There is also a "hidden" strand of exclusion (at least in terms of most areas of public policy) for sub groups within minority ethnic communities who suffer, in effect, multiple discrimination. Obvious examples of this are women and disabled people.

Current approaches to social inclusion

Social inclusion is the process of addressing the problems caused by social exclusion. Since 1997, the UK Government has put in place a number of initiatives to achieve this, although it is recognised that this will be a long process, taking 10 or more years to address problems which have come about over many generations.

The main initiatives which the UK Government and, since devolution, the Scottish Executive have put in place are:

- ▶▶ The development of a consultation paper on Social Exclusion in Scotland. This generated over 200 responses. A summary of the responses is available on the Scottish Executive web site.
- ▶▶ In June 1998, the Scottish Social Inclusion Network was formed, bringing together representatives of a range of organisations with an interest in this area, including local government, health care providers and housing providers, and individuals with personal experience of tackling social exclusion, including community representatives.
- ▶▶ In early 1999, the Scottish Executive published a strategy for social inclusion, "Opening The Door To A Better Scotland".
- ▶▶ In November 1999, this strategy was further developed with the publication of a document entitled "Social Justice, A Scotland Where Everyone Matters", which set out 29 milestones proposed by the Scottish Executive as indicators of progress in tackling social exclusion. These milestones relate to children, young people, families, older people and communities.
- ▶▶ In Summer 2000, two Social Justice Action Notes were published, reflecting some of the progress which has been made, and developing outline action plans for work in the short and medium terms. The fourth Action Note will discuss ways in which equalities can be mainstreamed into social justice initiatives.
- ▶▶ The Social Inclusion Partnership programme was established in 1999 in recognition of two basic facts about social exclusion: that it is complex and that its causes are interrelated. There are 48 Social Inclusion Partnerships (SIPs), 21 of which followed a refocusing of the existing Priority Partnership Areas (PPAs) and Regeneration Programmes (RPs). 34 SIPs are geographically based and 14 are thematic. Of the 14 thematic SIPs, 2 have been specifically established to provide support to people from minority ethnic communities experiencing social exclusion (in Fife and Glasgow).

The specific needs of people from minority ethnic communities and race equality generally have not been particularly prominent in any of these documents or initiatives, with the exception of the 2 thematic SIPs referred to above. For example, only one of the milestones in the Social Justice report relates directly to race equality. There are general commitments to promote social inclusion for minority ethnic communities, but relatively little by way of specific objectives or actions. At a local level, initiatives such as non-thematic SIPs have not necessarily addressed the needs of minority ethnic groups. For example, the adoption of strict geographic definitions of eligibility does not take account of the fact that members of minority ethnic communities experiencing exclusion may not be concentrated in small areas, and the predominant use of the poverty model does not take account of the range of ways in which people can experience exclusion.

Actions

To ensure that work on social inclusion meets the needs of minority ethnic communities, addresses institutional racism and promotes race equality, it is proposed that actions should be taken across a range of areas:

a) Leadership and strategic direction

- 1 This action plan to be adopted by the Scottish Executive with specific responsibility for its delivery to be given to a designated Departmental Minister and a named senior official with a specific remit for race equality;
- 2 The Scottish Social Inclusion Network to advise the Minister on the implementation of this action plan;
- 3 The Scottish Social Inclusion Network to develop a strategy with specific objectives and milestones for work to address social inclusion in relation to minority ethnic communities in Scotland similar to those set out in both the national strategy and the Social Justice paper;
- 4 The Scottish Executive to ensure an implementation plan is developed and resources made available for this strategy;

b) Research

- 1 The Scottish Executive to develop a research and information framework for social inclusion in consultation with minority ethnic communities;
- 2 The Scottish Executive to commission research to develop a clear understanding of the concept of social exclusion in the context of race, incorporating, but not being restricted to, the poverty model, taking account of issues such as institutional racism, illegal discrimination and the failure of providers to offer services which are both accessible to, and meet the needs and preferences of, minority ethnic communities;
- 3 The Scottish Executive to commission research to identify effective work being undertaken throughout Scotland to address social exclusion, both specifically with minority ethnic communities and more generally;
- 4 The Scottish Executive, as part of its commitment to the improved collection of disaggregated data on Scotland's minority ethnic communities, to ensure that all relevant statistics are ethnically disaggregated; this disaggregation to be built into ongoing processes such as the collection of neighbourhood statistics;

c) Partnerships, networks and the promotion of good practice

- 1 The Scottish Executive to ensure that race equality is mainstreamed into the work of the Scottish Social Inclusion Network;
- 2 The Scottish Executive to take the lead in organising a conference at which the target audience will be policy makers and those engaged in regeneration work with a view to helping develop a better understanding of the specific needs of people from minority ethnic communities;
- 3 The Scottish Executive to develop a network of those involved in social inclusion work with minority ethnic communities to help the process of sharing good practice. Links should be made with any similar groups which exist in England and Wales;
- 4 The Scottish Executive and local authorities to develop local plans to inform people from minority ethnic communities, in a range of appropriate ways, about the work which is being done in relation to social inclusion and how they can participate in this. In the longer term, these plans should address the development of sustainable partnership working and the capacity building necessary to support this;
- 5 SIPs to ensure that the promotion of race equality is mainstreamed into their programme planning, resource allocation and budgetary processes;

d) Monitoring and auditing of provision

- 1 Within the Social Justice Annual Report, the Scottish Executive to report on the extent to which the needs of minority ethnic communities have been addressed by work in the area of social inclusion;
- 2 SIPs to complete a race equality audit of their policies and programmes and to report on this to the Scottish Executive with a forward work programme to respond to gaps and develop more effective race equality strategies;
- 3 This requirement to be included in the specification of future local partnership arrangements;
- 4 SIPs to report on their allocation of resources, including financial resources, to the promotion of race equality; this to be done as part of their annual reporting process.

Race Equality Advisory Forum

Voluntary Sector Issues Action Plan

Introduction

It is important to include the voluntary sector in any consideration of the eradication of institutional racism across a variety of key services, as this sector is now a major force in both the provision of services and the development of community initiatives in Scotland. There are also a number of key issues for minority ethnic groups in relation to voluntary sector provision which must be addressed in the context of the action planning process.

This action plan begins from the premise that there is a need, in addressing voluntary sector issues affecting minority ethnic communities, to recognise the importance of:

- ▶▶ equality of access;
- ▶▶ strong infrastructure support;
- ▶▶ development of meaningful partnerships;
- ▶▶ support for the diversity of the sector;
- ▶▶ transparency.

Key Issues

The voluntary sector in Scotland has grown in recent years, having an increasing role to play in the provision of support to communities and the delivery of services. It has also become more involved in initiatives relating to employment and training (for example through the New Deal) and more generally in overall economic development. At a national level, the input of the voluntary sector has been recognised in the establishment of the Voluntary Issues Unit within the Scottish Executive. There is also a “Scottish Compact” which outlines the relationship between the government and the voluntary sector and stresses the importance of the role of the sector in the continuing development of services and participation in Scotland. This is supported by a set of guidelines that highlight Scottish Executive links with the voluntary sector. The Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations (SCVO) also provides support and co-ordination at a national level, and local Councils of Voluntary Service (CVSs) provide support in local areas, while Volunteer Development Scotland (VDS) and the network of Local Volunteer Development Agencies (LVDAs) promote and support volunteering. A network of six Racial Equality Councils (RECs) supports local race equality work, including facilitating consultation and assisting local groups and individuals.

Within this overall context, the minority ethnic voluntary sector has had an increasing role in economic and social activity in Scotland and has influenced and informed policy development at a local level. Growth in recent years has meant that a total of 558 organisations were identified by SCVO as being part of the minority ethnic voluntary sector.

The REAF consultation process, as well as a recent paper by BEMIS, (Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland), identified a number of barriers and problems facing many of these organisations. The BEMIS report notes that many minority ethnic organisations, often established to fill gaps in existing service provision and to address issues relating to racism and social exclusion, have developed with little or no support from the statutory sector or the mainstream voluntary sector. The lack of provision of support is seen to remain a key issue, with many organisations considering that they experience problems in gaining access to mainstream and secure funding, relying instead (where funding is available at all) on short term, insecure provision¹. There is also seen to be a lack of co-operation between funders, as well as barriers to access to capacity-building services and support.

It is suggested that all of these issues have constrained the development of the minority ethnic voluntary sector. The survival of minority ethnic voluntary organisations, as BEMIS points out, becomes “precarious” in this context, with organisations finding it difficult to undertake strategic planning or longer term development.

In addition, constraints to the development of the sector and to the provision of information to the sector reduce the opportunities for the input of minority ethnic groups to general community development, participation in consultative processes and forums, input to and involvement in key aspects of policy making (e.g. the development of community planning) and service monitoring. They also reduce the opportunity for minority ethnic organisations to have an effective political voice and to participate in the political process. The minority ethnic voluntary sector consequently assumes more of a reactive than proactive role, with opportunities for community skills development limited. The level of engagement with other agencies is also often poor and organisations are frequently left isolated and unable to influence and inform social policy.

It is also suggested that some aspects of the minority ethnic voluntary sector experience particular constraints, with services underdeveloped, for example, in terms of making provision for women, younger and older people and disabled people in minority ethnic communities. There is a need for greater recognition of the diversity both of communities and within communities. In particular, the invisibility of smaller communities and of minorities within minorities must be addressed. Most areas of the country outwith Glasgow, particularly rural areas, are also poorly served by minority ethnic voluntary organisations.

¹ Further information around these issues is available in the Executive's *Review of Funding for Black and Minority Ethnic Groups in the Voluntary Sector*, January 2001.

Stakeholders

A range of stakeholders need to be involved in taking action in partnership with voluntary sector organisations to address these issues and to begin to tackle the current barriers. These include the Scottish Executive, the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA), SCVO and the CVS network, VDS and the LDVA network, the Unemployed Voluntary Action Fund (UVAF), the Association of Chief Officers of Scottish Voluntary Organisations (ACOSVO), the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE) and the six RECs, the Community Fund, Scottish Enterprise, Highlands and Islands Enterprise and the Local Enterprise Companies, Health Boards, Community Learning Scotland and the Home Office in respect of their reserved functions.

Actions

The key actions required are seen to be as follows:

a) Leadership and strategic direction

- 1 This plan should be adopted and championed by the Scottish Executive with specific responsibility for its delivery to be given to a designated Departmental Minister and a named senior official with a specific remit for race equality;
- 2 A short-life multi-agency advisory network to be brought together to advise the Minister on the implementation of the plan;

b) Infrastructure and capacity building

- 1 The Scottish Executive to take the lead in the development of a longer term strategic approach to the development of the minority ethnic voluntary sector through a sector-wide audit of policy and practice, the provision of a separate, new funding stream and the development of race equality performance indicators specific to voluntary issues;
- 2 The Scottish Executive to take the lead in the strengthening of the minority ethnic voluntary sector by supporting the development of a national infrastructure in Scotland to provide a stronger co-ordinated voice for the sector;
- 3 The Scottish Executive to encourage the public sector generally at a national, regional and local level to respond to the need for capacity-building of the minority ethnic voluntary sector;
- 4 The Scottish Executive to take the lead in providing accessible and appropriate information in relation to the role of key organisations, including mainstream voluntary sector organisations, which can provide support to minority ethnic voluntary sector organisations;
- 5 The Scottish Executive, in partnership with the mainstream voluntary sector and others such as local authorities, to take the lead in ensuring that minority ethnic voluntary organisations have access to relevant expertise, including a named contact within funding and support organisations and information in appropriate and accessible formats, including provision in community languages;
- 6 The Scottish Executive to identify and support a means of gathering and disseminating examples of good practice in the promotion of race equality across the voluntary sector;
- 7 The Scottish Executive to provide secure, mainstream funding to support individual minority ethnic voluntary organisations to enable the growth of individual organisations and to build the capacity of the sector overall; the provision of such funding to take account of geographical and cultural factors;
- 8 The Scottish Executive to work in partnership with the mainstream and minority ethnic voluntary sector and others such as local authorities and the Community Fund, to develop a new and specifically-funded positive action programme to support leadership and build capacity within minority ethnic voluntary sector organisations; this programme to include assistance with training, secondment, mentoring, the sharing of good practice and the development of innovative approaches;

- 9 The Scottish Executive in partnership with other stakeholders to provide support to the mainstream voluntary sector to enable the development of work to address issues of institutional racism and inappropriate service delivery, and to promote race equality;
- 10 Organisations with funding, support or decision-making responsibilities relating to the voluntary sector (such as the Community Fund or CVSSs) to provide staff with race equality training and to develop standards for that training; the Scottish Executive to consider the provision of development funding for this programme;
- 11 The Scottish Executive to support the development of good governance and accountability frameworks and self-assessment toolkits across the voluntary sector;

c) Consultation, partnership and networking

- 1 As an early priority, the Scottish Executive to promote the development of links between the Scottish Parliament, the Scottish Executive, COSLA and the minority ethnic voluntary sector at a national strategic level; such links to reflect and draw on the diversity of communities and interests across Scotland and across sectors;
- 2 Organisations providing funding and support to the voluntary sector to develop strategies to address any under-representation of people from minority ethnic communities in their workforces and management structures;
- 3 The Scottish Executive to support the development of increased consultation by statutory organisations with minority ethnic voluntary sector organisations in Scotland and increased consultation with minority ethnic service users in the assessment and development of services. As far as is practicable, statutory organisations should be required to demonstrate through their Annual Reports the ways in which they have undertaken this consultation and the extent to which the outcome influenced policy or practice;

d) Volunteering

- 1 Volunteer Development Scotland, Local Volunteer Development Agencies and the Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations, in partnership with community-led organisations, to facilitate and encourage the development of good practice by mainstream voluntary organisations in the recruitment and retention of volunteers from minority ethnic backgrounds; this good practice to include the adoption of positive strategies to increase the recruitment of volunteers from minority ethnic backgrounds;
- 2 Larger mainstream voluntary organisations to ensure that volunteers and paid staff receive equality, including race equality, training appropriate to their duties;

e) Data and monitoring

- 1 The Scottish Executive to co-ordinate the development of a programme of research, data-collection and evaluation relating to the operation and activity of minority ethnic voluntary organisations in Scotland, within the overall context of the development of accountability and monitoring within the voluntary sector as a whole;
- 2 The Scottish Executive to take the lead in the ongoing collection and publication of data in relation to funding provision to minority ethnic organisations in the overall context of funding support to the voluntary sector as a whole;
- 3 From the earliest practicable date, the Scottish Executive to support equality, including race equality, auditing of voluntary sector services and overall practices; this to become a condition of funding where it is possible to do so.

Appendices

| | | |
|------------|--|----|
| Appendix A | Biographical Details of Members | 76 |
| Appendix B | Lawrence Steering Group Members | 77 |
| Appendix C | Developing a Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Programme | 78 |
| Appendix D | Summary of Recommendations | 80 |
| Appendix E | Recommendations on Public Appointments | 82 |
| Appendix F | Contributions to the REAF Action Plans | 83 |
| Appendix G | Census Classification | 98 |
| Appendix H | Other Sources of Information | 99 |

Appendix A: Biographical details of members

Jackie Baillie, Minister for Social Justice in the Scottish Executive chaired the Forum.

Saqib Abbasi is project manager of the Community Service Volunteers Ethnic Minority Health Action Project in Glasgow.

Rowena Arshad is the Director of the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland (CERES) based within the University of Edinburgh, and a lecturer on equity and rights. She has recently taken up the post of Equal Opportunities Commissioner with special knowledge of Scotland. She is also a member of the STUC General Council, a board member with the Scottish Higher Education Funding Council and a member of the Board of Management of Telford College, Edinburgh.

Ephraim Borowski is Honorary Secretary of the Scottish Council of Jewish Communities, Vice-President of the Glasgow Jewish Representative Council, and Chair of the Regional Council of the Board of Deputies of British Jews. He was formerly a Senior Lecturer and Head of Department in the Department of Philosophy, University of Glasgow, and is President of the Royal Philosophical Society of Glasgow.

Mick Conboy is Deputy Head of the Commission for Racial Equality, Scotland.

Matthew Farrow is Head of Policy at CBI Scotland.

Tesfu Gessesse is the Project Co-ordinator of the Black Community Development Project in Edinburgh. He is currently Chair of the Lothians and Edinburgh Racial Equality Council, (ELREC) and a member of the Board of Directors of the Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations (SCVO).

Jatin Haria is the Co-ordinator/Partnership Manager of the Glasgow Anti Racist Alliance (Social Inclusion Partnership). He has been a member of the STUC Black Workers' Committee for a number of years and is its current vice-chair.

Subhash Joshi was a Senior Partner in Pannell, Kerr, Foster. He was also chair of Positive Action in Housing, President of Glasgow Chamber of Commerce and a board member of Ethnic Enterprise Centres in Glasgow and Edinburgh.

Dharmendra Kanani is Director of the Commission for Racial Equality, Scotland. Mr Kanani is also a member of the Lawrence Steering Group.

Aziza Khand's background is working with the Muslim community in general but with a special interest in issues affecting Muslim women.

Philomena J F de Lima is a Lecturer (Sociology) and Researcher at Inverness College and serves as a Council member on the Scottish Further Education Funding Council. She has also authored one of the first studies on the experiences of rural minority households in rural Scotland.

Dr Martin MacEwen is former Vice Principal of Edinburgh College of Art and Head of the Scottish Ethnic Minority Research Unit. Dr MacEwen is also a former member of the Lawrence Steering Group. Dr MacEwen has moved to South Africa to take up a new post as Visiting Professor of Law at Stellenbosch University.

Shamime Mansoori is an Equal Opportunities Officer in Falkirk Council.

Mukami McCrum is Chief Executive of Central Scotland Racial Equality Council and is also a member of the Home Secretary's Race Relations Forum.

Philip Muinde has extensive knowledge of race relations issues and many years' experience of promoting good race relations between people of different cultural backgrounds. He is a member and Vice Chair of the Grampian Racial Equality Council and a member of the Aberdeen and Grampian Chamber of Commerce. He is also a member of the Institute of Directors as well as the International Corporate Governance Network.

Dorothy Neoh is the Project Manager of NCH San Jai Chinese Project in Glasgow.

Najimee Parveen is Director of Positive Action Training in Housing. Prior to this she was Policy and Campaigns Officer for the Commission for Racial Equality in Scotland.

Vijay Patel is a Black Issues Consultant in the British Agencies for Adoption and Fostering. He is the former Chair of the Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland (BEMIS).

Robina Qureshi is the Director of Positive Action in Housing, which works with minority ethnic communities and housing providers to secure safe and affordable housing. Ms Qureshi is also a member of the Lawrence Steering Group.

Selma Rahman is Director of Fife Racial Equality Council.

Sofi Taylor is employed by Greater Glasgow National Health Service Primary Care Trust. She is a community nurse for ethnicity and culture in the Community Learning Disability Team.

Louise Donnelly, Rhona Carr and Alastair Crerar from the Scottish Executive provided the secretariat to the Forum.

Appendix B: Lawrence Steering Group members

The Deputy First Minister announced in July 1999 that the Scottish Executive had accepted almost all of Sir William Macpherson's 70 recommendations. The Scottish Executive published a separate action plan for Scotland on 20 July 1999. The Deputy First Minister also set up a Steering Group to oversee the implementation of this plan. In doing so, he envisaged that the Steering Group would focus on criminal justice and police issues, which make up the bulk of the Lawrence Inquiry recommendations. At its first meeting on 7 February 2000 the Group agreed the following terms of reference:

"To oversee and audit in a Scottish context the implementation of the Scottish Executive's action plan published in July 1999 in response to the report of the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry."

List of Members

- Jim Wallace QC, MSP
Deputy First Minister
- Chief Constable Andrew G Brown Esq
QPM, Grampian Police
- Chief Superintendent Jack Urquart,
Association of Scottish Police
Superintendents
- Chief Superintendent Keith Pirrie, the
Scottish Police College
- Councillor Bashir Mann JP DL MSc,
LLD FRSA
- Jon Harris, Head of Policy Development
(CoSLA)
- Dharmendra Kanani, Commission for
Racial Equality
- Mrs Jeannie Felsing, Grampian Racial
Equality Council
- Jonathon Squire, Convenor of Ethnic
Minorities Law Centre
- PC Lawrence Ramadas
- Dr Martin MacEwen
- Maxine Iffla
- Nabeed Ramzan Esq
- Raj Jandoo Esq, Faculty of Advocates
- Robina Qureshi, Positive Action in
Housing
- Douglas Keil Esq, QPM, General
Secretary – Scottish Police Federation
- Mr Aamer Anwar, c/o Scottish Fire
Brigades Union
- Mr Franz Crowe, Deputy Crown Regent
(to July 2001)
- Mr Len Higson, Regional Procurator
Fiscal
- William Taylor, HMIC

Appendix C: Developing A Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Programme

In February 2000 Jackie Baillie, MSP, then Deputy Minister for Communities, announced the commissioning of work to provide better information on the circumstances of people with a minority ethnic background and the barriers they face. The main aim of the research programme is to collect a wide range of quantitative and qualitative data on the social and economic circumstances of Scotland's main ethnic minority groups. The research will also be used to investigate the relationship between race, religious affiliation, social inclusion and equal opportunities, with a particular focus on the experiences of ethnic minority groups.

Social Justice Group commissioned projects

Researching Ethnic Minorities in Scotland: Report of Workshop held on 2nd March 2000

Proceedings of a workshop organised by the Scottish Executive to inform the planning of a survey on the circumstances of ethnic minority groups in Scotland.

Contractor: Reid-Howie Associates

Published: 2000

Copies of the report are available from Lorraine Curran (0131-244 7560)

The report can also be downloaded from:
www.scotland.gov.uk/cru/kd01/red/ethnic-02.htm

Contact: Linda Nicholson (0131-244 7571)

Scoping Study for a National Survey of Scotland's Ethnic Minority Populations

Scoping work aimed at determining detailed requirements for a new and wide-ranging survey of ethnic minority groups in Scotland and recommend methodological options for meeting these.

Contractor: System Three

Published in October 2001

The report can be downloaded from:
www.scotland.gov.uk/cru/kd01/red/minethnic-00.asp

Contact: Linda Nicholson (0131-244 7571)

Audit of Research on Ethnic Issues in Scotland from a "Race" Perspective

This audit aims to feed into the preparatory work for the proposed survey of ethnic minorities. It identifies published and unpublished literature of relevance to or context for steering the survey and related research programme. It also identifies research gaps.

Contractor: Research Consortium led by SEMRU.

Published in September 2001

The report can be downloaded from:
www.scotland.gov.uk/cru/kd01/red/auditethnic-00.asp

Contact: Nicola Edge (0131-244 7371)

Other Scottish Executive interests commissioned projects

Without Prejudice? – A Thematic Inspection of Police Race Relations in Scotland

HM Inspector of Constabulary's inspection of Scottish Forces gauges the current status of police race relations in Scotland and sets a benchmark for subsequent reviews. Information collated and analysed covers the following areas: strategic and policy issues, community consultation, partnership working, service delivery, people (e.g. human resources and training and development) and results and performance measurement.

Contractor: Research conducted in-house (HMIC team)

Published: 2001

Full report and summary report can be downloaded from:
www.scotland.gov.uk/hmic/docs/wpr-00.asp

Contact: Dr Emma Fossey (0131-244 5631)

Working Towards a Culturally Competent Service: Assessing Organisational Competence

Research to assess progress in response to the Minister's 1998 "challenge" to the NHS to improve the health and health care services for minority ethnic communities in Scotland. This stocktake assesses how Boards and Trusts are meeting this challenge by developing policy statements/action plans on race equality and access to services, and equal opportunity employment policies. The research also seeks information on awareness and understanding of policies through training and staff development and on whether there is a consultation strategy which involves minority ethnic communities in the needs assessment and commissioning process.

Contractor: Dr Rafik Gardee (Consultant in Public Health Medicine at Greater Glasgow Primary Care Trust), and a Policy Development Officer, funded by Scottish Executive Health Department on a short-term basis.

To be published: 2001

Contact: Rafik Gardee (0141-211 3884) and Hector MacKenzie (0131-244 2399)

Review of Funding for Black and Minority Ethnic Groups in the Voluntary Sector

The report presents the findings of research into funding arrangements for black and minority ethnic voluntary sector organisations in Scotland and makes a number of recommendations.

Contractor: Reid-Howie Associates

Published: 2001

Full report can be downloaded from:

www.scotland.gov.uk/library3/society/equality/funds-00.asp

Contact: Fiona Cook (0131-244 5133)

Equality in Scotland – Ethnic Minorities

This publication gives statistical information related to ethnic minorities in Scotland.

Contractor: Conducted in-house

Full report can be downloaded from:

www.scotland.gov.uk/library3/society/equality/esem-00.asp

Contact: Neil Bowie (0131-244 0324)

Equality Statistics: Report of Conference for Users of Equality Statistics held at Scottish Executive, Victoria Quay on 29 January 2001

Proceedings of a conference organised by the Scottish Executive Equality Unit and Central Research Unit for users and providers of equality statistics, to inform and advise the Scottish Executive as to issues of concern for users of equality statistics.

Published: 2001

The report can be downloaded from:

www.scotland.gov.uk/cru/kd01/pink/eqstats-01.asp

Contact: Elaine Samuel (0131-244 7409)

Ongoing Projects

Translating, Interpreting and Communication Services

Ethnic Minorities Victims of Racist Crime Health

Appendix D: Summary of Recommendations

4 The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000

4.1

The Forum welcomes the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. It endorses the 2001 consultation paper's statement on the key features for organisations promoting race equality.

4.2

The Forum recommends that all organisations adopt a mainstreaming approach to tackling racism and promoting race equality.

4.3

The Forum recommends that Scottish Ministers adopt the framework on specific duties set out in the 2001 consultation paper and that the Executive supports and encourages the development of good practice across the public sector in Scotland to ensure that compliance with the new specific duties delivers on the Executive's commitment to promote race equality.

6 Areas for Action

6.1

In order to promote race equality training, the Forum recommends that the Scottish Executive, in partnership with communities and others, develop:

- ▶ a database of race equality trainers and advisers;
- ▶ a national framework of core standards for race equality training; and
- ▶ in the longer term, an accreditation scheme for race equality trainers and advisers.

6.2

The Forum recommends that Scottish Ministers adopt the framework on specific duties on ethnic monitoring set out in the 2001 Race Relations (Amendment) Act consultation paper.

6.3

The Forum recommends that all public sector organisations:

- ▶ establish what barriers exist to equality of access to information about and participation in employment opportunities in their organisation;
- ▶ seek to identify any direct and/or institutional discrimination against applicants from minority ethnic backgrounds;
- ▶ equality-proof their practices and policies relating to recruitment, retention and progression of staff; such equality-proofing to include a race equality impact assessment;
- ▶ consider the relevance and contribution of positive action programmes;
- ▶ set organisational targets for recruitment, retention and progression of minority ethnic employees and report on those targets on an annual basis.

6.4

In the context of the Scottish Executive's ongoing ethnic minorities research programme (Appendix D) the Forum recommends that the Scottish Executive take the lead in the development of a capacity-building programme involving researchers and advisors from minority ethnic communities and community-led organisations.

6.5

The Forum welcomes the Scottish Executive's commitment to report annually to the Scottish Parliament on its Equality Strategy and recommends that:

- ▶ The Scottish Executive take the lead on the development of race equality specific performance indicators and evaluation frameworks to inform the public sector's reporting of progress and implementation of race equality work;
- ▶ Scottish Ministers adopt the Forum's 2001 consultation paper proposals on the specific duty to report the results of race equality impact assessment of policies and services and consultations and monitoring of the impacts in policies, services and employment.

6.6

The Forum recommends that the Scottish Executive and all public-sector bodies set out their arrangements for provision of, and access to, translation and interpreting services.

6.7

The Forum encourages the public sector to develop and build on existing good practice, such as the good practice guidelines of the Scottish Forum for Public Service Interpreting and Translating.

6.8

The Forum welcomes and endorses the recommendations of the Macpherson Inquiry on prevention and the role of education and therefore recommends that the Scottish Executive take action to:

- ▶ support and develop multi-agency working to ensure an effective, timely and co-ordinated response to racist incidents and racial harassment;
- ▶ develop a strategic programme of work on the prevention of racist crime and racial harassment; protection and support for victims; and the provision of effective service responses by all key agencies; and
- ▶ develop and support a partnership with minority ethnic communities and public and voluntary sectors at a national and local level to encourage and support ongoing dialogue in all its work in this area.

7 Consultation with Minority Ethnic Communities

Recommendations:

7.1

That the Scottish Executive takes the lead in continuing to support the development of a Scotland-wide database.

7.2

That the Scottish Executive encourages public sector interests including Scottish Executive departments, local authorities, health and community care and housing providers to develop sectoral specific better practice on inclusive events and consultation.

7.3

That as a minimum those responsible for consultation with civic society in whatever sphere need to ensure that:

- ▶ the Commission for Racial Equality, Racial Equality Councils, BEMIS, the Scottish Interfaith Council and the Scottish Trades Union Congress Black Workers' Committee are included in all consultations along with all relevant minority ethnic community organisations;
- ▶ responses are regularly reviewed throughout the consultation period;
- ▶ consideration is given to commissioning and/or funding specific work in communities led by members of the communities themselves; and
- ▶ for all consultation and civic participation initiatives, consideration is given to the provision of relevant, accessible information in community languages.

The Forum encourages:

7.4

The Scottish Executive Media and Communication Unit to initiate a specific study on accessible and relevant means of communicating with minority ethnic communities.

7.5

All Departments of the Scottish Executive and organisations to:

- ▶ develop awareness of different approaches which might enhance consultation and dialogue;
- ▶ involve members of minority ethnic communities in trying out different approaches and evaluating their suitability for different types of policy-making, service design and evaluation of implementation.

8 Next Steps

8.1

The Forum looks to Scottish Executive Ministers to establish quickly:

- ▶ arrangements for publication by Departmental Ministers of their initial response to the Forum's report;
- ▶ arrangements for the publication by the Scottish Executive of an initial report on work to take forward the commitment to promoting race equality covering the period from publication to autumn 2002 and annually thereafter;
- ▶ convene in the winter of 2002/3 a broad ranging conference of minority ethnic communities, statutory agencies, public, private and voluntary sectors to review progress, reaffirm direction and renew the commitment to action; and
- ▶ in preparation for the conference, to commission work within minority ethnic communities and mainstream service providers and voluntary sector interests across Scotland in order to assess progress on the strategy and action plans.

8.2

In the course of the Forum's work it has not been possible to address all issues or to incorporate full consideration of the needs of some particular groups such as Gypsies/Travellers, asylum seekers and refugees or those with disabilities.

Therefore the Forum asks the public, private and voluntary sector in taking forward this report, recommendations and proposals for priority actions to have regard to the particular experiences, circumstances and needs of all minority ethnic communities including particular groups such as Gypsies/Travellers, asylum seekers and the religious and faith communities, and:

8.3

encourages all sectors to develop their own dialogue with and within communities as well as with other relevant organisations.

Appendix E: Recommendations on Public Appointments

In order to address the current under-representation of minority ethnic communities on the boards of non-departmental public bodies (sometimes referred to as quangos) the Forum recommends that:

- ▶▶ the Scottish Executive Public Appointments Unit conduct a review of the existing public appointments list of individuals who have expressed an interest in being considered for public appointments. This review should seek to identify barriers to participation, ways of raising awareness of the work of public bodies within communities and strategies for meeting the Scottish Executive's commitment to increase the numbers of minority ethnic people applying for membership of public bodies. It should be carried out in partnership with the Commission for Racial Equality, minority ethnic-led organisations and existing members of public bodies from minority ethnic communities, whilst respecting the right to confidentiality of applicants. It should form part of the ongoing review of public bodies;
- ▶▶ the Public Appointments Unit make direct approaches to all minority ethnic community-led organisations on existing databases to inform them of the nature of the work of public bodies and the potential contribution of members of minority ethnic communities to promoting better governance of, and more effective service delivery by, such bodies;
- ▶▶ in partnership with minority ethnic communities, the Scottish Executive Equality Unit and the Commission for Racial Equality, the Public Appointments Unit draw up a plan for addressing weaknesses, raising awareness and encouraging applications;
- ▶▶ consideration be given to developing guidance on improving the ethnic balance of public bodies similar to current Equal Opportunities Commission guidance on improving gender balance;
- ▶▶ the Public Appointments Unit, in partnership with sponsoring departmental officials, audit their advertisement, recruitment and application processes to remove any direct or indirect barriers to applications from, and recruitment of, people from minority ethnic communities; and
- ▶▶ the Public Appointments Unit publish regular progress reports as part of existing reporting arrangements on their success in promoting race equality and addressing any continuing under-representation.

Appendix F: Contributors to the REAF Action Plans

The following lists provide details of those who provided written or other comments on the Forum's Actions Plans and/or who were invited to the consultative events as participants (although some were unable to attend on the day). All invitees received a copy of the Working Group's Action Plan, which formed the basis for the discussion at the event. There was also a small number of additional

participants who attended on the day but who had not registered for the event, and it is recognised that the details for these participants may not have been included. The Equality Unit would like to update its lists of those with an interest in the Forum's work and would be grateful if details of any other contributors marked "REAF consultations" could be sent to it at:

Scottish Executive
Development Department
Equality Unit
Area 3H – Victoria Quay
EDINBURGH
EH6 6QQ

Invitees to the Education Consultation Event: Edinburgh 6 June 2000

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Maeve McDowell (1) | Aberdeen City Council, EAL Service |
| Kevin Franz | Action of Churches Together in Scotland Africa Centre |
| Gordon Jeyes | Association of Directors of Education |
| Alistair Goudie (1)(2) | Association of Scottish Colleges |
| David Bleiman (1) | Association of University Teachers (Scotland) |
| Joyce Laville | Bellahouston Primary School |
| Ruth Levey (1) | Calderwood Lodge Primary School |
| Nina Giles (1) | Central Scotland Racial Equality Council |
| Verene Nicolas (1) | Centre for Human Ecology |
| Olive Smiles | City of Dundee Council |
| Laura Mitchell (1) | City of Edinburgh Council |
| Steve Maceachainn (1) | City of Edinburgh Council |
| Neena Mahal (1) | City of Glasgow Council |
| Elaine McPherson (2) | Clackmannanshire Council |
| David Caldwell (1)(2) | Committee of Scottish Higher Education Principals |
| Charlie McConnell (2) | Community Learning Scotland |
| Sarah Hutchison | Corporate Policy, Fife Council |
| Kate Dean (1)(2) | COSLA Equal Opportunities Spokesperson |
| Mohammed Akram (1) | Council of British Pakistanis |
| Frank McGrail | Drummond Community High School |
| Geraldine McWilliams (2) | East Ayrshire Council |
| Anne Munnoch (1)(2) | East of Scotland, Further and Higher Education Race Equality Forum |
| Chris Lusk (1)(2) | East of Scotland, Further and Higher Education Race Equality Forum |
| Victoria Fleming (2) | East Renfrewshire Council |

| | |
|----------------------------|---|
| Habib Hashmi (1)(2) | Edinburgh Academy |
| Alastair Christie (1) | Edinburgh and Lothians Racial Equality Council |
| M Joshi | Edinburgh Hindu Mandir and Cultural Centre |
| Gurpal Devsi (2) | Education Department East Dunbartonshire Council |
| Gus John | Education Studies Department, University of Strathclyde |
| Veronica Rankin (1) | Educational Institute of Scotland |
| Andrew Johnson (1) | Equality and Discrimination Centre, University of Strathclyde |
| Stuart Ainsworth (1) | Equality and Discrimination Centre, University of Strathclyde |
| Fernando Almeida Diniz (1) | Faculty of Education, University of Edinburgh |
| Andy Christie (2) | Falkirk Council |
| Alison Archibald (2) | Falkirk Council Education Services |
| Sarah Hutchison (2) | Fife Council |
| David Watson (2) | Fife Race Equality Council |
| Anna Gillies (2) | Glasgow City Council, Education Services |
| Richard Barron (2) | Glasgow City Council, Education Services |
| Barney Crockett (2) | Grampian Race Equality Council |
| | Her Majesty's Inspectorate (2) |
| John Ritchie (2) | Highland Council |
| Stephanie Wong (1) | Meridian Ethnic Minority Centre |
| Wilson Masih (2) | Midlothian Council |
| Alex Leggatt (2) | Moray Council |
| Carol Fox | National Association of Schoolmasters/Union of Women Teachers |
| Mandy Telford (1) | National Union of Students (Scotland) |
| Christine Tsang | North Ayrshire Council |
| Alan Milson | North Ayrshire Council, Community Education |
| Jim Beers (2) | North Lanarkshire Council Education Department |
| M Aslam | Pakistan Association |
| E ullah Khan Shami (1) | Pakistan Society Edinburgh |
| Ravinde Nijjar (2) | Pollockshields Primary School |
| Dr David Bottomley (1) | Qualifications Assurance Agency |
| Delegate (2) | Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education |
| Susan Elsley | Save the Children |
| Margaret McGhie (1) | Scottish Consultative Council on the Curriculum |
| Farkhanda Chaudhry | Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations |
| Kay Hampton | Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit |
| Eric Smith | Scottish Further and Higher Education Authority |
| John Pritchard (1) | Scottish Further Education Funding Council |
| Ramidin Kerr Nijjan (1) | Scottish Interfaith Council for Scotland |
| Judith Gillespie (1) | Scottish Parent Teacher Council |
| Usha Brown | Scottish Poverty Information Unit |
| Christine de Luca (1)(2) | Scottish Qualifications Authority |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Sally Daghlian (1) | Scottish Refugee Council |
| Ann Hill | Scottish School Board Association |
| David Eaglesham | Scottish Secondary Teachers' Association |
| Betty Jordan (1)(2) | Scottish Traveller Education Programme |
| Debbie Adams | Scottish Youth Parliament |
| Ann Hindle | SEALCC |
| Girijamba Polubothu (1) | Shakti Women's Aid |
| Ken Goodwin (1) | Shawlands Academy |
| Pamela Couper (2) | Sikh Sanjog Agency |
| Flick Thorpe (1) | Stevenson College |
| Delegate | STUC Black Workers' Committee |
| John White | Tayside Racial Equality Council |
| Moira Kerwin (1) | The Open University |
| Matt Smith | UNISON |
| Marian Larson (2) | University of Edinburgh |
| Kathleen White | Volunteer Tutor Organisation |
| Maggie Chetty | West of Scotland Community Relations Council |
| Samir Sharma (1) | Workers Education Association |
| Judith Martin (2) | |

(1) People who attended

(2) Organisations who provided written submissions

Invitees to the Health and Community Care Consultation Event: Edinburgh 14 August 2000

| | |
|----------------------|---|
| President | Academy of Medical Royal Colleges |
| Kevin Franz | Action of Churches Together in Scotland |
| Margaret Wells | ADSW |
| Director | Africa Centre |
| Delegate | Age Concern Ethnic Minority Project |
| Ms Ahmed | Asian Carers' Group |
| Margaret Wells | Association of Directors of Social Work |
| Sheem Gill (1) | Association of Indian Organisations |
| Mamta Kanabar (1) | Barnardos |
| Satnam Singh (1) | Barnardos |
| JP Hazra (2) | Bharatiya Ashram |
| Secretary | Black and Minority Ethnic Elders Group |
| Saiqa Naseem (1) | Black Community Development Project |
| Tina Yu | Breakthrough for Women |
| Kim Shepherd | Bridge of Allan Health Centre |
| Sondra Chew | Chinese Community Development Project |
| Kate Peart (1) | Central Council for Education and Training in Social Work |
| Pek Yeoung Berry (1) | Central Scotland Chinese Association |
| Joyce Tai (1) | Central Scotland Chinese Association |
| Rosie Ilett (1) | Centre for Women's Health |
| Raj Bhopal | Chaplains Associations and the National Institution for Clinical Excellence |
| Marie Liu | Chinese Carers Group |
| William Ho | Chinese Health Force |
| Gar Ming Hui | Chinese Youth Development Team |
| Renny Yan (1) | Corbett Centre |
| Dermot Gorman (1) | CoSLA |
| Mohammed Akram | Council of British Pakistanis (Scotland) |
| Ishbel White (1) | Community Practitioners' and Health Visitors' Association |
| Shagufta Ali | Central Scotland Race Equality Council |
| Bob Benson | Disability Rights Commission |
| Myra McBeth | Dumfries & Galloway Council |
| Olive Smiles (1) | Dundee Translation and Interpreting Service |
| Colin Lee | Edinburgh Association for Mental Health |
| Alistair Christie | Edinburgh & Lothians Racial Equality Council |
| On Hing Tang (1) | Edinburgh Chinese Elderly Support Association |
| Mr M Joshi | Edinburgh Hindu Mandir and Cultural Centre |
| Nel Whiting (1) | Edinburgh & Lothian Race Equality Council |
| Linda Chaudhry | Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre |
| Delegate | Enable |
| Morag Alexander | Equal Opportunities Commission |

| | |
|--------------------|--|
| Tim Hopkins | Equality Network |
| Helen MacKinnon | Executive Director National Board for Scotland Family Resource Network |
| Siew Khim Robb | Fife Chinese Women's Association |
| Sarah Hutchison | Fife Council |
| Catherine Chau | Glasgow Association for Mental Health |
| Nina Akther | Glasgow Anti-racist Alliance Community Outreach Project |
| Linda Lee (2) | Gartnavel Community & Mental Health Trust |
| Dr Rafik Gardee | Gartnavel Royal Hospital |
| Malcolm Green | Glasgow City Council |
| Naira Dar (1) | Glasgow Council for the Voluntary Sector |
| Joanne Wong | Glasgow Interpreting Service |
| Mr Khan | Glasgow South Carers' Forum |
| Delegate | Glasgow Women's Aid |
| Barney Crockett | Grampian Racial Equality Council |
| John Crawford (1) | Greater Glasgow Health Board |
| Wai Li Hui (1) | Greater Glasgow Health Board |
| Delegate | Gryffe Women's Aid |
| May Fong | Homestart UK |
| Son Tran (1) | Housing & Social Work |
| Mohammed Hameed | Interpreting & Translation Service, CEC Central Library |
| Mabel Wan | Language Link |
| Antonia Ineson | Lothian Health |
| Chri Oswald (1)(2) | Lothian Primary Health Care Trust |
| Shehana Noor | Maryhill Community Health Project |
| Dennis Chau | Maryhill Social Work Department |
| Dr Multani | Meadowbank Health Centre |
| Sana Sadollah (1) | Medical Help Projects in Developing Countries |
| Raymond Leung (1) | Minority Ethnic Learning Disability Initiative |
| Colin Lee (1) | Men in Mind |
| Stephanie Wong (1) | Meridian |
| Delegate | Milan |
| Eliza Ma (1) | Minority Ethnic Carers of Older People Project |
| Suzanne Munday (1) | Minority Ethnic Carers of Older People Project |
| Fariha Thomas (1) | Muslim Network/Taleem Trust |
| Anne Simpson (1) | National Osteoporosis Society |
| Christine Tsang | North Ayrshire Social Work Department |
| Alec Deary (1)(2) | Outright Scotland |
| Dr A Ahmed | Overseas Doctors' Association |
| M Aslam | Pakistan Association |
| E Ullah Khan Shami | Pakistan Society |
| Khuldip Dhesai | Performance Equality & Public Information |

Jacinta Barker (1)
Adrian Liu
Sian Kiely (1)
Isabel Fulton (1)
Rashpal Nottay
Abdul Khan (1)
Rachel Milne (1)
Pervin Ahmed (1)
Susan Fisher (1)
Patricia McDonald (1)
Nina Giles
Dr Graham Buckley
Lesley Wilkes (1)
Usha Brown
R Albeson (1)(2)
Linda Graham (1)
Jacqueline Foy (1)
Debbie Adams
Farkhanda Chaudhry
Kay Hampton
Rose Tibi (1)
Charlotte Lee (1)
Isobel Smyth (1)(2)
Amarjit Singh (1)
Sherry MacIntosh
Barbara James (1)
Pat Boyd (1)
Jim Devine
Mono Chakrabarti (1)
Sheela Mukherjee (1)
Mohammad Khan (1)
Paul Chow
Katie Cosgrove
S Ayite (1)
A Fatanmbi (1)
Fiaz Khan (1)
Shahnaz Khan (1)
Verene Nicolas (1)
Mridu Thanki (1)
Prince Obiki

Pilton Black Community Development Project
Positive Action in Housing
Royal College of Nursing
Royal College of Midwives
Royal Edinburgh Hospital
Service Learning Research Committee
Sahelia
Sahil Women's Group
Save the Children
Scottish Association of Chaplains in Healthcare
Scottish Black Workers' Forum
Scottish Council for Postgraduate Medical & Dental Education
Scottish Health Advisory Service
Scottish Poverty Information Unit
Scottish Refugee Council
Scottish Traveller Consortium
Scottish Traveller Consortium
Scottish Youth Parliament
Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations
Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit
Shakti Women's Aid
Scottish Health Service Trust
Scottish Inter-faith Council
South Lanarkshire Council
Stirling Council
Tayside Primary Care Trust
Tayside Racial Equality Council
UNISON
University of Strathclyde
West of Scotland Community Relations Council
West of Scotland Disability Forum
Wing Hong Chinese Elderly Project
Women's Health

Centre for Human Ecology

- (1) People who attended
(2) People who sent written responses

**Invitees to REAF Social Inclusion, Housing, Local Government and Voluntary Sector Working Group:
Glasgow 23 October 2000**

| | |
|----------------------|--|
| Satnam Virdee | |
| Linda Pilling (1) | Aberdeen City Council |
| Son Tran (1) | Aberdeen Housing & Social Work |
| Carol Tewnion (2) | Aberdeenshire Council |
| Director | Africa Centre |
| Helena Scott | Age Concern Scotland |
| NeillMcIntosh | Alloa South & East Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Masud Khan (1) | AlphaTranslations |
| Bharatiya Ashram | Ancrum House |
| Judith Harding | Angus Council |
| Kelly Macey | Angus Council Housing Department |
| Mamta Kanabar | Apna Home Care Services |
| Danny Longwill | Argyle & Bute Council |
| Kirsty Jackson-Stark | Argyle & Bute Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Misbah Ahmed (1) | Asian Carers' Group |
| Munawar Ahmed (1) | Asian Carers' Group |
| Margaret Wells | Association of Directors of Social Work |
| Sheem Gill | Association of Indian Organisations |
| Bill Magee | Audit Scotland |
| Secretary | Black & Minority Ethnic Elders Group |
| Delegate | Black & Minority Infrastructure in Scotland |
| Saiqa Naseem (1) | Black Community Development Project |
| Mark Kennedy | Blantyre/North Hamilton Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Tina Yu (1) | Breakthrough for Women |
| Fiona Langskaill | Bridges Project |
| David Bryce | Calton Athletic Recovery Group |
| Laurie Taggart | Cambuslang Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Jim Rafferty | Capital City Partnership |
| Selwyn Cambridge | Castle Rock Housing Association |
| Kate Peart (1) | Central Council for Education & Training in Social Work Scotland |
| Pek Yeong Berry | Central Scotland Chinese Association |
| Shagufta Ali | Central Scotland Racial Equality Council |
| Verene Nicolas | Centre for Human Ecology |
| Archie Graham | Chair of the Glasgow Anti-Racist Board |
| Mary MacLeod (1) | Charing Cross Housing Association Ltd |
| Alan Ferguson | Chartered Institute of Housing |
| Bronwen Cohen | Children in Scotland |
| Marie Liu | Chinese Carers Group |
| Sondra Chew | Chinese Community Development Project |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| Gar Ming Hui | Chinese Youth Development Team |
| Ellen Kelly (1) | City of Edinburgh Council |
| Francine Orr | Clackmannanshire Council |
| Lee Bridges | Clerk to Equal Opportunities Committee |
| Helen Pitts | Comhairle nan Eilean Siar |
| Dennis Chau | Community Care Social Worker |
| Charlie McConnell | Community Learning Scotland |
| Linda Goldberg | Cosgrove Care |
| Dawn Burrows (1) | CoSLA |
| Mohammed Akram | Council of British Pakistanis (Scotland) |
| Andrew Bradford | County Buildings, Forfar |
| Shenaz Bahadur (1) | Craigmillar Partnership |
| Alison Bowes | Dept. of Applied Social Sciences, University of Stirling |
| David Halliday | Director of Competitive Place |
| Simon Jaquet | Director of Fast Forward |
| David Comely | Director of Housing Services |
| Alexis Jay | Director of Social Work and Housing |
| Bob Benson | Disability Rights Commission |
| Jim Gray | Drumchapel Social Inclusion Partnership |
| David Archibald | Dumfries & Galloway Council |
| Trish Sullivan | Dundee (Old Regeneration Partnership) |
| Patricia Sullivan (1) | Dundee City Council |
| Dave Hewett | East Ayrshire Coalfield Area Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Graham Haugh | East Ayrshire Council |
| Maisie McCrae (1) | East Dunbartonshire Council |
| Sharan Virdee (1) | East Lothian Council |
| Nel Whiting | East Lothian Racial Equality Council |
| Kofi Tordzro (1) | East Renfrewshire Council |
| Mary McClemont (1) | East Renfrewshire Council |
| Alistair Christie | Edinburgh & Lothians Racial Equality Council |
| Colin Lee | Edinburgh Association for Mental Health |
| Ms On Hing Tang | Edinburgh Chinese Elderly Support Association |
| M Joshi | Edinburgh Hindu Mandir & Cultural Centre |
| Norma Cuthbertson | Edinburgh Strategic Programme |
| Rut Campbell | Edinburgh Youth Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Peter Lau | Educational Psychologist |
| Foster Evans | Employers in Voluntary Housing |
| Delegate | Enable |
| Morag Alexander | Equal Opportunities Commission |
| Alison Campbell (1) | Equal Opportunities Committee |
| Olive Smiles | Equality Action Team |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Tim Hopkins | Equality Network |
| Christine Tsang | Ethnic Minority Development Worker |
| Linda Chau | Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre |
| Shamin Akhtar | Ethnic Minority New Deal Development Officer |
| George Briggs | Falkirk Community Urban Regeneration Programme |
| Fiona Campbell | Falkirk Council |
| Mary Pitcaithly | Falkirk Council |
| Delegate | Family Resource Network |
| Siew Khim Robb | Fife Chinese Women's Association |
| Neelam Bakshi | Fife Council |
| Sarah Hutchison | Fife Ethnic Minority Capacity Building Programme |
| Lifang Lamb | Fife Racial Equality Council |
| Nardia Ali (1) | Fife Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Mohammed Azher | FRAE Fife |
| Kevin Franz | General Secretary, Action of Churches Together in Scot |
| Gus Collins | Girvan Connections Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Andrew Fyfe | Glasgow Alliance |
| Nina Akther | Glasgow Anti-racist Alliance Community Outreach Project |
| Edelweisse Thornley (1) | Glasgow City Council |
| Rizwan Ahmed (1) | Glasgow City Council |
| Mr A Johnston | Glasgow Council for Single Homeless |
| Naira Dar (1) | Glasgow Council for Voluntary Services |
| Helen Scammell | Glasgow East End Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Joanne Wong | Glasgow Interpreting Service |
| Joan Leifer (1) | Glasgow Jewish Housing Association |
| Diana Wilson | Glasgow Jewish Representative Council |
| Mr Khan | Glasgow South Carers' Forum |
| Linda Reid | Glasgow West Housing Association Ltd |
| Prabha Gave | Glasgow Women's Aid |
| Tim Thorogood | Go-Perth & Kinross Social Inclusion Partnership |
| John Quinn | Gorbals Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Barney Crockett (1) | Grampian Racial Equality Council |
| Lloyd Girling | Great Northern Social Inclusion Partnership |
| David Fletcher | Greater Easterhouse Partnership |
| Tim Edwards | Greater Govan Partnership |
| Margaret Daly | Greater Pollok Partnership |
| David Gordon (1) | Hanover (Scotland) Housing Association Ltd |
| Famida Ali (1) | Hemat Gryffe Women's Aid |
| Alistair Dodds | Highland Council |
| Bob McKinnon | Highland Wellbeing Alliance |
| May Fong | Homestart UK |

| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Sherry MacIntosh | Housing & Social Services |
| Martin Rose | Inverclyde Council |
| Paul Ballantyne | Inverclyde Regeneration Partnership |
| Ethne Woldman (1) | Jewish Care (Scotland) |
| Satnam Singh | Khandan Initiative |
| Andrew Bradford | Kincardine Estate |
| Rohini Lakhanpal (1) | Kirk Care Hanover (Scotland) |
| Mabel Wan | Language Link |
| Steven Dowling (1) | Levern Valley Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Myra McBeth | Link Co-ordinator |
| Peter Mountford-Smith | Margaret Blackwood Housing Association |
| Brij Ghandi | Meridian |
| Anna Fowlie | Midlothian Council |
| Delegate | Milan (Senior Welfare Council) |
| Eliza Leung | Minority Ethnic Carers of Older People Project |
| Raymond Leung (1) | Minority Ethnic Learning Disability Initiative |
| Denise Whitworth | Moray Council |
| Jeremy Akehurst | Moray Youthstart Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Martin McManus | Motherwell North Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Fariha Thomas (1) | Muslim Network/Taleem Trust |
| Helen MacKinnon | National Board for Scotland |
| Steven Marwick (2) | National Lotteries Charities Board |
| George Thomson | North Ayr Partnership |
| Marjorie Adams | North Ayrshire Council |
| Hugh McGhee | North Ayrshire Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Alan Howie | North Edinburgh Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Roddy Byers | North Glasgow Partnership |
| Barbara Philliben | North Lanarkshire Council |
| Susan Cloke | North Lanarkshire Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Bernard Evans | Orkney Islands Council |
| Keith Cowan | Outright Scotland |
| Stephen Wright | Paisley Partnership |
| M Aslam | Pakistan Association |
| Ehtisham ullah Khan | Pakistan Society |
| Roddy Byers | Partnership Manager |
| Delegate | PATH Scotland |
| Khuldip Dhesai | Performance Equality & Public Information |
| Ann Howard | Perth & Kinross Council |
| Jacinta Barker (1) | Pilton Black Community Development Project |
| Andrew McKay (1) | Port of Leith Housing Association Ltd |
| Adrian Liu (1) | Positive Action in Housing |

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Damien Killeen | Poverty Alliance |
| Alice Ruthven Hughes | Princess Royal Trust Carers Centre |
| Ewan Johnston | Race Equality Implementation Group |
| Maggie Paterson | Renfrewshire Council |
| Liz Curran | Routes Out of Prostitution Social Inclusion Partnership |
| Barbara James | Ryehill Health Centre |
| John Robertson (1) | Saffron Project, Southside Housing Association |
| Rachel Milne | Saheliya |
| Pervin Ahmed | Sahil Womens Group |
| Susan Elsley | Save the Children |
| Susan Fisher | Save the Children Scotland |
| Nina Giles | Scottish Black Workers' Forum |
| Diane Hunter | Scottish Borders Council |
| Iain Stewart | Scottish Borders Social Inclusion Partnership (Young People 15-25) |
| Farkhanda Chaudhry (1) | Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations |
| David Liddell | Scottish Drugs Forum |
| Susan Gemmell | Scottish Enterprise |
| Kay Hampton | Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit |
| Mridu Thanki | Scottish Ethnic Minorities Unit |
| Lilias Dunlop (1) | Scottish Federation of Housing Associations |
| Sally Daw (2) | Scottish Federation of Housing Associations |
| Delegate | Scottish Gypsy Travellers Association |
| Lesley M Wilkes (1) | Scottish Health Advisory Service |
| Pat Bagot | Scottish Homes |
| Ravinder Kaur Nijjar (1) | Scottish Inter Faith Council |
| Peter Hunter | Scottish Low Pay Unit |
| Usha Brown | Scottish Poverty Information Unit |
| Peter Barry (1) | Scottish Refugee Council |
| Linda Graham | Scottish Traveller Consortium |
| Edward Harkins (1) | Scottish Urban Regeneration Forum |
| Kate Arnot (1) | Scottish Women's Aid |
| Debbie Adams | Scottish Youth Parliament |
| Margaret Chetty | Senior Community Relations Officer |
| Sheila Campbell | Servite Housing Association (Scotland) Ltd |
| Nabirye Higenyi (1) | Shakti Women's Aid |
| Eliza Ma | Shamba Bhattacharya |
| Nabirye Higenyi | Shekti Women's Aid |
| Alastair Cooper | Shetland Islands Council |
| Cecilia Goh | Social Work Assistant |
| Mike Bennett (1) | Society of Local Authority Chief Executives |
| Louise Fyfe | South Ayrshire Council |

Sadie Mackay
Susan Milne
Jim Hayton
Sandy Cameron
Roddy Byers
Paul Docherty
Bill Speirs
Steven Hope
John White
Stephanie-Anne Harris
J P Hazra
Tam Baillie
Nazir Chaudry
Joe Ryan
Netta Maciver
Jim Devine
Mono Chakrabati
Brid Cullen (1)
Mary Docherty (1)
Jacky Robinson (1)
Mairi Souter
Bushra Iqbal (1)
Nazir Chaudhry (1)
Paul Chow
Karen Tinney
Fiaz Khan

South Coatbridge Social Inclusion Partnership
South Edinburgh Partnership Ltd
South Lanarkshire Council
South Lanarkshire Council
Springburn SIP
Stirling Partnership for Urban Regeneration
STUC
System Three
Tayside Racial Equality Council
Team Leader, Community Services, Fife Council
The Bharatiya Ashram
The Big Step – Pathways to Independence
The West of Scotland Racial Equality in Housing Forum
Tranent Social Inclusion Partnership
Turning Point Scotland
UNISON
University of Strathclyde
Volunteer Development Scotland
West Dunbartonshire Council
West Lothian Council
West Lothian Social Inclusion Partnership
West of Scotland Racial Equality Council
West of Scotland Racial Equality in Housing Forum
Wing Hong Chinese Elderly Project
Xplore – Give Youth a Chance
Youth Counselling Services Association

(1) People who attended

(2) People who sent written responses

Invitees to Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Consultation Event: Glasgow 2 November 2000

| | |
|-------------------|---|
| Kevin Franz | Action of Churches Together in Scotland |
| Delegate | Association of Careers Service Companies in Scotland |
| Sheem Gill | Association of Indian Organisations |
| Delegate | Association of Scottish Colleges |
| Adrian Piper | Bank of England |
| | Black & Minority Infrastructure in Scotland |
| Saiqa Naseem | Black Community Development Project |
| Tina Yu | Breakthrough for Women |
| Pek Yeong Berry | Central Scotland Chinese Association |
| Nina Giles (1) | Central Scotland Racial Equality Council |
| Shagufta Ali | Central Scotland Racial Equality Council |
| Verene Nicholas | Centre for Human Ecology |
| Alistair Christie | Chief Executive |
| Lynn Hendry | Chief Executive, Young Enterprise Scotland |
| Sondra Chew | Chinese Community Development Project |
| Gar Ming Hui | Chinese Youth Development Team |
| Ellen Kelly | City of Edinburgh Council |
| Simon Watkins | Clerk to Enterprise Committee of the Scottish Parliament |
| Lee Bridges | Clerk to Equal Opportunities Committee of the Scottish Parliament |
| I McClure (1)(2) | Commission for Racial Equality |
| Gordon Fenton | Committee of Scottish Clearing Bankers |
| Robin MacAlpine | Committee of Scottish Higher Education Principals |
| C McConnell | Community Learning Scotland |
| Jon Harris | CoSLA |
| M Akram | Council of British Pakistanis (Scotland) |
| Shenaz Bahadur | Craigmillar Partnership |
| Bill Stitt | Deputy Director Chambers of Commerce |
| E ullah Khan | Development Officer |
| Bob Benson | Disability Scotland |
| Kofi Tordzro (1) | East Renfrewshire Council |
| Nel Whiting | Edinburgh & Lothians Racial Equality Council |
| Delegate | Edinburgh Chamber of Commerce |
| Amjid Akram (1) | Edinburgh Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre |
| Naren Sood (1) | Edinburgh Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre |
| M Joshi | Edinburgh Hindi Mandir & Cultural Centre |
| Delegate | Educational Institute of Scotland |
| Peter Lau | Educational Psychologist |
| Norman Dunning | Enable |
| Morag Alexander | Equal Opportunities Commission |
| Tim Hopkins | Equality Network |

Saran Craig
Christine Tsang
Linda Chau
Prakash Khanna
Shamin Akhtar
Anne Meikle (1)
John Downie (1)
Siew Khim Robb
Euphene Shek
Lifang Lamb
Delegate
Kay Hampton (1)
Kate Sandford (1)
Steve Inch
Diana Wolfson
Mr Sandhu (1)
Barney Crocket
Delegate
Bob Shanks
A Nicolson (1)
Delegate
Delegate
Janet Lowe
Delegate
Delegate
Delegate
S Wong (1)
Fernando Diniz
Fariha Thomas
Dean of Business Faculty
Alan Brown
Delegate
Keith Cowan
M Aslam
Jacinta Barker (1)
Delegate
Joe Ghaly
David Bottomley
Thomas Lange (1)
Delegate
Delegate

Ethnic Minorities Law Centre
Ethnic Minority Development Worker
Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre
Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre
Ethnic Minority New Deal Development Officer
Fairplay
Federation of Small Businesses
Fife Chinese Women's Association
Fife Economic Development
Fife Racial Equality Council
Frae Fife Social Inclusion Partnership
Glasgow Caledonian University
Glasgow Chamber of Commerce
Glasgow City Council
Glasgow Jewish Representative Council
Glasgow South Wholesales Association
Grampian Racial Equality Council
Grocers Association
Highlands and Islands Enterprise
Institute of Careers Guidance
Institute of Chartered Accountants
Investors in People
Lauder College
Law Society of Scotland
Local Authority Business Advisory Units
Local Chambers
Meridian
Minority Ethnic Learning Disability Initiative
Muslim Network/Taleem Trust
Napier University
New Deal
New Futures Fund
Outright Scotland
Pakistan Association
Pilton Black Community Development Project
Princes Youth Business Trust
Proprietor – Shismahal Restaurant
Quality Assurance Agency
Robert Gordon University
Scottish Higher Education Funding Council
Scottish Business in the Community

Lex Gold
Mike Davies
F Chaudhry
G Honeyman (2)
Ron Taylor (1)
Paul Vaughan
Donald McPhee
Lena Wilson
John Phillipps
Dave Coulter
Heather Koronka
Kay Hampton
Mridu Thanki
Judith Evans (1)
Delegate
Delegate
Delegate
Isobel Smyth
Peter Hunter
Sally Daghlian
Patrick Browne
Delegate
Linda Graham
Frank Pignatelli
Debbie Adams
Margaret Chetty
Fergus Timmons
R Foyer (1)
John White
Fiona Baikie (1)
Doug Bradley
Jim Devine
C Turkarlan (1)
David Deakins (1)
Jackie Brierton
Bushra Iqbal
Karen Tinney
Lynn Hendry (1)
Bernard Kamy
Professor Deacon

Scottish Chambers of Commerce
Scottish Council for Development and Industry
Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations
Scottish Enterprise
Scottish Enterprise
Scottish Enterprise Fife, Social Inclusion
Scottish Enterprise Glasgow, Social Inclusion
Scottish Enterprise, Senior Manager, Customer Relations
Scottish Enterprise, Senior Manager, Human Resources
Scottish Enterprise, Skills
Scottish ESF Objective 3 Partnership
Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit
Scottish Ethnic Minorities Unit
Scottish Funding Council for Further & Higher Education
Scottish Further & Higher Education Association
Scottish Further Education Unit
Scottish Gypsy Travellers Association
Scottish Interfaith Council
Scottish Low Pay Unit
Scottish Refugee Council
Scottish Retail Consortium
Scottish Tourist Boards
Scottish Traveller Consortium
Scottish University for Industry
Scottish Youth Parliament
Senior Community Relations Officer
SKILLNET
STUC
Tayside Racial Equality Council
Telford College
Tomorrow's Company in Scotland
UNISON
University of Paisley
University of Paisley
Wellpark Women's Enterprise Centre
West of Scotland Racial Equality Council
Xplore – Give Youth a Chance
Youth Counselling Services Association

(1) People who attended

(2) People who sent written responses

Appendix G: Census Ethnic Classification

15 What is your ethnic group?

▶▶ Choose ONE section from A to E, then
✓ the appropriate box to indicate your cultural background.

A White

- Scottish
- Other British
- Irish
- Any other White background
please write in

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

B Mixed

- Any mixed background
please write in

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

C Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British

- Indian
- Pakistani
- Bangladeshi
- Chinese
- Any other Asian background
please write in

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

D Black, Black Scottish or Black British

- Caribbean
- African
- Any other Black background
please write in

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

E Other Ethnic background

- Any other background
please write in

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

Appendix H: Other Sources of Information

Equality Unit
Scottish Executive
Area 3H
Victoria Quay
Leith
Edinburgh
EH6 6QQ

Central Research Unit Website
www.scotland.gov.uk/cru

Scottish Parliament Website
www.scottish.parliament.uk

Home Office Website
www.homeoffice.gov.uk

**Race Relations (Amendment) Act
2000 proposals for implementation.
(Consultation document) available
online at:**
[www.homeoffice.gov.uk/raceact/
welcome.htm](http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/raceact/welcome.htm)

**Commission for Racial Equality
Website**
www.cre.gov.uk

A summary of this report and action plans is being prepared and will be available in translation and alternative formats from the Equality Unit.

For further copies please contact

Scottish Executive
Equality Unit
Area 3H, Victoria Quay
Edinburgh EH6 6QA

Telephone 0131 244 0123

