

**Independent scrutiny of NHS Boards proposals for major changes in local NHS services**

Please write your response here (please continue on a separate sheet of paper, if necessary.)

**Question 1:** Do you agree that an expert panel is the most effective way to provide independent scrutiny? If not, what would be your preferred choice?

NO - MUST INCLUDE A DEGREE OF LAY PERSONS IN ANY PANEL - A MIXTURE OF EXPERT CLINICAL & NON CLINICAL TOGETHER WITH A SELECTION OF LAY MEMBERS FROM THE LOCAL COMMUNITY, LOCAL AUTHORITY, LOCAL MEDICAL PRACTITIONER, AMBULANCE & PARAMEDIC STAFF ETC.

OPTION 2: A SCRUTINY BODY

**Question 2:** Do you agree that the role of the panel should be to assess the safety, sustainability, evidence-base and value for money of NHS Boards proposals for major changes to local NHS services?

YES

Question 3:

Do you agree that the chair should be a lay person appointed by Scottish Ministers?

YES .

Question 4:

Do you agree that the panel should have a lay majority among its members?

YES. - THERE WAS A MIXED REACTION TO THIS QUESTION BUT AFTER DISCUSSION THE CONSENSUS WAS IN FAVOUR OF ABOVE ANSWER .

Question 5: Do you agree that the panel should assess the evidence and options during the process of public engagement prior to consultation, and provide a commentary on these that would be available to the Board and to Ministers in reaching decisions?

YES - BUT THE COMMENTS OF THE PANEL SHOULD BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC DURING THE CONSULTATION PERIOD.

Question 6. Do you have any other comments on how independent scrutiny should be carried out, or on the guidance on "Informing, engaging and consulting the public in developing health and community care services" at Annex 3?

PUBLIC MUST BE MADE AWARE OF ALL PROPOSALS REGARDING HEALTH & COMMUNITY CARE SERVICES.

THE IMPORTANT POINT IS TO GIVE THE PUBLIC THE CONFIDENCE THAT THEIR OPINIONS MATTER AND ARE SERIOUSLY CONSIDERED WITH SUFFICIENT TIME FOR CONSIDERATION & CONSULTATION AND THAT THE BOARD'S PROPOSALS ARE NOT SET IN STONE, AND CAN BE CHANGED IF VIABLE ALTERNATIVES ARE PRESENTED, NOT NECESSARILY THE STANDARD ONES OF COST AND INSUFFICIENT TRAINED STAFF.

Question 7

Do you have any other comments on either the consultation process or your preferred choice?

AS COMMENTED IN QUESTION 6.  
THE PUBLIC & CIVIL MEMBERS ON  
THE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE, MUST BE  
IN AT THE VERY ~~EARLY~~ BEGINNING OF  
THE DEVELOPMENT OF A PROPOSAL, AND  
NOT - AS CURRENTLY HAPPENS IN  
MOST LOCAL AUTHORITY AND GOVERNMENT  
PROCESSES AND PLANNING IN OUR  
COMMUNITIES - COME TO THE CONSULTATION  
PROCESS WHERE ALMOST EVERYTHING  
APPEARS TO BE DONE AND DECIDED, AND  
VERY LITTLE NOTICE IS TAKEN OF  
THE CONSULTEE'S

Thank you for taking the time to participate in this consultation. We will acknowledge receipt of your response.