

Independent scrutiny of NHS Boards proposals for major changes in local NHS services

Please write your response here (please continue on a separate sheet of paper, if necessary.)

Question 1: Do you agree that an expert panel is the most effective way to provide independent scrutiny? If not, what would be your preferred choice?

YES - BUT WHAT ABOUT THE BIAS OF THOSE WHO
DECIDE WHICH EXPERTS ARE CHOSEN?
TODAY'S 'EXPERT' CAN BE TOMORROW'S
FALSE PROPHET.

Question 2: Do you agree that the role of the panel should be to assess the safety, sustainability, evidence-base and value for money of NHS Boards proposals for major changes to local NHS services?

YES - BUT ALSO CONSIDER THE MUNDANE e.g.
PROXIMITY OF OUT-PATIENT CLINICS & TRAVEL
ARRANGEMENTS FOR THOSE WHO REQUIRE
REGULAR CLINIC VISITS / LONG TERM HOSPITAL
VISITING. TRAVEL CAN BE A NIGHTMARE
FOR THOSE WITHOUT CAR ACCESS.

Question 3: Do you agree that the chair should be a lay person appointed by Scottish Ministers?

~~More necessary to have a lay person~~

THIS IS THE LOGICAL WAY TO APPOINT, BUT
WOULD IT BE A PERSONAL APPOINTMENT?
POLITICAL BIAS & A HIDDEN AGENDA
WOULD CONCERN ME.

Question 4: Do you agree that the panel should have a lay majority among its members?

NOT NECESSARILY. TOO EASILY HIJACKED BY
GROUPS/INDIVIDUALS LOOKING FOR POWER.
WHO WILL PUT THESE PEOPLE FORWARD
FOR CONSIDERATION?

THOSE WITH AN AGENDA WILL SHOUT
LOUDEST WHILST THE SILENT MAJORITY,
WHO TEND TO BE CONTENT WITH THE
PROPOSALS, WILL BE IGNORED.

Question 5: Do you agree that the panel should assess the evidence and options during the process of public engagement prior to consultation, and provide a commentary on these that would be available to the Board and to Ministers in reaching decisions?

WOULD THIS BE A COMMENTARY ON
PUBLIC REACTIONS OR ON THEIR OWN
REACTIONS TO PUBLIC REACTIONS?
OR - - - WHAT?

Question 6. Do you have any other comments on how independent scrutiny should be carried out, or on the guidance on "Informing, engaging and consulting the public in developing health and community care services" at Annex 3?

I EXPECT YOU WILL HONESTLY TRY TO
COVER ALL THE ANGLES AS DID THE
BOARD BEFORE YOU, BUT SOMEONE
STILL HAS TO MAKE THE FINAL DECISION.

Question 7

Do you have any other comments on either the consultation process or your preferred choice?

I BELIEVE THAT IN AN IDEAL WORLD, INDEPENDENT SCRUTINY IS THE PERFECT SOLUTION, BUT I HAVE GRAVE DOUBTS ABOUT YOUR ABILITY TO FIND TRUE INDEPENDENCE. APPEASEMENT AND THE POSSIBILITY OF FUTURE FAVOURS ARE HARD TO IGNORE.

AYRSHIRE - ARRAN HAVE ALREADY COME UP WITH A REASONABLE SOLUTION - PERHAPS A TWEAK HERE AND THERE - THAT SEEMS TO SPREAD SCARCE RESOURCES THROUGHOUT THEIR AREA.

I SUPPOSE WHAT I AM REALLY SAYING IS THAT NO MATTER HOW IT IS DRESSED UP, OR HOW ABLE THE PANEL, YOU WILL BE NO NEARER THE MARK THAN THOSE WHO HAVE AGONISED OVER IT FOR MONTHS. I ALSO EXPECT YOU KNOW THIS.

" THE BLAME IS NOT MINE, M'LUD, IT WAS THE INDEPENDENT SCRUTINY PANEL - - - "

OH, THE JOYS OF POLITICS!

Thank you for taking the time to participate in this consultation. We will acknowledge receipt of your response.