

SCOTTISH AWARDS FOR
QUALITY IN PLANNING 2006

city

town

village

rural



Urban Design Award for Planning Students

designing

places
award

Report of the Judges



SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE

SCOTTISH AWARDS FOR
QUALITY IN PLANNING 2006

Urban Design Award for Planning Students

designing places
award
Report of the Judges

The Judges

The 2006 Judges were:

- **Karen Cadell**
Cadell2 Architects and Urban Designers
- **Sebastian Tombs**
Chief Executive, Architecture and Design Scotland
- **Scottish Executive**

Introduction to the Designing Places Award

In November 2001, the Scottish Executive issued the policy statement Designing Places which sets out the Executive's aspirations for design. A key strand of the policy is education and training and in 2002 an Urban Design Award for planning students, entitled the Designing Places Award, was introduced.

The Award is for urban design work that has been carried out as part of the curriculum on planning courses, whether a project, dissertation, essay or report. Entrants are required to submit their work and complete an application form. The Award is open to all under-graduate and post-graduate students and all Scottish Planning Schools were invited to enter.

In 2006, the fifth year of the Award, seven entries were received. Nominations were made from Heriot-Watt University, the University of Aberdeen and the University of Dundee.

Winning Entries

Award

Edinburgh Fruitmarket and Swan's Building Site Design Brief

Nominee: Heriot-Watt University

Entrants: Jet Cameron, Ruth Laverty, Sarah Raven, Akanimoh Mark, Eileen McCormack, Georgina Cook, Marion Frederickson

Type: Project

Description of project

The aim of this project was to produce a design brief which was to be used as supplementary planning guidance for developers, designers and planners. The brief provides a critical analysis of the existing site context and then sets out a clear vision that incorporates design qualities to create a successful and sustainable place.

Judges' comments

We all agreed that this particular piece of work contained an extensive and comprehensive range of information. Also, despite the complexity and level of detail required for the analysis, every effort had been made to present the work as a coherent set of ideas. It clearly played to the strengths and knowledge of the team and illustrated a very positive group effort. We considered this to be an excellent piece of work worthy of an Award.

Special Commendation

Creating Neighbourly and Integrated Communities in Mass Market Housing

Nominee: Heriot-Watt University

Entrant: Alison Wood

Type: Dissertation

Description of project

The aim of this dissertation was to establish if, and how, the physical design of a housing development can actively create communities that are vibrant, neighbourly and well integrated with the surrounding area. The study emphasised the importance of creating places that have a distinct identity, good connections and attractive well designed routes.

Judges' comments

We considered this to be a very solid and relevant piece of work. We were impressed by the extent of analysis undertaken and thorough understanding of the subject. Overall, it was competent in approach and very well written. We believe that this entry was worthy of a Special Commendation.

Other Entries

Although the Judges considered that the other entries did not merit an award, many of them were good examples of positive work. The Judges wish all the students every success in the future.

The Fruitmarket, Edinburgh, Design Brief

Nominee: Heriot-Watt University

Entrants: Julie Boyle, Lynn Brotherston, Stuart Green, Pat Hanna

Type: Report

Smeaton Urban Design Strategy

Nominee: Heriot-Watt University

Entrants: Dilys Livingston, Jane Little, Fraser Miller

Type: Project

Gallatown and Sinclairtown Development Brief

Nominee: Heriot-Watt University

Entrants: Euan Leitch, Catherine O'Farrell, Barbara Stuart,
Cameron Twigley, Alison Wood

Type: Project

Principles of Design and Development Project, Broad Street, Aberdeen

Nominee: University of Aberdeen

Entrants: Timothy Jiong Xu and Malachy Kelly

Type: Project

Vestiges of a Neo-classical Suburb: An Appraisal of Listed Buildings in the West End Lanes Conservation Area

Nominee: University of Dundee

Entrants: Lorna Fairholm

Type: Project

